inter-text

[an undergraduate journal for social sciences & humanities]

Volume 5, Spring 2024

Cover Design by Sawyer Kuzma ‘26
Typesetting by Nitzarandini Jimenez ‘23

Inter-Text: An Undergraduate Journal for Social Sciences & Humanities, Issue 5

inter-text@lakeforest.edu

Lake Forest College
555 N. Sheridan Road
Lake Forest, IL 60045

ISBN 979-8-89034-622-3

Printed by Gasch Printing, Odenton, Maryland

inter-text

[an undergraduate journal for social sciences & humanities]

Table of Contents

Letter from the Editors

Dear Reader,

Thank you for your interest in Inter-Text: An Undergraduate Journal for the Social Sciences & Humanities Volume 5. As we reflect on the past year between the release of Volume 4 and finalizing this edition, we acknowledge the political and humanitarian climate that has had a significant influence over our communities. Beyond the campus gate lies Israel, Palestine, and an ongoing conflict that has resulted in unwarranted violence that continues to worsen every day. Despite this darkness that has engulfed our media and our minds, our community has remained engaged in issues that drive us, concepts that challenge us, and causes that define us. A collective of voices is far better than one, and we acknowledge the strength and versatility our fellow students have exhibited through this journal and beyond.

As we return with our journal's fifth annual publication, we want to acknowledge the hard work and diversity of the nearly 60 submissions for this volume. After an extremely competitive peer review process, we selected eleven papers, along with our editor feature articles. Our team rigorously worked through all submissions and judged them on four main criteria: clarity of argument, use of evidence, language and grammar, and structure . From collecting submissions and assigning peer reviews, to re-reviewing requested changes, our team's hard work along with creative, detail-oriented minds crafting our cover and interior format have resulted in the final product that you hold today.

An extended thanks must be said to the authors who have worked with our editor team to make this journal possible. It is no easy feat to submit a paper of high academic quality, make changes (both minor and extensive) as requested by the editors, and work tirelessly to make a product that our community can be proud of. There have been long nights on a computer hashing out your essay's continuity. All of this is to say: thank you. As we've seen this journal blossom into the esteemed publication that it is today, we want to highlight the significance of everyone's contributions to the humanities and social sciences. As our academic institution is a liberal arts college, there is no better place to foster your own thoughts; placing them forth to start meaningful conversations. We invite you to read our journal and explore what each author brings to the table of discourse, and how their ideas resonate within you.

We thank you again for your support, and hope you enjoy the selection of scholarly work that we've compiled for you in Volume 5.

Sincerely,

The Editors

[Research Articles]

[Nationalisms in Question]

Blue Justice

The Case of the Sámi In Scandinavia

[Andrés Fuentes Teba]

Introduction

The Sámi are the only recognized indigenous tribe in the European Union.[1] Nonetheless, this recognition has come through a long-lasting fight between the Sámi and the Scandinavian nations, which have historically perpetrated environmental injustices against the indigenous populace. This essay delves into the injustices regarding the recognition of Sámi waters in both Norway and Sweden, using the framework of "blue justice" to analyze the historical rights and laws surrounding water justice. Therefore, this essay's main focus is to question to what extent is "blue justice" achieved in Sámi coastal areas in Norway and Sweden, in order to understand why both Scandinavian governments prioritize some fishing groups over the Sámi. Blue justice is defined as the right to equal access to sea resources, especially regarding smaller-scale fisheries, in this context Sámi-owned fisheries.

This essay will defend the thesis that throughout history and in the present, the pursuit of blue justice in Sámi waters remains elusive, hindered by the relentless impact of past colonization, exploitation of resources, inadequate representation, sparse engagement of the Sámi people, and insufficient yet prevailing legal structures, with specific regard to the poor management of inshore fisheries and integrated Coastal Zone Planning (CZP). In the context of the Sami people, CZP refers to planning efforts that consider the traditional lands and livelihoods of the Sámi in coastal areas of Northern Scandinavia.

To do this, the research first delves into the definition of the concept of blue

1 Luke Laframboise "The Sámi Limbo: Outlining nearly thirty years of EU-Sápmi relations," The Arctic Institute. September 12,2023. https://www.thearcticinstitute.org/sami-limbo-outlining-nearly-thirty-years-eu-sapmi-relations/ (accessed on 11 March 2024)

justice. The study then examines the key traditions of the Sámi, such as their nomadic lifestyles, reindeer herding, and cultural practices, to underscore the importance of preserving their unique way of life. It also analyzes the assimilation processes that the Sámi have endured throughout history, shedding light on the forces that have shaped their identity and the ongoing efforts to revitalize their culture. Then, the essay turns to examining the legal and policy frameworks governing fishing rights in Sámi waters, encompassing both historical structures and current regulations, in order to provide a dialectic history of the evolving recognition of Sámi rights. It will constantly highlight the inability of both Norwegian and Swedish governments to encompass Sámi's water rights, especially focusing on how they are not able to create a proper CZP. Furthermore, the case study of the Alta Controversy as one of the largest environmental injustices perpetrated against the Sámi is used to illustrate a pivotal moment in history and depicts the systemic denigration of Sámi fishing rights. Finally, the discussion and conclusion of the paper will integrate these various elements, answering the research question, addressing the thesis, and emphasizing the broader implications for environmental justice principles and the rights of indigenous communities.

What is blue justice?

Blue justice can be defined as a just and inclusive blue economy where recognitional, procedural and distributional justice concerns are at the forefront of the blue economy.[2] The blue economy, also known as the ocean economy, is an umbrella term commonly used to describe the sustainable economic activity of the ocean.[3] The concept of blue justice stems directly from the environmental justice principles, emphasizing the need for distributional justice in cases where communities are dependent on their natural environment for their survival, such as the Sámi. Article 18 of the *Climate Justice Bali Principles of 2002*, states that:

> Climate Justice affirms the rights of communities dependent on natural resources for their livelihood and cultures to own and manage the same in a sustainable manner and is opposed to the commodification of nature and its resources.[4]

Not only recognized by the Environmental Justice Principles of 1991 as well but the concept of the blue economy and blue justice is enshrined through the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals, specifically related to Number 14: Life Be-

2 Sigrid Engen et. al, "Blue justice: A survey for eliciting perceptions of environmental justice among coastal planners' and small-scale fishers in Northern-Norway," *PloS One*, 16(5), (2021): 1-13; Bennett, Nathan James and Jessica Blythe, Carole Sandrine White, Cecilia Campero, "Blue growth and blue justice: Ten risks and solutions for the ocean economy." *Marine Policy* 125(104387): 1-27.

3 Engen et al., 2

4 Christopher W. Wells, *Environmental Justice in Postwar America* (Seattle: University of Washington Press: 2018).

low Water; Number 13: Climate Change; and number 8: Decent Work and Economic Growth.[5] But then, the question remains, why has the framework of blue justice not been effective for the Sámi, even with the status as the only recognized indigenous tribe in Europe?

The Sámi: Historical Assimilation

The Sami are an indigenous population who live in northern Scandinavia. Their population is estimated to be somewhere between 80,000 and 95,000 individuals distributed in the respective countries as follows: Finland: 8,000, Norway: 50,000–65,000, Sweden 20,000, and Russia 2,000.[6] Due to the distribution of Sámi, this essay finds it pertinent to look closely at Norway and Sweden's water management laws, while acknowledging the Finnish and Russian Sámi populations but not specifically diving into their politics.

Historically a nomadic tribe, reindeer herding, and fishing have been their most important economic activities, which required them to seek new grazing lands due to seasonal change and be constantly in motion for fishing areas. Today, less than 10% of individuals with Sami heredity are actively pursuing these traditional practices.[7] Due to the close connection between the ocean and the Sámi, it is also part of the Sámi identity, and represents a material foundation for the Sámi culture, highlighting how important is to achieve blue justice in the case of the Sámi.[8] Comprehending the historical context and salient features of the Sámi people is imperative in order to appreciate how important is to achieve the blue justice framework in modern Scandinavian society.

Throughout their history, the Sámi people have weathered a series of assimilatory forces that have left an indelible mark on their cultural heritage and way of existence. These took many shapes and forms, but some of the most prevalent are an aggressive detour from their traditional language, and the use of educational and public systems to erase their identity.[9]

In Norway, the process was called *fornorsking*, or literally translated as "Norwegianization", and rested on the basis of the social Darwinist idea of the superiority of the Norwegian race over the Sámi.[10] This process of Norwegianization has been

5 Department of Economic and Social Affairs Sustainable Development, "The 17 Goals," United Nations. https://sdgs.un.org/goals (accessed on 11 March 2024).

6 J.B. Henriksen, "The continuous process of recognition and implementation of the Sami people's right to self-determination," *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, 21(1) 2008: 27-40.

7 Soile Hämäläinen and Frauke Musial, Anita Salamonsen, Ola Graff, Torjer A. Olsen, "Sami yoik, Sami history, Sami health: a narrative review," *International Journal of Circumpolar Health*, 77(1) (2018): 1-8. https://doi.org/10.1080/22423982.2018.1454784

8 Henriksen, 28.

9 Hämäläinen et al., 2.

10 Henry Minde, "Assimilation of the Sami-implementation and consequences," *Journal of Indigenous Peoples' Rights* 3(1) (2005): 1-33; Hämäläinen et al. 2008, 2.

prevalent since the 19th century, and for Minde it ended in 1981.[11] Minde identifies two main events as the start and the end of the *fornorsking* process. The first event was the establishment of the *Finnefondet* (the Lapp fund) in 1851, calling for a change of language and culture. The *Finnefondet* was a state-controlled trust fund in Norway intended to provide economic support to the Sami people and compensate for the loss of traditional lands. The second event was the Alta Controversy (1979-81), which will be further discussed in the essay as a historical landmark to understand how blue justice has failed in this context.[12] Due to these national boundaries, the Sámi were spatially separated.

On the bright side, there have been efforts to rejuvenate the culture after the aforementioned Alta Controversy. Currently, the revitalization of the Sami culture has grown strong, and the Sami traditions have been reinvigorated by increasing awareness to preserve the Sami culture as a unique and valued part of Norwegian society. It has even sparked conversations for establishing some form of reparations for the *fornorsking*.[13] The acknowledgment of the impact of assimilation on the Sámi people underscores the imperative of safeguarding and rejuvenating their distinct cultural legacy for posterity.

Legal and policy frameworks in Sami waters

Despite the latest efforts for the rejuvenation of Sámi culture, it is important to not forget that they have historically suffered from injustices in the realm of blue justice. In the Norwegian context, rights to marine resources are very much tied to the idea of equal access to the sea, a common owned by all Norwegian citizens, but it allows for little regional and local management, and it has not been open to the idea of managing fisheries concerning ethnic categories.[14] In the Swedish context, the literature also highlights the historical reluctance of the government to properly manage fishing rights to meet the needs of the Sámi.[15] Lantto and Mörkenstam mention that an obvious instance of this reluctance is the unwillingness of the Swedish government to ratify the ILO (International Labour Organization) Convention No. 169, also known as the *Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention of 1989*, which Norway only signed in June 1990 but both Sweden and Finland are yet to ratify.[16] Korsmo mentions that the Swedish agenda for the Sámi can be only defined as a political ambiguity, acknowledging the recognition of the Sámi but avoiding the political and legal consequences

11 Minde, 6.

12 Minde, 6.

13 Hämäläinen et al., 2.

14 C. Brattland, "Mapping rights in coastal Sami seascapes," *Arctic Review on Law and Politics* 1(1) (2010): 28-53.

15 P. Lantto and U. Mörkenstam, "Sami rights and Sami challenges: The modernization process and the Swedish Sami movement, 1886–2006," *Scandinavian Journal of History* 33(1) (2008): 26-51; F. L. Korsmo, "Swedish policy and Saami rights." *Northern Review* 11(1) (1993): 32-55.

16 Lantto and Mörkenstam, 28.

of the historical injustices.[17]

Over the last three or four decades there has been a change in the Norwegian fishing regulations to include extended coastal fishing rights for the Sámi, but they have often found the Sámi on the losing side of the regulations. One of the areas that highlights these changes best is the area of Finnmark, which today comprises an area north of Norway, sharing borders with both Russia and Finland.

Historically, and due to the abundance of resources found in the area, it attracted Norwegians from other areas as well as Finnish immigrants. This created a cleavage between the Sámi (which had already inhabited Finnmark for thousands of years) and the newcomers, which usually settled on the coast, in comparison to the Sámi which relied on in-shore, fjord fishing.[18] In 1990, the Norwegian government introduced the so-called "vessel quotas" for cod fishing. The condition for receiving a vessel quota in 1990 was that one had to have fished a certain number of cod during one of the years between 1987 through 1989. For many fjord fishermen in Finnmark, with small boats only suitable for traditional fjord fishing, such amounts were impossible to achieve, both due to the nature of their equipment and because the larger vessels had virtually left nothing to fish. Thus, displacing many of these local fishermen, mostly Sámi.[19] This is only one example of the historical injustices against the fishing rights of the Sámi.

In the Swedish context, similar examples can be seen regarding poor management of fishing rights. The only law that has historically managed the status and resource provision of the Sámi is the *Sámi Reindeer Herding Act*, first stated in 1886 and currently under the latest 1971 provision.[20] The *Sámi Reindeer Herding Act* is legislation that recognizes and regulates reindeer herding rights and management for the Sami people in Sweden. This act also accounts for local fishermen and their right to use the blue economy. As previously mentioned, the Swedish government is falling into political ambiguity in the creation of such mechanisms. Since 1886, the Sámi have been divided into villages and compensation zones following the first reindeer herding law, creating a sort of "village membership" and allocating each individual to a zone, damaging greatly their migratory patterns on reindeer herding and fishing.[21] Since then, the Swedish government has constantly aimed to reduce the number of herders-to-herd, effectively decreasing reindeer herding and in turn, damaging local fishermen who usually performed both activities together.[22] The 1971 amendment was aimed at closing these boundaries, but it further created more cleavages. The 1971 provision states that the Sámi have "immemorial rights to the use of water and land resources," but still disallows most of the Sámi to hold village membership, therefore

17 Korsmo, 33.

18 S. U. Søreng, "Legal pluralism in Norwegian inshore fisheries: differing perceptions of fishing rights in Sami Finnmark," *Maritime Studies* 12(1)(2013): 1-21.

19 S. Pedersen, "The Coastal Sámi of Norway and their rights to traditional marine livelihood," *Arctic Review on Law and Politics* 3(1): 51-80.

20 Korsmo, 34.

21 Korsmo, 34.

22 Lantto and Mörkenstam, 39.

effectively stripping their rights for these resources.[23]

One of the most discussed problems related to both Norwegian and Swedish policy is in relation to the poor use of integrated Coastal Zone Planning (CZP) in the development of spaces for local Sámi fishermen. Two things are worth mentioning here. Firstly, integrated CZP refers to a holistic methodology that endeavors to harmonize and synchronize the myriad interests and endeavors within a coastal region, encompassing ecological preservation, economic progress, infrastructural development, and societal considerations, guaranteeing the enduring and cohesive administration of coastal resources, fostering coastal resilience.[24] Secondly, most of the Sámi operations happen in-shore, on the fjord landscapes of the Scandinavian countries, and most of the bigger scale operations happen in coastal areas, highlighting the separation between Sámi and Norwegian communities previously mentioned. Coastal fisheries are generally more specialized than fjord fisheries, the latter usually taking place alongside farming and other employment.[25] This decreases the stock of fish entering the fjords, further damaging their capture. This was aimed to be resolved by multiple commissions, especially focusing on the region of Finnmark, but the latest iteration, the *Finnmark Coastal Fishing Commission of 2006*, has not been effective in tackling the injustices suffered by Sámi fjord fishing, especially because they make excessive differences between fjord and open-sea farms over fishing regulations and quotas.[26] The Finnmark Coastal Fishing Commission of 2006 was a Norwegian commission established to clarify coastal fishing rights and management for both ethnic Norwegian and Sami groups in the Finnmark region of northern Norway.[27]

I argue that integrated CZP in Norway and Sweden fails for two main reasons. To begin, a notable deficiency can be observed in the consideration and incorporation of the distinct requirements and entitlements of local Sámi fishermen within the planning procedures. Consequently, their traditional fishing practices are confined and opportunities for their livelihoods are limited. This deficient execution undermines the fundamental principles of inclusivity and sustainability that the comprehensive CZP endeavors to achieve. Secondly, the concentration on coastal regions in CZP overlooks the significance of fjord landscapes, which serve as the primary setting for most Sámi operations. The segregation between Sámi and Norwegian communities persists, with coastal fisheries often being specialized and detrimental to the fish population entering the fjords. This, in turn, further intensifies the challenges confronted by Sámi fishermen. As I previously mentioned, the Alta Controversy serves as a prime example of poor management of Sámi water rights, and it is imperative to analyze it through the lens of blue justice and integrated CZP.

23 Korsmo, 34.
24 Engen et al, 2.
25 Soreng et al., 5.
26 Brattland, 37.
27 Brattland, 37.

Case study: the Alta Controversy (1979-1981)

The Alta Controversy is a historical landmark to understand the injustices suffered by the Sámi on their water rights. Also known as the Alta-Kautokeino dispute, it revolved around the building of a hydroelectric dam in the Alta River, which would require damming the Alta River valley, a traditional reindeer herding route and also one of the most known salmon fishing spots for the Sámi.[28] The Norwegian Energy Administration (NVE), a government agency, began drawing up plans for the dam as early as the 1960s and the Norwegian Parliament confirmed the final decision to dam the river in 1981.[29] This enraged the local Sámi population, which took matters into its own hands. Local accounts of the process highlight the inability of the Norwegian framework to encompass the rights of the Sámi.

One of the most eye-opening stories is recounted in *The Alta Conflict: From Civil Disobedience to Sámi Terrorism*. This short podcast explores the tale of Jorunn Eikjok, a fervent Sámi activist. Eikjok was 17 years old when she traveled to Oslo to participate in a hunger strike against the Alta construction project and the increasingly precarious situation of the Sámi people. Outside the Norwegian Parliament, she and the others in the group set up their Sámi tent in protest against what they perceived as the Norwegian government's colonial approach to handling the Sámi in the Alta issue.[30]

Jorunn's cousin, Niillas Somby, also participated in a hunger strike in Oslo, but when the dam was eventually built, he expressed his discontent by detonating bombs near a bridge leading to the dam construction site. Accidentally, Niillas lost an arm and an eye in the explosion. Subsequently, Niillas was imprisoned and set to face over 20 years in prison. This story, among many others, shows the local discontent with the creation of the Alta Dam and its subsequent consequences on the fishing areas of the Sámi.[31]

The failure of the Norwegian government to achieve blue justice and integrated CZP in this case is clear. The decision to construct a dam on the Alta River, without considering its significance as a traditional reindeer herding path and vital salmon fishing spot for the Sámi people, showcases a disregard for the rights and livelihoods of the indigenous population. The local unrest, which resulted in acts of civil disobedience and even terrorism, serves as a poignant reflection of the deep-rooted frustration and dissatisfaction with the Norwegian government's handling of the Sámi people in the Alta dispute. This case stands as a compelling reminder of the ongoing quest for blue justice and the imperative of adopting an inclusive and sustainable approach that honors the rights and heritage of indigenous communities.

---

28 P.I. Smith, "Challenges to Sámi Indigenous sovereignty in an era of climate change," (Ph.D. thesis University of Kansas 2017).

29 Smith, 56.

30 Sveriges Radio. 2012. P3 Dokumentär. *Sveriges Radio*. 15 July. https://sverigesradio.se/avsnitt/44486?programid=2519. (accessed 4 December 2023)

31 Sveriges Radio.

Discussion and Conclusion

In conclusion, the essay has shown that throughout history and in the present, the pursuit of blue justice in Sámi waters remains elusive due to insufficient yet prevailing legal structures, with specific regard to the poor management of inshore fisheries and integrated Coastal Zone Planning (CZP). The essay has shown that these injustices are perpetrated by the Norwegian and Swedish governments due to the profitability that larger-scale, open-sea fishing brings to the economy in comparison to the traditional Sámi methods. The exploration of "blue justice" in Sámi coastal areas uncovers an intricate tapestry of historical obstacles and contemporary threats that hinder its achievement. The concept emerges as a vital framework for comprehending the social and environmental fairness required for sustainable water resource management.

In Sámi territories, both historical struggles and current conditions serve as reminders of the enduring fight for societal and ecological equity, underscoring the significance of acknowledging indigenous knowledge in governance. Local stories emphasize the impact on individuals and communities, and the need for a better integrated coastal zone planning system that encompasses the Sámi. As we investigate the presence of "blue justice" in Sámi coastal areas, it becomes clear that the gaps in legal systems, historical struggles, and ongoing controversies require comprehensive decision-making processes and policy improvements. In conclusion, this research not only enhances our understanding of the specific challenges faced by the Sámi but also emphasizes the broader importance of incorporating indigenous perspectives in the pursuit of environmental justice for future generations in other cases.

Israeli Displacement Policies

[Muhammad Sheikh]

The neighborhood of Sheikh Jarrah in the Palestinian Territories is at the forefront of the enduring conflict between Palestinians and Israelis. Since Israel's independence in 1948, the two sides have been locked in a ceaseless dispute marked by ethnic and religious tensions with no end in sight. In recent years, Israel began intensifying the demolition of homes in the Palestinian territories in its attempt to "Judaize" the region and integrate Israeli settlers. The Israeli government's attempts to evict the residents of Sheikh Jarrah in 2021 escalated toward a nearly full-scale war between the Israelis and Palestinians, leading to the deaths of over 260 Palestinians – 60 of whom were children – and the widespread displacement of numerous families in the Palestinian West Bank. The justification provided by the Israeli government for the mass demolitions in Sheikh Jarrah – citing illegal settlements and safety concerns – has drawn international condemnation and the ongoing displacement of Palestinians.

However, the violence in Sheikh Jarrah extends far beyond local disputes, fueling ethnic violence between Palestinians and Jews in surrounding neighborhoods. As this issue persists as we speak, I question: Why does Israel persist with its displacement policies toward families in Sheikh Jarrah, despite the cycle of violence they perpetuate? Are these actions driven by religious, political, economic motives, or a desire to bolster global influence? Moreover, are the events in Sheikh Jarrah a microcosm of the conflict between the Israelis and Palestinians?

The issue is of paramount importance because of the potential aftermath. Hundreds of Palestinians were injured near Masjid Al-Aqsa – Islam's third holiest site – after they defied the Israelis claim to Sheikh Jarrah, sparking widespread communal ethnic violence between Jews and Arabs. Additionally, Hamas – a political party recognized as a terrorist organization by several countries – retaliated by launching thousands of rockets toward Israeli cities, viewing these acts as resistance against oppression and colonization. Hundreds of civilians, including children, were killed in

just two weeks after the protests in Sheikh Jarrah occurred. The cycle of violence ensuing from this rather small neighborhood reflects the violent state of affairs between the Israelis and Palestinians.

This paper seeks to unravel and dissect the multidimensional motivations driving Israel's displacement policies in Sheikh Jarrah, asserting that these actions are not merely reactionary but part of a broader strategy to solidify and affirm Jewish identity in the holy lands through the systemic displacement of Palestinian families. By examining religious, political, economic, and global spheres, I seek to shed light on the multifaceted nature of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. Exploring this topic is critical for the field of urban politics because of its emphasis on gentrification: bringing higher-class Jewish settlers to replace lower-class Palestinian families under the guise of religious and legal purposes. I have a very deep connection to this topic, having volunteered with Islamic Relief (IRUSA) to help raise over $500k for Palestinians suffering after the turmoil of this conflict. I hope to use images, academic sources, and media sources to help answer my question. To this end, the paper is structured as follows: firstly, I examine the historical context of displacement in Sheikh Jarrah, followed by an analysis of the politico-religious and economic underpinnings of Israeli policies which motivates them to pursue such measures. I then subsequently scrutinize the international response and its implications before concluding with an assessment of the future prospects for peace in the region.

In this analysis, I contend that Israel's strategic endeavors in Jerusalem, particularly through policies affecting neighborhoods like Sheikh Jarrah, are aimed at creating a predominantly Jewish identity for the city, vehemently denying Palestinians the right to their land. Not only does this process leverage the dynamics of Palestinian neighborhoods to bolster Israel's geopolitical leverage in the Middle East but it also capitalizes on the fragmentation within the Palestinian governance itself. These factors ultimately allow the facilitation of displacement of Palestinian communities. Additionally, the Israeli government uses Palestinian neighborhoods including Sheikh Jarrah to maintain its sphere of influence in the Middle East. Lastly, Palestinians do not have a strong representative government to address their concerns, which is also a reason the Israeli government is easily able to displace the Palestinians from their homes and neighborhoods.

Since its inception in 1947, Israel has pursued the expansion of its territory at the expense of native Palestinians residing in the area. Sheikh Jarrah, a neighborhood currently under Palestinian territory in Jerusalem, is the heart of the religious, political, and economic tension for both groups. Near the al-Aqsa Mosque – Islam's third holiest site – and the Temple Mount – the holiest site for Jews – the area is of religious, political, and economic importance for both sides. To the north are Israeli settlements which used to be part of the Palestinian Territories. Sheikh Jarrah is being encroached on by these Israeli settlements, which leads several scholars to believe that Israeli authorities seek to control all Palestinian areas. Additionally, some areas in the Old City and Silwan to the south are now home to Israeli settlers, further supporting the theory that Israel seeks to control all areas surrounding the Temple Mount. This would be at the

expense of Palestinians, of course, but this would undoubtedly be beneficial to Israeli settlers for several reasons.

First and foremost, Jews would gain easier access to their holy sites and would not have to pay any administrative fees set by the Palestinian authorities, giving Israelis both a religious and political advantage to their taking control of Palestinian lands. Secondly, by reducing the amount of land Palestinians control, Israel's sphere of influence would undoubtedly increase throughout the world. They would push back Iran, one of Israel's sworn enemies, who is doing everything in its power to precipitate Palestinian independence. Thirdly, Israel would be able to remove any people or organizations they perceive to be terrorists, which would include Palestinian residents. In order to protest, several Palestinians near Sheikh Jarrah pelt stones at Israeli officers, creating a danger for settlers. Thus, Israeli authorities would argue that their control of these Palestinian lands is purely defensive.

Central to understanding the dynamics at play in Sheikh Jarrah are three prevailing theories. In his pivotal study, Jubeh delves into the strategic manipulation of Sheikh Jarrah by Israeli policies aimed at transforming Jerusalem's demographic makeup. He posits that Sheikh Jarrah is under Israeli occupation and is used by Palestinians as a survival strategy against Israeli encroachment. The Israeli projects in Jerusalem, known as the "Holy Basin," surround holy cities and Palestinian neighborhoods and seek to change the demographics in these areas. By doing so, Israel will have a larger presence in one of the most pivotal and historical cities on the planet. Jubeh argues that the evictions in Sheikh Jarrah are part of a larger plan to turn Jerusalem and its surrounding areas into a Jewish-Israeli city.[1] Although Israel continues to threaten evictions and the destruction of neighborhoods, over 90 percent of the population within the "Holy Basin" project are Palestinian.[2] Furthermore, the area is of strategic importance to both Palestinians and Israelis because of the vast amount of national and international institutes that reside in the area. The neighborhood houses, among other governments, British, French, and Turkish consulates. The World Health Organization (WHO), the UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA), and other prominent international organizations had offices in the region as well.[3] Considering that Sheikh Jarrah is essentially an international port, the Palestinians heavily rely on it for resources, employment, and services. Thus, it is of strategic importance for the Israeli government to remove Palestinian control from this neighborhood, undoubtedly increasing their foothold in the region. On the other hand, the Palestinians would suffer a significant loss both economically and humanitarianly.

Because of Israeli encroachment into Palestinian territories, Palestinians find themselves facing a generational displacement experience that has placed them into a zone of precarity and hypervigilance, unable to trust attempts for peace due to their

1 Nazmi Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival," *Jerusalem Quarterly File* 86 (2021): 129–148.

2 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."

3 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."

harsh history.[4] The 1993 Oslo Accords, although initially promising, was a failed attempt to bring peace to the Palestinians as they witnessed a massive increase in illegal settlements in their areas. The common Palestinian simply saw the peace process as pushing the national security interests of both Israel and the United States, feeling disillusioned and abandoned.[5] More recently, the U.S. Embassy for Israel was symbolically relocated from Tel Aviv to Jerusalem, signaling increased American support for Israel's policies.[6] The common Palestinian, therefore, does not have much hope for any agreements to be made in their favor.

This collective history of failed peace has propelled Palestinians to put matters into their home hands by actively opposing what they see as Israeli occupation. They view neighborhoods such as Sheikh Jarrah as their only homes and a symbol of resistance against oppressive forces. Naturally, then, it is a survival strategy for the Palestinians to resist Israeli oppression because they have no other home. As Brown states in her article, many Palestinians live a precarious lifestyle, not knowing whether their home will be demolished tomorrow, or if a Molotov cocktail will be thrown at them by proponents of the Israeli government.[7] Thus, scholars like Brown believe that this so-called "military operation," or the occupation, is aimed at both gaining control of Palestinian lands and intentionally placing Palestinians under a cycle of dispossession: "Palestinian life, property, and political rights are constantly violated not only by the frequent actions of the Israeli military but by a process in which their environment is unpredictably and continuously refashioned, tightening around them like a noose."[8] Through this process, Israel is able to maintain and perpetuate its status quo, with Palestinians at the bottom, and Israeli and Jewish settlers at the top.

The second theory is that Israel seeks to maintain security for its own citizens by displacing Palestinian families. However, they tend to do this by subverting government authorities and using ruthless military strategies against the will of the Palestinians. Beginning in 1967 – after the Israeli-Arab War – Israel devised a calculated strategy to dismantle Palestinian settlements and bring in Jewish settlers.[9] Under the auspices of a "government building," the Jordanian government in 1967 had finished the construction of a governmental hospital near the "Holy Basin." However, with the land under Israeli jurisdiction, Israeli forces turned this "governmental building" into a headquarters for the Israeli police. In near proximity to this headquarters is another one for the Israeli Border Police, thus ironically turning Sheikh Jarrah into a center

4 Z. Zalloua, "Palestinian Paranoia and the Colonial Situation," *symploke* 29, no. 1 (2021): 281-300.

5 M.A. Jamal, "Beyond Fateh Corruption and Mass Discontent: Hamas, the Palestinian Left and the 2006 Legislative Elections," *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 40, no. 3 (2013): 273–294.

6 Mark Landler, "Trump Recognizes Jerusalem as Israel's Capital and Orders U.S. Embassy to Move," *The New York Times*, December 6, 2017, https://www.nytimes.com/2017/12/06/world/middleeast/trump-jerusalem-israel-capital.html.

7 S. Brown, "Contested Space: Control and Resistance in Rema Hammami's East Jerusalem," *The Journal of Commonwealth Literature* 51, no. 2 (2016): 287–301.

8 Brown, "Contested Space: Control and Resistance in Rema Hammami's East Jerusalem."

9 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."

for Israeli forces. Additionally, Israeli forces rapidly took control of a buffer zone that was meant to separate the two parts of Jerusalem. Hall Amin al-Husayni – the Grand Mufti of Jerusalem – had a palace in the vicinity that was eventually converted into a synagogue.[10] A Jewish billionaire bought the palace in 1985, giving the Israeli Planning and Building Committee the jurisdiction to build housing units for Jewish settlers in the region.

Fast forward to May 7, 2021, when several Palestinians pelted rocks at Israeli police near the Al-Aqsa Mosque and Temple Mount. These rocks served not just as a danger to Israeli police, but also to Israeli authorities and the Jewish settlers residing near the areas. In response, Israeli forces stormed the Al-Aqsa Mosque, aiming to neutralize what they perceived as a direct challenge to their authority. The main stronghold of Palestinian resistance comes in the form of Hamas, a political-military organization designated by several countries in the world as a terrorist entity. Scholars such as El-Husseini believe that another organization – Hezbollah in Lebanon – is actively sponsored by Iran, with them even sending 500 troops to the region during the 2006 War.[11] In return, Hezbollah assists Iran in achieving their global interests of reducing Israel's influence in the region by assisting Hamas, whether it be aiding with suicide bombings or supplying weapons. Such a prospect is dangerous for Israel's security because they would have an active enemy a mere dozen kilometers from their capital. After Israeli forces stormed the Al-Aqsa Mosque, Hamas responded by launching hundreds of missiles toward Israeli cities. Israel responded by launching massive airstrikes in Palestinian areas, which eventually killed over 260 Palestinians. The events in May 2021 also activated hidden social tensions between Arabs and Jews, amounting to widespread ethnic violence and riots in Israeli and Palestinian neighborhoods. Astonishingly, the violence went so far as to cause several lynchings.

Ultimately, Israel believes that all of this could be prevented if they controlled all the land. Furthermore, there is a belief that Zahi Zalloua coins – "Palestinian Paranoia" – describing how proponents from far-right supporters and political Zionists categorically misunderstand the Palestinians, believing they are not to be trusted and are prone to bursting into violence. Indeed, several parts of the Israeli government believe that the Palestinians are untrustworthy, therefore making it justifiable to forcefully enter their territories and bring "peace."[12] Indeed, the Israeli media perpetuates this idea of "Palestinian Paranoia" and repeatedly frames the Palestinian people as an existential threat to the Jewish people. All of these attempts in tandem to paint the Palestinian people as untrustworthy and unwilling to consider peace, therefore, are used as justification for their mass displacement in neighborhoods like Sheikh Jarrah.

As the conflict deepens, the intersection of religious beliefs and global political aspirations becomes extremely evident in Israel's displacement strategies. Conversely, the last theory is that Palestinian displacement occurs under religious auspices

10 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."

11 R.E. Husseini, "Hezbollah and the Axis of Refusal: Hamas, Iran and Syria," *Third World Quarterly* 31, no. 5 (2010): 803–815.

12 Zalloua, "Palestinian Paranoia and the Colonial Situation."

as well, to gain full control of Palestinian lands and make the holy sites accessible for Jewish settlers. In Jewish heritage, Shimon HaTzadik was a rabbi that lived when Jerusalem was conquered by Alexander the Great in 332 BCE (Jubeh 2021). His name appears in the Talmud – the Jewish religious text – numerous times, giving his figure significant importance. A cave in Sheikh Jarrah was claimed to be his gravesite, although there is an inscription on the wall with the name of a different individual. However, Jewish religious groups continue to flock to the location to perform rituals. Israeli settlers appealed to the government to bring this religious symbol under their control under the Protection of Holy Sites Law of 1967, although this eventually failed with the court not being convinced that the site was indeed holy.[13] However, this religious auspice is also combined with Israeli legal collusion, showcasing the complexity of this conflict.

In 1956, the Jordanian Ministry of Building and Construction signed a memorandum of understanding with the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA) to build twenty-eight residential units for Palestinian refugees.[14] With the rise of the 1967 War, this part of the city fell under the control of the Israeli government, who proceeded to seize Jordanian records of this project, giving them to the Israeli Ministry of Justice. In five years, the Israeli Land Department – without notifying the Palestinian residents living in the area – registered the land under Israeli jurisdiction. These Palestinian families hired an Israeli lawyer named Yitzhak Tosia-Cohen to represent them, although he signed a settlement with the Israeli government that recognized Israel's ownership of the land.[15] This collusion by the Israeli government led to several Palestinian families eventually being forcefully evicted from their homes over thirty years later.

Numerous examples such as this exist where the Israeli government colluded with the law for their benefit. As the first United Nations Conference on Housing and Human Settlements once laid out: "The ideologies of States are reflected in their human settlement policies. These being powerful instruments for change, they must not be used to dispossess people from their land or entrench privilege and exploitation."[16] Thus, several scholars believe that the dispute that exists between the Israelis and Palestinians is one of apartheid and ethnic cleansing. Apartheid is a deliberate creation of conditions that prevent the complete development of a group of individuals, such as the right to a nationality and the right to movement. Therefore, when considering that Zionism – an ideology that stresses the development of a Jewish nation inside Palestinian territories – actively uses both military force and legal institutions to drive the spatial segregation of Palestinians, it is safe to say for several scholars that Israel is an apartheid state.

Through these evictions in Sheikh Jarrah, scholars believe that Israel plans to

13 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."
14 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."
15 Jubeh, "Shaykh Jarrah: A Struggle for Survival."
16 J. Schechla, "Deconstructing Israel's Housing and Land Apartheid," *HLRN,* accessed March 6, 2022, http://mail.hlrn.org/img/documents/BP_Deconstructing.pdf.

transform Jerusalem into a Jewish-Israeli city. Before Israel was founded, in 1901, the 5th Zionist Congress founded the Jewish National Fund (JNF) and began purchasing lands in Palestine. Their purpose is to "promote the interests of Jews in the prescribed region" and restrict its land offerings "whether directly or indirectly, to those of Jewish race or descendancy."[17] Once Israel officially became a state in 1948, it was stipulated that any properties purchased can be transferred to the government, highlighting how Israeli public organizations actively work with the Israeli government to collude against the Palestinians. The Nakba – or catastrophe – in 1947-48 involved Israeli forces conducting the massacres of approximately 5,000 Palestinians and the razing of over 500 villages.[18] To cover the crimes, the JNF began land transfers to the Jewish people, eventually being given to the Israeli state, thus beginning a mass process of displacement under a religious and political pretext.

I firmly believe in a combination of the three theories: that Israel takes into account religion, global power struggles, and security when displacing Palestinians in Sheikh Jarrah. As a result, the Palestinians are neglected and forced to use their territory as a survival strategy. Furthermore, with these displacement policies, Israel intends to create a pure Jewish state, attempting to maintain its sphere of influence through a religious guise while committing ethnic cleansing. Furthermore, it sheds light on Israel's religious motivation for expelling Palestinians from their homelands, as well as their interest in maintaining their global sphere of influence. Additionally, Palestinians do not have a strong representative government to address their concerns, which is also a reason the Israeli government is easily able to displace the Palestinians from their homes. Sheikh Jarrah is an area of strategic importance due to the many international organizations in the area. Therefore, Israel also uses that as an incentive to take over the land.

Although this question of Palestinian displacement is entirely urban, scholars often ignore the undoubtedly global influences that push influence from both the Israeli and Palestinian viewpoints. For instance, Iran is attempting to increase its sphere of influence in the Middle East and counter Israel as it sponsors militant groups in the Palestinian Territories, such as Hezbollah and Hamas. Iran's goal is to see a "liberated" Palestine and therefore attempts to destabilize Israel for the reasons mentioned above.[19] In response, Israel has launched numerous attacks on Iranian-backed rebels, assassinated top Iranian nuclear scientists, and even acquired nuclear weapons. Therefore, it would not be in Israel's interest to recognize the sovereignty of the Palestinians, and more so recognize Sheikh Jarrah as part of their territory. In fact, it would probably encourage arch-rivals like Iran to spread their military and nuclear program even further if they see its effectiveness transpire through Israel's recognition of Palestinian neighborhoods. Any positive and constructive peace talks with the Palestinians would decrease Israel's sphere of influence in the region, which is obviously why Israel is

17 Schechla, "Deconstructing Israel's Housing and Land Apartheid."

18 Schechla, "Deconstructing Israel's Housing and Land Apartheid."

19 S.J. Frantzman, "Iran Reveals 'Untold Story' of Arming Palestinians in Gaza.," *The Jerusalem Post*, January 11, 2022, https://www.jpost.com/middle-east/article-692178.

continuing with the apartheid-like policies it has been pursuing.

By ethnically cleansing Palestinians, they would be pushing against rivals like Iran and their attempts of pushing for Palestinian self-determination. Additionally, the theory fails to recognize the fragile, corrupt power of the Palestinian government that allows violence against the Palestinians in Sheikh Jarrah to occur. The scholars mention that Palestinians lack any meaningful representation to fight the Israeli government, but fail to mention why this is the case. The Palestinian authorities have been met with internal political feuds, corruption, nepotism, mismanagement, and numerous other factors that have decreased their effectiveness. Israel takes advantage of this political weakness by committing flagrant ethnic cleansing against the Palestinians.

Furthermore, some scholars refuse to acknowledge that religion has any role in this conflict. Although they mention it in their scholarly writing, they insist that this issue in Sheikh Jarrah is entirely urban. There is no doubt that Israel feels justified in displacing the Palestinians because of a sense of religious fervor they hold in the land. According to Jews, there is a prophecy in the Bible stating that, after a long period in exile, they will return to their Jewish homeland. Being an apartheid state according to many, when Israel commits ethnic cleansings and displacement against Palestinians, they are essentially fulfilling this alleged prophecy and ensuring the creation of a purely Jewish state. However, my analysis of the scholarly evidence suggests that the scholars tend to ignore the religious importance of Jerusalem for the Palestinian Muslims. Home to Islam's third holiest site, where the Prophet Muhammad was believed to have ascended towards the heavens, the areas surrounding the Al-Aqsa Mosque are pivotal for Palestinian Muslims.

Conversely, future studies should incorporate the religious importance of the Sheikh Jarrah area for Palestinian Muslims. A focus on the global implications of either Israel recognizing Palestinian sovereignty, or the Palestinian government becoming stronger, should also be warranted. That way, scholars and the common reader are better able to understand the motivations of both states as they both navigate an increasingly globalized world. My work continues in the field of IR by highlighting the lack of competence of the Palestinian government, Israel's eventual goal of ethnically cleansing Palestinians from Jerusalem to create a "Jewish city," and their attempt to maintain their sphere of influence from the Middle East.

Ultimately, I firmly believe that there is a mix among the three theories: Israel considers religion, security, and global power struggles when hitching plans for their displacement policies. In terms of religion, they seek easier access for Jewish settlers to their holy sites, such as the Temple Mount and Simon HaTzadik's tomb. With the rise of Hamas, the Palestinian military organization responsible for launching thousands of rockets toward Israeli cities, Israel would justify their displacement policies by stating that they are attempting to mitigate their attacks. Furthermore, Hamas has significant military capabilities, such as deep underground tunnels that house military equipment aimed at targeting Israeli assets. A more cynical belief amongst some sections of the Israeli population is that Palestinians advocate for violence against Israelis, creating an incentive for them to "clear" those areas. In terms of global power

struggles, it is in Israel's best interests to maintain the status quo they have created and prevent the Palestinians from gaining more power. Giving the Palestinians more power would certainly reduce Israel's legitimacy and global power status in the world, giving adversaries like Iran a moral victory. As such, Israel considers global power struggles, too, in this urban issue, highlighting the complexities of this seemingly small neighborhood.

However, I believe the field of IR would benefit from analysis of the events in Israel-Palestine as a humanitarian issue. Currently, hundreds of thousands of Palestinians are suffering due to a lack of supplies entering the Gaza Strip–one of the most densely populated areas in the world. Malnutrition is common as a result, alongside a lack of access to clean water and shelter. The UN Secretary-General, after witnessing the 2021 tragedies, said: "If there is a hell on earth, it is the lives of children in Gaza."[20] When the main focus is on the causes of the conflict, rather than its aftermath, people tend to lose the perception of what is happening on the ground. Thousands of Palestinians are suffering and living precarious lives, merely relying on donations and international aid. When scholars begin to recognize the result of this conflict and tackle it as a humanitarian one, more awareness will be given to the issue, which could galvanize the public to pressure their governments to do the right thing.

20 United Nations, "Gaza Children Living in 'Hell on Earth,' UN Chief Says, Urging Immediate End to Fighting," *UN News*, accessed April 30, 2022, https://news.un.org/en/story/2021/05/1092332.

Historiography Analysis

The United States and the Greek War of Independence

[Georgia Tsakos]

Introduction

The Greek War of Independence marks the struggle for liberation amongst Greek populations enslaved by the Ottoman Empire between the years 1821-1828. The Greeks desired to create an independent state and escape Ottoman domination. The start of the conflict was caused by several circumstances, including Greek resentment against Ottoman oppression and ethno-conflict. The Byzantine Empire lasted for 1100 years, from 350 to 1453. Ottoman influence and control began to spread over the territories of the Byzantine Empire after the conquest of Constantinople by the Ottoman Turks in 1453."On March 25th, 1821, Greek nationalists of the Peloponnese declared independence which resulted in a strong sense of nationalism and self-determination after 400 years of Ottoman rule. Soon after, the mainland of Greece and the Aegean islands joined the caused. In 1829, the Treaty of Adrianople was signed, acknowledging Greece as an independent and sovereign state. Many European powers involved themselves in the Greek independence movement for a variety of reasons as the conflict attracted attention from the West.

The Greek War of Independence is often a matter that is studied on its own. However, more recent scholarship is situating the Greek War of Independence within a transnational historical context. The topic regarding the rise of Philhellenism and Western interest in the Greek cause is well-established. There are sufficient literary works such as that of William St. Clair who thoroughly analyzed Northern and Western European perspectives of the Greek War of Independence. During the Greek War, many countries and individuals felt the need to support Greece whether that included humanitarian aid, policy changes, advocacy, or social organizations. In the United States, historians have noted that among a variety of different cities and in political settings, Philhellenism and Hellenic sympathizers were widely apparent.

Approach

Although the scholarship on the United States and the Greek War of Independence does not present any stark disagreements concerning the rise of Philhellenism in the United States, I argue that there is an evolution in research that contributes to a layered understanding of how America and Greece interacted with each other during the Greek War of Independence. I also suggest that the American perspective on the Greeks during their War of Independence led to the othering of eastern qualities of both Greeks and Turks, as well as the idealization of Greek history. For the purpose of this paper, I will be utilizing the "historiographical-evolution approach" to compare four secondary sources "that deal with closely related questions and that show a clear evolution of viewpoints over time" thus creating a larger picture on the subject.[1] To do this, I will first discuss how the scholars have similar foundations in their understanding of philhellenism in America. Then, I will discuss and analyze each source to convey how they add to a large historical understanding of this subject. In this section, I will also include opinions about the strengths and limitations of the authors as well as comparisons and differences between them. In the conclusion, I will restate my argument and propose a future direction for this research.

The four historical works I will be analyzing are by authors, Edward Mead Earle, Paul Constantine Pappas, Angelo Repousis, and Konstantinos Diogos. Published in 1927, Edward Mead Earle is one of the earlier scholars to have studied this subject in his article called "American Interest in the Greek Cause, 1821-1828." Paul Constantine Pappas in 1975 authored the book, *The United States and the Greek War of Independence.* Angelo Repousis published "The Cause of the Greek: Philadelphia and the Greek War for Independence, 1821-1828" in 1999 and focuses on the city of Philadelphia. Lastly, Konstantinos Diogos wrote "The Greek Vision of America during the Greek War of Independence (1821-183)" published in 2022, and focuses on the Greek perspective of America during the war.

Similarities among the Scholars

It is important to first explain how the scholars share similar foundations as to why the Greek Revolution appealed to so many Americans. The scholars mention how American cities were driven by philhellenic sentiments, which thus, fueled a romanticized understanding of Greek culture and achievement when the war broke out. For example, the city of Philadelphia experienced a "Hellenic Renaissance" in the early 19th century when the Second Bank of the United States was modeled after the Parthenon—"regarded as the first truly Greek Revival building in the United States," and

1 Jeremy Popkin, *History 650: The Holocaust*, "Hints for Writing a Historiographical Essay," https://www.uky.edu/~popkin/650%20HolocaustSyl_files/Historiographical%20Essay.html.

considered "the Athens of America."[2] Support was bound to arise in a place like Philadelphia which was inspired by Greek concepts. When atrocities of the war became of knowledge, many Americans experienced what Paul Pappas refers to as the "Greek fever." The "Greek Fever" spurred Western support that led major political leaders, American intellects, and philanthropists to support the idea of American intervention in the European conflict.[3] Across the board, the authors establish that since American politics, government, and intellectualism were inspired by ancient Greek principles modern Greeks were inheritors of their culture.[4]

Earle, Repousis, and Pappas address the "eastern question" that emerged when Greece encouraged the West "to purge Greece from barbarians, who for four hundred years have polluted soil."[5] Major Western powers saw an opportunity to dilute the power of the Ottomans as they saw the Ottoman Turks as barbaric and unaligned with Western liberal ideas. The scholars also ask the question of why the Greek War of Independence received attention while other Balkan revolutions did not. The Greek War of Independence drew support in ways that the Serbian Revolution did not. Repousis writes, "Even though the Serbs, like the Greeks, were Christians fighting for similar principles. Unlike the Serbs, however, the Greeks were perceived as the heirs to the classical culture of antiquity." [6] Many Americans sympathized with ancient Greek ideals and felt a cultural and intellectual affinity towards them. This connection was ignited by classical schools of thought and academia inspired by ancient Greek education that many Americans had embraced. Therefore, among people with Western cultural roots, the Greek War of Independence was seen as a fight for freedom. Serbia did not have the same classical heritage that captured Western imagination and was not "possessed of a great name."[7] Moreover, "As Christians, Americans applauded the uprising of Greek Christians against the infidel Turks, and, as humanitarians, they lamented the suffering of Greek people caught in the midst of a cruel war."[8] When major events occurred in the war such as that of the Greek women who died at the battle of Missonloghi, the havoc that wrecked the Greek island of Chios, and the execution of Christian religious priests, Greek self-determination of the Greeks was supported rightly so in America.[9] Furthermore, all the scholars emphasize the important roles of leaders involved in the Greek War, both American and Greek; for example, Edward Everett (one of the most notable American supporters) in the spread of American phil-

---

2 Angelo Repousis, "'The Cause of the Greeks": Philadelphia and the Greek War for Independence, 1821-1828,'" *The Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography* 123 (1999): 334.

3 Paul Constantine Pappas, *The United Sates and the Greek War for Independence, 1821-1828*. *East European Monographs* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1985).

4 Konstantinos Diogos, "The Greek Vision of America during the Greek War of Independence (1821-1830)," *European journal of American studies* (2022): 2; Edward Mead Earle, "American Interest in the Greek," *The American Historical Review* 33, no. 1 (1927): 45; Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 333; Pappas, *The United States,* 28.

5 Earle, "American Interest," 45.

6 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 333.

7 Earle, "American Interest," 45.

8 Pappas, *The United States*, 28.

9 Pappas, *The United States*, 29.

hellenism for his opposition against American neutrality in the Greek War, as well as the role of Adamantios Korais, a significant Greek leader who vouched for American intervention during the Greek War of independence.

Historical Evolution

Edward Earle

Edward Earle's "American Interest in the Greek Cause, 1821-1827" provides the initial political and social understanding of the United States and the Greek War of Independence using primary sources of American leaders and philhellenes involved in the Greek cause. Importantly, Earle also reveals a bias towards Greeks in American public opinion and desensitization to the potential mistreatment of the Turks.

Committees, campaigns, and memorials were formed in Washington and Massachusetts to advocate for the Greek fighters but the United States Government between 1821 and 1822 believed that it was best if the United States stayed neutral.[10] President Monroe encouraged Greece's liberation through writing but no official assistance was provided at the beginning of the cause.[11] Edward Everett, an individual and Harvard professor who authored a highly influential article in the North American Review in year 1823, expounded upon a strategic plan of action for Americans who wholeheartedly embraced the Greek cause.[12] Within his article, Everett asserts a course of action for Americans who trusted in the idea of emancipation.[13] Earle explains how Thomas Jefferson suggested to the Greek revolutionary leader Adamantios Korais, whom he had formed communication with, "that the constitutions of the several states and of the United States, 'being in print and in every hand, might well be taken into consideration when the new nation should come to frame its permanent political institutions.'"[14] John Adams expressed his willingness to contribute to their noble endeavor to the Greek Committee in New York in 1823, offering his modest support and wishing them great success.[15] The fourth former President of the United States, James Madison, earnestly suggested to President Monroe political advice that would recognize the independence of Greece.[16] In the first half of his analysis, Earle outlines American leaders involved in the Greek war. Earle then introduces the establishment of committees and fundraising efforts in the United States to support the Greek cause, highlighting the political and social mobilization of American citizens. He suggests that "the contagion" of enthusiastic support for Greeks occurred throughout cities, churches, and college campuses.[17] Students and committees in Philadelphia, New York, and Boston held meetings to raise money, bring Greek orphans to America, distribute military supplies,

10 Earle, "American Interest," 46.
11 Earle, "American Interest," 46.
12 Earle, "American Interest," 47.
13 Earle, "American Interest," 47.
14 Earle, "American Interest," 49.
15 Earle, "American Interest," 49.
16 Earle, "American Interest," 49.
17 Earle, "American Interest," 50.

and support Americans who fled to serve in the Hellenic army.[18] I believe Earle does an effective job with the primary sources he utilizes from leaders like Thomas Jefferson and Adamantios to outline political involvement among major leaders and citizens in the Greek War and sources from committees and students that outline the outbreak of American philhellenism. However, Earle uses only American sources which limits the research by only an American perspective.

Earle's analysis also shows a reasonable approach to studying the United States and the Greek War. Towards the end of his article, he offers insight into the contrast of reactions towards the Greeks and Turks. He suggests that "although eloquent and verbose on the subject of Turkish atrocities, were silent concerning the brutalities of Greek armed forces."[19] Massacres of Turkish people in "Galatz, at Jassy, at Moenmvasia, at Navarino, at Tripolitza," were ignored and not reported in the American press.[20] While Earle introduces to the reader the formation of committees and philhellenism to aid Greece, he also introduces a nuanced understanding of reactions towards Greeks and Turks by suggesting the consequences of "blackening the Ottomans and whitewashing Hellenes"—an idea constructed by Lord Byron.[21] As a result, atrocities committed by Greek Christians were deemed justified. This problem that Earle outlines reflects impartiality when approaching the subject.

Paul Pappas

The next scholar, Paul Constantine Pappas is considered to have 'fathered' the subject of the United States and the Greek War of Independence, as he is one of the only to have authored a book about the subject. His book, *The United States and the Greek War of Independence*, published in 1975, explains the outbreak of the revolution, European involvement, overall American philhellenism, and Greek appeals for aid. It is important to note that Pappas utilizes a variety of sources from America, Greece, and France. This book is made up of eight chapters that are quite brief. What sets Pappas' books apart from the authors is that he traces the changes in American policies that shift American government from being neutral to becoming involved in the Greek cause.

Pappas provides a more complete analysis of this neglected subject, but to some extent, it lacks depth. For example, Paul Pappas touches on this subject stating that in the American press, Turkish atrocities were often excluded, but he does not provide more information on this dynamic in his literary work, as does Earle.[22] I believe further examination as to why Greek atrocities were ignored or justified the relationship could have enhanced his book. It is important to relay that multiple book reviews of Pappas' *The United States and the Greek War of Independence* reveal that his work is rather an anti-climactic analysis. One reviewer states that the book "does not break

18 Earle, "American Interest," 54-60.
19 Earle, "American Interest," 62.
20 Earle, "American Interest," 62.
21 Earle, "American Interest," 62.
22 Pappas, *The United States*, 30.

new ground," but does provide concise explanations to American concerns over the Greek War of Independence.[23] Although in my opinion, Pappas may include redundant information about the nature of philhellenism and sympathy in America, I believe he does break new ground, especially in his later chapter called "The Case of the Frigates" and his emphasis on American relations. The Case of the Frigates is the instance in which Greece asked America for ships that would help them in the cause against the Ottoman Empire by building their naval power. Important leaders in the transaction of the Frigates explains, is Alexander Contostavlos, "a wealthy Chiot merchant" who was appointed by the Greek government to help in these operations, Adamantios Korais, and Edward Everett. Pappas described the complex mishandling of the frigates on both Greek and American parties that required the help of US government action that would permit "the construction of armed ships for foreign countries" as well as the purchase of the ships.[24] American fears revolved around the idea that the commissions of these frigates would negate American neutrality, but the US Congress in 1926 agreed that one of the frigates could be purchased.[25] Due to monetary misunderstandings, Pappas explores how the case of the frigates led to the fundraising of purchasing these vessels and international diplomatic efforts that required the help of Greek Committees in America and the US government.

The United States and the Greek War for Independence, 1821-1828 offers an overall analysis of the multifaceted American involvement in the Greek War for Independence, highlighting the contributions of philanthropy, diplomacy, and public opinion in determining American involvement in the war. All of these matters are organized into one space which is helpful to a new a historians exploring this topic. Pappas adds to the literature by exploring diplomatic and international efforts between Greece and America.

Angelo Repousis

The next scholar, Angelo Repousis published "The Cause of the Greek: Philadelphia and the Greek War for Independence, 1821-1828" in 1999. Repousis established the appeal for relief in Greece by focusing on the city of Philadelphia and the creation of the Philadelphia Greek committee. The Philadelphia Greek Committee specifically focused on missionary work and providing for struggling Greeks during the movement. Although Pappas and Earle talk about the acts of relief committees taking place in East Coast America, Repousis reveals the specific complexities and nuances of the Philadelphia Greek committee.

Matthew Carey, a popular philanthropist in Philadelphia organized the Greek Committee and appointed fellow philhellenes and clergy members to help the Greek cause.[26] Like Edward Everett, Matthew Carey had the same effect on Philadelphians. Repousis emphasizes that the quality that bonded the committee and Philadelphia phil-

23 Robert L Daniel, *The Journal of American History* 72, no. 4 (1986): 949–50.
24 Pappas, *The United States*, 103.
25 Pappas, *The United States*, 104.
26 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 344.

hellenes was the basis of Christianity. Nonetheless, Repousis describes how the Philadelphia philhellenes experienced many obstacles trying to support of the Greeks since many leaders in the city doubted that "the Greeks were as virtuous as their glorious ancestors."[27] A crucial point that Repousis makes is that many Americans in Philadelphia who saw the Greeks portrayed as enslaved persons, disassociated them from their ancestors and viewed them as not worthy of help.[28] Hence, philhellenes argued that the Greeks would reaffirm their former legacy and that their purpose was to uplift the Greeks to their prior prestige.[29] Soon after, the Philadelphia Greek Committee was instrumental in organizing relief operations, providing supplies, and raising money. The Greek Committee encouraged American citizens and Philadelphians to help the Greeks by fundraising through theater and concerts and stressing to "help clothe and feed their naked and starving brethren in Greece."[30] Reportedly, the Greek Committee achieved successful campaigns in Greece, however, "reports of piracy and disunion among the Greeks made it difficult for philhellenes to glorify the Greeks."[31] Importantly, Repousis addresses how leaders of the philhellenic movements that were sweeping Philadelphia would excuse the mistreatment of Turks in published newsletters. He incorporates the faults of the Greek Committee having biases into his research. Overall, Repousis' analysis focuses more on the humanitarian efforts made by Philadelphians than on the involvement of the American government or its connection to the war, which I argue contributes to the existing literature. In 1828, the Greek committee in Philadelphia dissolved but relief work through philhellenic organizations continued and became "a practical expression of sympathy for suffering humanity."[32]

Konstantinos Diogos

The last scholar, Konstantinos Diogos wrote "The Greek Vision of America during the Greek War of Independence (1821-183)" published in 2022. Diogos contributes to research on the United States and the Greek War of Independence by offering an examination of the beliefs that Greeks possessed towards America. While Earle, Repousis, and Pappas focus on American interest in Greece, Diogos' analysis centers on the argument of those who regarded the American model as an inspirational political model for Greece.

Diogos highlights the manner in which the Greek revolutionaries and intellectuals perceived America as a potential collaborator in their pursuit of self-determination. Diogos explains how the American government was a point of focus in Greek political discourse during the Revolution.[33] Diogos also writes about how different political and military individuals in Greece pursued America during the course of the

27 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 349.
28 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 350.
29 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 350.
30 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 356.
31 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 357.
32 Repousis, "The Cause of the Greeks," 363.
33 Diogos, "The Greek Vision." 2.

war. For example, Adamantios Korais (a point of evidence for many of the scholars) perceived the American archetype as a veritable source of political inspiration for a Modern Greek state.[34] Korais was influential in Greek-American communication during the war as he writes in personal notes that "it would be most fortunate... if the Greeks could draft their future constitution... by following in all things the political system of the Anglo-Americans."[35] Moreover, Diogos' research adds to the existing body of knowledge by exploring the Greek conceptualization of America. This analysis serves to display the underlying motivations behind the Greek expectations of American assistance and its influence on the trajectory of the war. This is something that both Pappas and Diogos explore but Pappas seems to support the idea that America's philhellenism led the Greeks to inquire for official help while Diogos supports the idea that Greeks "were eager to learn more about this peculiar and wonderful country…and upon this knowledge to build their own myths, aspirations, and vision about the United States" to draw inspiration.[36]

Conclusion

This historiography paper explores the relationship that existed in the early 19th century between the United States and Greek during the Greek War of Independence 1821-1829. The area of study analyzes the diplomatic, intellectual, and humanitarian aspects of American involvement in this crucial time of Greek history. In this paper, I trace the historiographical evolution of the United States' involvement in the Greek independence struggle, highlighting its relevance on its effects on diplomatic relations and the legacy of philhellenism in American political and cultural discourse.

To restate my argument, each scholar adds research that contributes to an overall picture of how the United States and Greece interacted during the revolution. Edward Earle adds the initial political understanding by emphasizing American leaders, the reactions of American philhellenes, and exposes potential biases towards Greeks. Paul Pappas offers the most complete analysis of introducing the subject by using both Greek, American, and French evidence to outline American Sympathizers, Greece in the International scope of America, and American political involvement in the Greek War. Although Pappas does not necessarily break ground in terms of the nature of philhellene movements in America, he does provide an adequate understanding of Greco-American relations. Angelo Repousis builds upon the topic of American sympathizers through a focused interpretation on how the city of Philadelphia interacted with the Greeks during the war and what they accomplished in order to raise funds and provide services to the Greeks. And Lastly, Konstantinos Diogos offers and alternate perspective of the United States and the Greek War of Independence by emphasizing the *Greek* perspective of America. I do acknowledge that there are some gaps in the literature that need to be expanded upon. Throughout the essays, we see

34 Diogos, "The Greek Vision," 6.
35 Diogos, "The Greek Vision," 7.
36 Pappas, *The United States*, 27; Diogos, "The Greek Vision," 2.

that among the scholars, there is a lot of crossover in terms of the events and figures they reference. Nonetheless, although they share similarities, they contribute something different to the conversation.

Throughout the scholarship that I found, I saw progress on the lengths many Americans were willing to go to support the Greek cause and the way Americans and Greeks influenced each other during this time period. I believe that further exploration of this subject, fully addressing the different reactions to Greeks and Turks (and even other Christian revolutions), is also worthwhile. I would also question why the identity of the Greeks was open to western interpretation whereas the Turks were not. I feel as though the scholarship on this subject does not convey the most captivating features of Greek history, such as ignoring Greece's eastern qualities and operating within a framework that accepts it. As Earle suggests, why is it that modern Greeks of the war were closely associated with qualities of Greek antiquity when at that point in time they were more closely related to the Byzantine Empire?[37] While the authors I reviewed touch on this aspect, I believe it can be explored more to reveal the role of the United States in the events and language surrounding the formation of the contemporary Greek nation.

37 Earle, "American Interest," 61.

[Modernity's Dilemmas]

Resilience and Resistance

Jewish Experiences in Italy During WWII

[Tabitha Andrews]

Holocaust survivor Laura Varon said, "So my mother, when we heard the bombs, called us inside and we went in the corner and it was terrible. Everything moved, everything was destroyed. And you think you're going to die and we started to say the 'Shema' because we thought that we are going to die. A lot of homes around us were destroyed and my father came from synagogue fast and said, 'We have to leave, we have to leave Rhodes because they're going to kill us if they come again.'"[1] While Italy was not exempt from antisemitism, its response and participation in the Nazi persecution of Jews was ambiguous and often complex because of a multitude of different social and political factors. Italian Fascism was never inherently antisemitic. Mussolini was focused on creating a strong, nationalist state that glorified the power of Italy, and less so on racial extermination. Italian Jews were tightly integrated into Italian society; many themselves were Fascists and felt nationalistic pride for their country. Because Italian Fascism was more focused on political control and nationalism than racial purity, the approach to the genocide of Jews was thought to be less extreme. Many Italian families and communities aided Italian and foreign Jews during the Holocaust. The reasons for their assistance were multitudinous: hatred of fascism and rebellion against the government, humanitarian values, personal relationships, and cultural and religious beliefs. Their aid contributed to the ambiguous narrative of Italy's role in Jewish persecution.

The history of the Italian Fascist regime is divided into four phases. First, the March on Rome from 1922 to 1925, during which the government maintained continuity with the parliamentary system but operated through a legally executed

1 Laura Varon, "Testimony of Laura Varon, born in Rhodes, Greece, 1926, regarding her experiences in Rhodes, in the Auschwitz-Birkenau and Dachau camps, and in the death march to Bergen Belsen," interview by Yael Ben Shmuel, *Testimonies Department*, Yad Vashem Archives, November 14, 1996, File #10423, 10.

dictatorship. Second, the construction of the Fascist dictatorship from 1925 to 1929. Third, diminished activism from 1929 to 1934 and passive acceptance of the Fascist regime which resulted in the fourth phase, active foreign policy, military campaigns abroad, growing economics, and semi-Nazification.[2] Understanding the development of fascism through these four phases is essential for discussing the Holocaust in Italy and differentiating between Mussolini's Fascism and Hitler's National Socialism. Hitler's ideology was based "mystical Nordic racism," a foundation not shared by Italy.[3] Italian Fascism was not founded on racist principles, though scholars debate when and how the treatment of Jews changed within the regime. Some posit that fascism always harbored antisemitism due to its extreme nationalistic doctrine, which gradually surfaced over time. Others attribute the rise of antisemitism to the signing of the Lateran Treaties in 1929, which reinstated the special relationship between the Catholic Church and the Italian state, excluding the Jewish community and making it unequal to the Church. Alternative perspectives identify the turning point of antisemitism with the Italian invasion of Ethiopia in 1935 and the Spanish Civil War.[4] These events heightened Italian racial consciousness, prompting Italy to align more closely with Nazi Germany as a friend and ally. Despite minimal German pressure on racial matters during this period, the overall deepening of the Italian-German relationship empowered proponents of a more explicit antisemitic policy.[5]

The emergence of antisemitic doctrines and schools of thought later in the regime does not reflect the foundation of fascism in Italy. Mussolini's fascist regime focused on the colonial expansion of the Mediterranean area and the establishment of a nationalistic state.[6] The Italian regime also maintained the practice of formal law and a juridical state, whereas in Germany, Hitler was the "unchallenged chief of state and complete dictator."[7] Although Italy was totalitarian, Mussolini did not control all institutions, allowing some freedom within Italian life.[8] Although Jews have lived in Italy since the Roman Republic, facing documented persecution from the Roman Empire until the modern period, they have also seen periods of toleration and integration in Italian society.[9] In the late 19th to early 20th century, Italian Jews were actively involved in the struggle for Italian unification. During this period, several legal and political measures were enacted to ensure the equal rights and citizenship of Jews in the new Italian state. Many Jews were elected to positions in the Italian parliament and

---

2 Stanley G. Payne, *A History of Fascism, 1914-1945* (Wisconsin: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1995), 212.

3 Payne, *History of Fascism,* 208.

4 Michael A. Livingston, *The Fascists and the Jews of Italy: Mussolini's Race Laws, 1938–1943* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 15.

5 Livingston, *The Fascists,* 15.

6 Payne, *History of Fascism,* 209.

7 Payne, *History of Fascism*, 208.

8 Payne, *History of Fascism*, 209.

9 Alexander Stille, "The Double Bind of Italian Jews: Acceptance and Assimilation," in *Jews in Italy under Fascist and Nazi Rule, 1922–1945*, ed. Joshua D. Zimmerman (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 23.

experienced increased integration into Italian society, dismantling the institutionalized segregation seen in the Ghettos.[10] So when Mussolini adopted the Racial Laws, Jews were shocked at the growing antisemitism of the fascist government. They had considered themselves full-blooded Italians, whose religion did not define their ethnicity, and who were fully integrated into Italian life.

The diverse influxes of immigration have also shaped the multifaceted identity of Italian Jews, creating distinctions between Sephardic Jews (originating from the Iberian Peninsula), Ashkenazic Jews (with roots in Germany or Eastern Europe), and a third group often referred to as Italian or native Jews. However, these classifications are fluid, and at present, the majority of Italian Jews likely embody a blend of influences from two or more of these distinct groups.[11] By the year 1650, Italy accommodated a diverse array of Jewish traditions, encompassing, but not confined to, Italian, Ashkenazic, and Sephardic nusachs, or rites. These customs significantly differed from one another in liturgical traditions, prayers, language pronunciation, customs, and traditions. Each was heavily influenced by its own cultural environment, indicating that Jews who emigrated to Italy had different self-identities from Italian Jews who had lived there since the Roman Republic. Specifically, in Rhodes, the Italian Jewish citizens are mostly Sephardic, speaking not only Italian but also their own separate language of Ladino. These Jewish communities who did not identify themselves as strictly Italian could still not comprehend such aggression from the Italian government. As mentioned previously, Jews had even responded to Mussolini's fascist call in the beginning, aligning with a movement that was patriotic and predominantly middle-class. Although the fundamental fascist structure of Mussolini's regime was not inherently antisemitic and was significantly different compared to Nazi Germany, Jewish Italians still faced life-changing circumstances with the increase of fascism and the creation of Racial Laws in the country.

Beginning in May of 1937, anti-Jewish propaganda increased significantly with the preparations for an alliance between Hitler and Mussolini. This propaganda argued that Jews were inferior to Italians due to "historical, religious, and national considerations," rather than biology or eugenics.[12] Giorgio Israel, a historian of science, discusses this "spiritual" racism seen in Italian Fascist discriminatory practices. Italian "spiritualistic" racism exhibited unique and modern elements, focusing less on a strictly biological sense of race and more on the concept of ethnic groups.[13] Theoreticians of "Italian Racism" concentrated on population formations or ethnic groups that were historically characterized as "excellent," emphasizing the need to preserve the biological purity of those groups.[14] Scientific racial documents did emerge during the beginnings of the Racial Laws, exploring the idea of a biologically superior Italian

10 Stille, "Double Bind," 25.

11 Livingston, *The Fascists,* 13.

12 Stille, "Double Bind," 29.

13 Giorgio Israel, "Science and the Jewish Question in the Twentieth Century: The Case of Italy and What It Shows," *Aleph*, no. 4 (2004): 196.

14 Israel, "Science," 198.

race. However, the Manifesto of Race asserted that "the Jews do not belong to the Italian race," because their population in Italy never assimilated, being composed of non-European racial elements fundamentally different from those which gave rise to the Italians.[15]

A "good Jew," one not considered inferior to Italians, was defined by their good conduct and assimilation into society. According to this train of thought, antisemitism is something the Jews either bring about or prevent through their own behavior.[16] The major theme that emerged from this propaganda was the notion of a certain "good status" ascertained through the conduct of Jewish Italians. The perfect Jewish model, according to antisemitic Fascist Italian writings, would be someone fully integrated into Italian life beyond recognition by others. In this scenario, Jewishness would be practiced internally and not publicly, and Jews would instead become overly patriotic and openly support fascism. Interestingly, many did.

Political cartoons, created in the context of rising antisemitism and the threat of allied intervention, encapsulate the fascist narrative written under Mussolini. These sources shed light on fascist propaganda circulating in Italy during WWII.[17] The images depict a powerful fascist state—a new Roman empire—and portray the allied powers as enemies. Interestingly, there are no documents that discuss the treatment of Jews in Italy. Nevertheless, the primary sources allow us to better understand the political environment of Italy during the war and the resulting treatment of Jews, as indicated by the testimonials of survivors.Top of FormBottom of Form

The broadside picture titled, "The new barbarians invaded the city and camped among the great vestiges, moving expressions of the human civilization," circulated around Italy in 1937 after Mussolini's Fascist troops entered Rome and announced the creation of the second empire.[18] The passage reflects an Italian Fascist perspective on Mussolini's 1937 declaration of what they called the new Roman Empire. The language used is dramatic and emotive, expressing a mix of pride and nostalgia. The text starts with a metaphorical reference to "new barbarians" invading the "Urbe," a term often used to refer to Rome. "New barbarians" refers to the Fascist troops entering Rome—barbarians not in a negative sense but rather as a nationalistic outlook on the power of the new warriors defending Italy. The text expresses a deep faith in the "shining years of the resurrected Empire," referring to the period when Rome was a dominant imperial power. This nostalgia is portrayed as a source of hope and encouragement for the future, indicating a desire to reclaim past glory through

15 Israel, "Science," 226.

16 Stille, "Double Bind," 29.

17 The broadsides and political cartoons used in this paper are from the Broadsides and Ephemera Collection at the Duke University Libraries. Specifically, the sources are located in the David M. Rubenstein Rare Book and Manuscript Library, a highly reputable archive consisting of a variety of printed material.

18 *I nuovi barbari hanno invaso l'urbe e bivaccano trale grandi restigia, toccanti espressioni della civiltaumana,* "The new barbarians invaded the city and camped among the great vestiges, moving expressions of the human civilization," (Italy: Rome, 1937), Duke 464065, Ephemera Collection.

the Fascist regime. A mention of the power of Rome being reborn under the sign of the "Littorio" deepens its nationalist and militaristic tone. The Littorio fascist symbol, used in Fascist Italy, features an axe surrounded by a bundle of rods, representing the ancient Roman symbol of authority and strength.[19] The text's reference to the conquering phalanxes parading through the streets celebrates military strength and dominance. The passage reflects a strong sense of nationalism, glorifying the past achievements of the Roman Empire. There is also a notable hostility towards perceived enemies, specifically pointing fingers at a "perjured king" (Victor Emmanuel III) and the "Anglo-American powers."

The poster titled, "Do not betray my son," signed by Gino Boccasile, who was an Italian illustrator and supporter of Mussolini, and depicts a mourning Italian mother wearing a gold medal in memory of her son, who died fighting for the Italian Social Republic.[20] This was a puppet state established by Nazi Germany in Northern Italy during the latter part of World War II. It existed from September 1943 to April 1945 and was led by Benito Mussolini, the former dictator of Fascist Italy.[21] The woman is dressed modestly in black, a symbol of the Italian Fascist movement, while the red background could suggest several different elements such as the red of the Italian flag or the blood of fallen soldiers. The cartoon aims to encourage Italians not to give up on the Fascist cause for domination and a return to a Roman inspired imperialistic nation, as well as to draw sympathy and patriotism from its viewer. Under the German occupation, the Italian Social Republic implemented more severe anti-Jewish measures, including the arrest and deportation of Jews. Jewish individuals and families faced persecution and increased discrimination.[22] Propaganda which drew sympathy to the Italian Social Republic and aimed to increase nationalistic sentiments in Italians also promoted this antisemitic persecution of the Jews. These posters threatened Jews in Italy, as the Italian Social Republic not only fought against the Allies but aided in the Nazis' systematic genocide of Italian Jews.

Beyond propaganda, testimonials provide useful insight into the experiences of Italian Jews in WWII. Many of the primary sources used in this paper are from the Yad Vashem Archives, a renowned institution dedicated to Holocaust documentation and remembrance, and a key source for researching Italian Jewish experiences. These sources include written testimonials of Jewish Holocaust survivors, recorded almost 50 years after the end of the Holocaust (May 8th, 1945). Because each survivor recorded their memory of the events so long after their occurrence, the information is only so accurate as far as it can be compared to statistics and documentary evidence collected after the war. The testimonials used here all center around Italy, including the

19 Giorgio Agamben, *The Kingdom and the Glory, For a Theological Genealogy of Economy and Government*, trans. Lorenzo Chiesa and Matteo Mandarini (Redwood: Stanford University Press, 2011), 182.

20 *Non tradite mio figlio,* "Do not betray my son," (Italy, 1944), Duke 463204, Ephemera Collection.

21 Stille, "Double Bind," 19.

22 Stille, "Double Bind," 19.

experiences of both foreign and native Jews. These experiences follow general themes that are often unexpected and surprising to read. But it is important to note that these experiences do not represent all experiences of Jewish people. My collection of sources is limited to those that are transcribed or translated into English and focuses solely on Italy. The sources are also heavily biased in many ways because they all express emotional, personal experiences of a horrific event. When analyzing and understanding each interview in the context of the present analysis it is imperative to acknowledge subjectivity, trauma, and selective memory. Holocaust survivors may choose to focus on specific aspects of their experiences, and certain details may be emphasized or omitted based on individual priorities, coping mechanisms, or the desire to convey a particular message. This selectivity can influence the overall narrative presented in a testimonial. Still, the experiences recounted by these survivors are important for creating a greater understanding of Italy's treatment of Jews compared to the many Nazi-occupied areas of Europe.

Another source collection used in my research on Jewish Italy is that of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum.[23] These are recorded and transcribed testimonials of Jewish experiences before, during, and after the Holocaust. Many of the sources regarding Italy were recorded and transcribed in Italian, a few were available in English. The USHMM archives are a credible institution, established by the U.S. Government, and dedicated towards documenting, educating, and remembering the lives lost in the Holocaust. The testimonials used in this research focus mainly on the stories of Italian Jews who were able to escape the Holocaust and flee to the Americas before persecution. The accounts detail their experiences growing up under a Fascist regime that implemented antisemitic policies against its Jewish citizens, and provide a deeper understanding of the experiences and events of Italian Jews leading up to WWII. Because the testimonials included from this database were told by people living in the U.S. around 50 years after the Holocaust, their perspectives are different from those who remained in Italy or fled to Palestine. They provide both a first-hand perspective in Italy leading up to the Holocaust and second-hand perspective on the treatment of Jews in Italy from places outside of Europe.

During World War II, Italy, under the Fascist regime led by Benito Mussolini, established a network of concentration camps. While not as widely recognized as the concentration camps operated by Nazi Germany, these Italian camps were instrumental in the persecution and internment of various groups of people. Italian POW and concentration camps held political dissidents, individuals considered enemies of the fascist state, and foreign Jews. Many Italian Jews were also placed in these camps, for various reasons, including suspicion of anti-fascist sentiments or distrust from the government. John Weissman, a Jewish survivor of the Holocaust who spent considerable time in Italy during WWII, was born in Arosa Switzerland and lived his whole life

23 Stille, "Double Bind," 19.

in Leipzig, Germany, leading up to the war.[24] At the age of 20, Weissman left Berlin to work in the fur trade in Milan. Weissman had planned to leave Germany, stop in Italy, and then head to France or Chile, but he was arrested and taken to internment camps in Macerata and then Ferramonti di Tarsia.

During his time in Milan, there had been rumors circulating that the Germans had asked the Italians to send foreign Jews to Germany, on the basis that they were enemies against the war effort. The Italians instead interned the Jews in camps in Italy. According to Weissman, no atrocities took place there, and the Red Cross took care of the prisoners. The internees could even send twenty-five-word letters.[25] According to James Walston, author and historian, there were two types of concentration or internment camps: camps that were for the purpose of repression, and camps for the purpose of protection. In the first set of camps, most of the internees were real or potential partisans: anyone that was resistant to the authority of the Italian Fascist regime. In these camps, the conditions were terrible, and insufficient food, shelter, and medical care caused many deaths within the camps. The second set of camps were created to protect Jewish prisoners from German persecution and were the salvation for many non-Italian Jews.[26] In Italy, at the beginning of WWII, the Italian Fascist government began to intern foreign Jews and Italian Jews who had taken Italian citizenship within the previous twenty years. That is, until Nazis infiltrated Italy in 1943 and began to round up both Italian and Foreign Jews.

John Weissman had quite a different experience from the millions of Jewish people who died in the Holocaust. Weissman flitted in and out of work camps across Italy and consistently worked to elude the Gestapo and SS Officers. These German forces were not present in Italy until Mussolini's overthrow and the German occupation of Italy. Their job was to find hidden Jews in Italy to be rounded up and taken to larger concentration camps in Europe. Weissman was first arrested in Milan and then sent to San Vittori, Italy's largest prison, to wait for his transfer to the work camp in Macerata, Italy. When describing the Macerata camp, he said it was a beautiful place with no barbed wired, and the Jews only had responsibilities to fulfill. If they had known about the camps in Germany, he says, "we would have been terrified, no question about it."[27] Weissman stayed at the camp in Macerata until 1940, when he was transferred to Ferramonti, but his journey to the camp was quite unconventional in comparison to the way the Germans transported Jews to camps. He traveled in a private cart with an Italian police officer, stopping on the way so that the officer could visit his family. Weissman was given his passport and some money and allowed to sleep on his own for the night.[28] His experience is startling when compared to the

24 John T. Weissman. "Testimony of Theophile Teddy Weissman, born in Arosa, Switzerland, 1919, regarding his experiences in Italy," interview by Aviva Kellerman, *Testimonies Department*, Yad Vashem Archives, July 20, 1992, File #6668, 1.

25 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 7.

26 James Walston, "History and Memory of the Italian Concentration Camps," *The Historical Journal* 40, no. 1 (1997): 170.

27 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 8-9.

28 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 9.

terrible stories of Jews packed inhumanely into cattle-cars or the forced death marches they took in Germany. He was lucky to have received the treatment he did, relative to the experiences of Jews in the rest of Europe. In Ferramonti, Weissman described the living conditions as beautiful, with plenty of leisure time.[29]

Walston discusses how although the Ferramonti camp did have barbed wire and constrained the individual's freedom, the internees enjoyed a large degree of self-government. At the beginning of its construction, the Ferramonti camp often lacked food and the conditions were harsh, but eventually life in the camp was tranquil and good relations existed between the internees and the Italian authorities.[30] In Weissman's time at the camp there were roughly over a thousand people interned: all non-Italians, nearly all Jews, with the exception of a few Yugoslavs. They had a clinic run by doctors who were also internees, and work at the camp was optional. Weissman discusses how the internees were obviously not granted the freedom to go where they wished, but if they did work, they could walk to the woods and build a canal. He describes it as a refreshing and peaceful experience, where the work was hard, but they could buy goods with their earnings, saying, "I believe we were better off than people of our own age in any other country at that time."[31]

Boyana Yakovlevich, a Jewish woman born in Belgrade, Yugoslavia, was also sent to the Ferramonti di Tarsia camp. Her father wanted to get their family out of Yugoslavia, away from German persecution. At the time, they had no concept of the treatment of Jews by Mussolini, which she later realized was much different from that of Hitler.[32] They wanted to escape to Egypt or even Palestine, but were they taken by the Italian Fascists to a concentration camp in Albania where the conditions were awful. The camp was full of Montenegrin families who had participated in an uprising against the Fascist Italian government. The sanitary conditions were bad, wire surrounded every barrack, and they were often without windows, doors, or water. Internment of Yugoslav and Montenegrin partisans by the Italian Fascist forces was quite normal, but they faced a problem when deciding where to put them. Many were taken to the concentration camp in Albania, and as the conflict between the partisans and Italy grew, so did the number of work camps.[33] Yakovlevich details her embark to Italy, in which she was one of three Jews taken from the Albanian camp to live in the Ferramonti di Tarsia camp.

From the beginning, she knew the conditions were much better than those in the previous camp, and the majority of people living in the camp were Jews. Yakovlevich describes how although wires and guards were all around, the barracks were smaller but nicer, with windows and doors; there was a communal water-fountain and

29 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 10.

30 Walston, "History and Memory," 171.

31 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 10.

32 Boyana, Yakovlevic, "Testimony of Boiana Iakoblevich, born in Belgrade, Yugoslavia, 1922, regarding her experiences in Durazzo camp, Ferramonti Di Tarsa camp and with Tito's partisans," interview by Miriam Aviezer. *Testimonies Department,* Yad Vashem Archives, April 4, 1994, File # 7266, 26.

33 Walston, "History and Memory," 174-175.

kitchen; it was larger and more sanitary; families had their own rooms with stoves; and men and women were separated.[34] She explains the curfew that was in place, until which the Jews could move around all day. At the time that Yakovlevich was interned there, there was a school where she could teach children, and a choir.[35] She resided in Ferramonti for 11 months.[36]

The experiences of the camps so far follow the theme laid out by James Walston: two camps, one typically outside of Italy, intended to subdue uprisings by foreign people, and the second, meant to save Jews from the persecution of Nazi Germany. The camps in Italy, as seen in the two primary sources, were more humane and cleaner, and prisoners had cordial interactions with the Italian police. However, these more peaceful and free concentration camps were not always the experience of Jews in Italy, specifically in the case of Trieste, which held the only extermination camp in Italy. The camp, Risiera di San Sabba, was first used as a transit camp in 1943, and then in 1944 crematoriums were created to exterminate Jews.

Besides the extermination camp and the work camps, Jewish people could live independently in Borgo Val di Taro, which was quite different from places like Ferramonti. In 1942, the Italians began to evacuate the Ferramonti camp and Yakovlevich's family used this opportunity to travel to her mother's cousin, in "libero confino," or "free imprisonment." The policy of the Italians was to allow families and relatives to live together in these "free confinement" conditions. Typically, a Jew had to apply to live with their relative, sister, or brother in these places and if they were accepted, they moved there.

Yakovlevich and her family moved to Pizzoli and then to Borgo Val di Taro, between Florence and Livorno. They were there from January 1943 until the capitulation of Italy on September 8th 1943, under the statutes of "Iternati Civili di Guerra," or civilian war internees.[37] She and her family had to check in with the police every day, but were allowed to live in a flat with Italian families and landladies, and they received some money from a Jewish organization that paid the Italians.[38] In this way, Jewish people enjoyed considerable freedom, more than even in Ferramonti or Macerata. In both Ferramonti and the "libero confinos," Jewish people were treated with relative humanity. In these "protection camps" they were not treated as animals or humiliated as such, but rather with dignity and respect. In Nazi German camps across Europe, this was not the case. Two Italian Jewish women deported from Rhodes, Clara Menasce and Laura Varon, experienced horrible atrocities at Auschwitz. It is important to note key aspects of life in a Nazi-run concentration camp in comparison to Italian camps. While this does not excuse Mussolini or the actions of the Fascist Italian police, it helps to explain why most Italian Jews that survived the Holocaust did so and the positive attitude of these survivors toward Italians, as opposed to Germans.

34 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 51.
35 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 52-53.
36 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 56.
37 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 56-57.
38 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 57.

On 16 August 1944, Clara Menasce arrived at Auschwitz after a trip of 20 days, left as one of the only survivors from Rhodes.[39] When they arrived, she remembers being shaved, completely undressed, and showered. They were given dresses with no shoes, leaving them unable to recognize one another. The miseries she experienced included roll call at 3 AM when it was cold and raining, soup and coffee thrown into their faces, sharing food in a bowl with four people and sleeping three people to a blanket, carrying bricks from one place to another, and being beaten by soldiers if there was dust on their dresses.[40] These are only a few of the inhumane actions against Jews in Nazi-run work camps like Auschwitz. In Hitler's eyes, Jewish people were inferior to Germans in every capacity, and thus treated like they were not human, rather as if they were animals. Menasce was forced to continue to other camps as the allies drew closer to Germany, and she almost died. Luckily, she was liberated by the Americans in Turkheim and saved.[41] The conditions of these German-run camps drastically contrast to experiences at the Italian ones, not specifically because Italians were nicer or better people, but because the Italian population was rarely in support of antisemitism and the atrocities rumored to occur abroad.

As previously discussed, the actions of the Italian government towards Jews evolved over the course of the war and were influenced by various factors. Initially, Italy enacted antisemitic Italian Racial Laws in 1938, which restricted the rights of Jewish citizens. However, these laws were not as extreme as those implemented by Nazi Germany. While discrimination against Jews most definitely occurred, the Italian government did not systematically pursue the mass extermination policies seen in other parts of Europe. Nonetheless, Italy did participate in the persecution of Jews and worked towards isolating them from Italian society. The climax of this persecution began in 1943, when Mussolini was arrested, and Italy signed an armistice with the Allies. Following the armistice, the German military occupied northern Italy and established the Italian Social Republic, a puppet state led by Mussolini. During this period, the situation for Jews in Italy became more perilous as the German authorities sought to implement their "Final Solution" across Europe: the mass extermination of Jewish people.

Despite the challenging circumstances, there were numerous instances in the testimonials of Jewish survivors of aid and support received from Italian community members. Many ordinary Italians, including some members of the clergy, resisted anti-Jewish policies and collaborated with the Italian resistance to help Jews escape persecution. The answer is not simple as to why Italian members of society worked to save Jewish people. There are numerous factors that went into decisions to aid and abet Jewish people in the face of persecution. Many Italians were simply anti-Fascist and thus against any policies implemented by the Fascist regime, including the Ra-

39 Clara, Menasce, "Testimony of Clara Menasce, born in Rhodes, Italy, 1923, regarding her experiences in Auschwitz, Landsberg, Kaufering, Tuerkheim and other places," interview by Jacqueline Ben-Atar, *Testimonies Department,* Yad Vashem Archives, October 19, 1984, File # 4318, 11.

40 Menasce, "Testimony Clara," 12-13.

41 Menasce, "Testimony Clara," 16.

cial Laws. Others felt sympathy and friendship towards their Jewish neighbors, having bonded over millenniums of shared history, or they simply were doing what they felt was right and could see the threatening measures implemented by the Germans. Two distinct groups of Italians who aided Jews emerge from archival testimonials. First, government workers and Carabiniere, and second, normal Italian citizens. Clara Menasce, a Jewish Holocaust survivor born in Rhodes, Italian-occupied Greece, discusses the treatment by Italians she experienced growing up in Rhodes. The Italians in Rhodes, according to Menasce, "were not antisemitic."[42] In fact, according to the author Anthony McElligott, the German authorities had been complaining that the Italians were preventing the implementation of anti-Jewish policies by providing little to no cooperation.[43] McElligott's work is one of few sources that discusses in detail scholarship on Jewish experiences in Rhodes leading up to and during the Holocaust. As Germans began to fully occupy Greece and its islands, they treated the Italian Jews in Rhodes as if they were Greek Jews. The Germans gathered the Jews in Rhodes into the Italian aviation barracks where they were kept for three days. Menasce remembers one Italian Bishop who was willing to put his job on the line in order to protect the Jewish people of Rhodes, taking them under his responsibility.[44]

Unfortunately, the Italians were outnumbered and held no power against the Germans in Rhodes. The governor had no way of saving those Jewish lives. His effort to, however, represents one of many Italian actions and sentiments towards the persecution and mistreatment of the Jews. Menasce describes how after the war, once she had been liberated, she resided at Innsbruck, Austria in a refugee camp. At the camp there were no survivors from Rhodes, only two sisters from Milan, one woman from Florence, and a few political prisoners.[45] Menasce remembers the Italian war prisoners protecting the Jewish women because they were the only Jews. There was a specific night where drunk American soldiers tried to bother the Jewish women, but the Italian soldiers protected them.[46] The bonding of the Italian prisoner soldiers and the Italian Jewish women brings to light a narrative not commonly discussed in scholarship on the history of Jews in Italy. Laura Varon, born in Rhodes, also discusses the aid of the Italian army, not for herself but her sister, Stella. Stella was left locked inside a cattle cart by Nazis in 1945, and many people froze and died inside the carts. She was lucky because there were Italian soldiers looking for survivors. Because Stella spoke Italian, she was able to draw their attention and communicate with them to let her and others still alive out of the cart.[47] Once free, she explained her story to the soldiers, who felt compassion for her and brought her back to Italy with them.[48]

---

42 Menasce, "Testimony Clara," 3.

43 Anthony McElligott, "The Deportation of the Jews of Rhodes, 1944: An Integrated History," *The Holocaust in Greece*, ed. Giorgos Antoniou and A. Dirk Moses (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2018), 71.

44 Menasce, "Testimony Clara," 8.

45 Menasce, "Testimony Clara," 17.

46 Menasce, "Testimony Clara," 20.

47 Varon, "Testimony Laura," 54.

48 Varon, "Testimony Laura," 55.

The aid of not only anti-fascist members of government but the different Italian soldiers demonstrates a shared community and understanding between the Italians and Italian Jews. The Italian resistance emerged after the fall of Mussolini's Fascist regime and the imposing threat of German occupation in the North. These partisan groups consisted of many Italians against the Fascist and Socialist policies and actions of Mussolini and Hitler. The Carabinieri was different from the "Camicie Nera" in the eyes of both Italian and foreign Jews. The Carabinieri was a law enforcement and military force generally involved in maintaining public order, carrying out criminal investigations, and providing support during wartime. Their actions concerning Jews varied, but only in some instances did individual Carabinieri members assist in enforcing anti-Semitic laws. The Carabinieri traditionally had a closer relationship with the civilian population, as they were involved in day-to-day policing and law enforcement activities. This may have contributed to a more positive public perception of the Carabinieri soldiers. The Camicie Nera, on the other hand, were the paramilitary force associated with the National Fascist Party. They were involved political violence and the enforcement of fascist policies, specifically in the implementation of discriminatory laws against Jews. As the Fascist era progressed and Italy faced internal challenges and military defeats, the influence of the regular military and police forces, including the Carabinieri, grew, while the significance of the Blackshirts diminished. Jewish Italians and foreigners were able to recognize the different treatment by the Italian police forces, specifically the Carabinieri, versus that of the Camicie Nera. Boyana Yakovlevich, a Jewish woman from Yugoslavia mentioned previously, vaguely defined the difference between the two. After being deported from Yugoslavia to a concentration camp in Albania, the Italians who occupied Albania at the time decided to move the Jews in the camp to Rome. Yakovlevich recalls the carabinieri commander giving a speech: "'You will cross the Adriatic, on the other side, and you will see a country known for its culture, for its humanity' and so on and so on…."[49]

The speech given by the Carabinieri is patriotic, nationalistic, and clearly asserting the better and safer treatment of Jews in Italy. As mentioned earlier, the concentration camps in Italy had two purposes. In the context of the commander's speech, the movement of Jews into Italy was meant for protection. Meanwhile in Ferramonti, the concentration camp Yakovlevich was transported to, an Italian black-shirt Fascist made a speech on the "safety" of the Jews in Italy: "When this commissar came, we tried to avoid the fascist way to raise the right hand. I remember his speech: 'What do you want? It is an honor for you that we allow you to have our salute. What would be with Germans? They would throw you down. You would go through the chimney.'"[50]

The values conveyed in this speech by a Fascist commander align more with Mussolini's approach to the treatment of Jews rather than the principles demonstrated by the Carabinieri. While the theme of protection by the Carabinieri is not universally applicable, it is also evident in the testimony of John Weissman. He distinctly recalls

49 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 46.
50 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 53.

that while in Castel Neuvodi Farfa (northeast of Rome) the Germans occupied the whole of Italy. The Carabinieri, or the Royal Police, were anti-fascist and protected the Jews in the camp.[51] Weissman also makes an interesting distinction between the Italian soldiers and the Germans. He says the Italians were not as obedient as the Germans, being very different in culture and values.[52] Author Michael A. Livingston explores two majorly mistaken beliefs when discussing the Racial Laws and the increased persecution of Jews in Italy in 1943 through his writing. Livingston identifies common reasons as to why the treatment of Jews in Italy was so different from other places. He argues that the difference between Italy and other places in Europe in terms of the treatment of Jews resulted from institutional differences in the organization and implementation of anti-Jewish campaigns. Italian culture, according to his research, has a history of disrespect for central authority and inconsistency in the implementation of laws.[53]

While this is a broad assumption of the people of Italy, elements of this character hold true. Weissman felt that the Italians who helped, knowing he was Jewish, did so because they were just helping against the threat of the Germans, regardless of what Mussolini wanted. In his experience, the people who helped him would have helped anyone in danger from the Germans. He had a unique experience in Italy because he lived among Italian people in Toffia, another small commune northeast of Rome. Weissman had received fake documents from a kind Italian family in Rome that stated he was "a volunteer working for the German Labor Service as a male nurse in the polyclinic in Rome."[54] These papers gave Weissman considerable freedom compared to other foreign Jews in Italy, and because he spoke both Italian and German, he was asked to be an interpreter for the Germans in Toffia. The town did not know Weissman was Jewish, but he trusted two Italians specifically, Martini and Blasi. He notes how he didn't understand why these men, and the couple who helped secure his illegal documentation, helped him: "All of them tried to help us all of the time, as much as possible. I don't know if this was because of political understanding, or because of a general feeling of 'help the underdog'. I don't think there was the idea of 'he is a Jew, we have to help him', it was more that of helping other human beings."[55]

This trend of aid on the part of Italian citizens, especially those with whom the Jews had grown close friendships, is also present in Yakovlevich's move to a "libero confino." In Borgotaro, situated in the North of Italy, Yakovlevich recalls Italian treatment of Jews. They were nice, especially with the young people who would go to parties and play games with them. Yakovlevich even gave French lessons to an Italian friend, until the Germans took control of the city and Yakovlevich and her family had

51 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 12.

52 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 24.

53 Michael A. Livingston, "Introduction: On the Historical Significance of the Leggi Razziali," *The Fascists and the Jews of Italy: Mussolini's Race Laws* (Studies in Legal History. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 1-2.

54 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 16-17.

55 Weissman, "Testimony Theophile," 22.

to escape to Rome.[56] Their Italian friends helped them obtain identity cards and flee Borgotaro.[57]

The exploration of Italian Jewish experiences during World War II in this paper provides a complex perspective on the interplay between fascism, antisemitism, civilian resistance, and the plight of a community caught in the turmoil of historical events. In contemplating the intricate narrative of Italian Jews during the rise of Nazism and fascist antisemitism, the themes of disbelief, assimilation, and the shattering of identity emerge as central motifs. The assimilation of Jews into Italian culture underscores a deep-rooted connection to the nation. The abrupt removal of Italian Jews from various spheres of life, the imposition of discriminatory measures, and the forced redefinition of their identity as solely Jewish shattered the perceived harmony and integration they had long experienced.

Further, the experiences of Jewish individuals in Italian concentration camps during World War II present an increasingly complex narrative of oppression, varying significantly from the brutalities witnessed in Nazi Germany. The testimonials of survivors, such as John Weissman, shed light on the nuanced nature of the Italian concentration camps. Weissman's experiences, from internment in Macerata and Ferramonti to the relative freedom and self-government in Ferramonti, highlight the diversity of conditions within these camps. The camps were categorized into those intended for repression and those for protection, with the latter serving as a refuge for Jewish individuals from the persecution orchestrated by Nazi Germany. The diverse experiences within Italian concentration camps reflect the varying approaches taken by the fascist regime.

The treatment of Jews by the Italian government during World War II was complex and evolved over time. Despite the challenging circumstances, numerous instances of aid and support from Italians, both ordinary citizens and government workers, are evident in survivor testimonials. Italian soldiers, especially the Carabinieri, demonstrated varying degrees of resistance against anti-Jewish policies, contributing to a more positive perception of their actions compared to the Blackshirts associated with the Fascist Party. The shared community and understanding between Italians and Jews became evident in various instances of assistance. The diversity of motivations among Italians who assisted Jewish individuals reflects the complexity of the historical context. The testimony of individuals like Clara Menasce, John Weissman, and Boyana Yakovlevich illustrates the multifaceted nature of Italian aid during this period. The Italians' resistance against anti-Jewish policies and their efforts to protect Jewish individuals contributed to a narrative of shared humanity in the face of persecution.

In essence, the history of Jews in Italy during this period reflects a spectrum of experiences, ranging from discrimination to acts of compassion and resistance. Ultimately, the study of Italian Jewish experiences during WWII underscores the need for a comprehensive and nuanced understanding of history—one that acknowledges

56 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 58.
57 Yakovlevich, "Testimony Boiana," 61.

the fluidity of ideologies, the varied responses of individuals and communities, and the intricate web of factors that shaped the destinies of those caught in the storm of war. As we reflect on this historical epoch, it becomes clear that Italy's wartime history is far from a monolithic tale, and the voices of Italian Jews serve as crucial threads in the intricate tapestry of World War II narratives.

It's Not Selfish to be Happy

[Davis Rowe]

We often find the goodness of moral actions dismissed if the person acting has something to gain from it. "You only donate to charity because it makes you feel good," or "You only are nice to your teachers because you want them to like you." Some feel that if an action makes us happy, it has less moral worth. I would content the opposite, that one's happiness and ability to be moral do not conflict with each other, and in acting morally, we also move towards our happiness. To argue this, I will be in conversation with three philosophical texts: Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics*, in which Aristotle outlines his theory of human telos and virtue.[1] Kant's *Grounding for the Metaphysics of Morals*, in which he argues for moral commands from reason and his categorical imperative.[2] And Lastly Macintyre's *After Virtue* in which he discusses our current inability to discuss morality in the modern day and argues bringing back elements of Aristotle's virtue.[3] Using these texts, I want to argue that personal happiness is not independent or opposed to moral behavior but is aligned with it. There are two main points I want to contend. First, in ethics, there is a distinction between human nature as-it-is and human nature as-it-could-be, or telos. Second, what is suitable for our eudaimonia is ultimately good for our community. In arguing this, I will unpack Macintyre's argument for the importance of *telos.* Then, look at how Kant articulates happiness in his non-teleological ethics and the problems that it brings. Lastly, look

1 Aristotle, W.D. Ross, et al., *Nicomachean Ethics* (Oxford World's Classics) (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

2 Immanuel Kant, et al., *Ethical Philosophy: The Complete Texts of Grounding for the Metaphysics of Morals and Metaphysical Principles of Virtue (Part II of the Metaphysics of Morals)* (Indianapolis: Hackett Pub. Co., 1983).

3 Alasdair Macintyre, *After Virtue: A Study in Moral Theory*, 3rd ed. (Notre Dame: Univ of Notre Dame Press, 2022).

at how Aristotle understands our telos as eudaimonia and how he communicates the relationship between our well-being and being a moral person.

Macintyre argues that we can only correctly discuss morality by thinking about it in a teleological framework. He says that when considering how human nature plays a role in ethics, there must be an understanding of telos, as it is what gives the contrasts between human nature "as-it-is" and human nature "as-it-could-be."[4] Human nature as-it-is desires what appears good for us. In contrast, human nature as-it-could-be desires what is *actually* good for us. Having the distinction of human nature as-it-could-be is crucial as otherwise, we only understand human nature as-it-is. This means we think of human nature as desiring only what appears to be good for us. Macintyre says there should be three elements to any schema of ethics, "the conception of untutored human nature, the conception of the precepts of rational ethics, and the conception of human nature as it could be if it realized its telos."[5] If any of these three elements are to be intelligible, they must reference the other two.[6] By removing this teleological thinking, we can only understand human nature as a force that does not align with moral behavior. Enlightenment moral theorists were "inheriting a set of moral injunctions on the one hand and a conception of human nature on the other which had been expressly designed to be discrepant with each other."[7] The other consequence of losing teleological thinking is that ethics doesn't have an end it is moving toward. If you do not have a conception of human nature as-it-could-be, then you view human nature as something that could only be independent or counter to what is moral.

Kant does not share this mindset, for him happiness and human nature cannot be aligned with what is moral. Happiness is either tangential to what is moral or works against it. Kant does say that "to secure one's own happiness is a duty (at least indirectly)." but the reason he thinks this is because, in a state of unhappiness, there might "become a great temptation to transgress one's duties."[8] This passage gets to the heart of how Kant views happiness. Personal happiness is not good in and of itself. It is good only in so far as being unhappy might cause someone to not abide by their duties. Kant also articulates that happiness can get in the way of being moral if not accompanied by a desire to align with duty. Kant said that the conditions "that complete well-being and contentment with one's conditions which is called happiness make for pride – unless there is a good will to correct their influence."[9] Continuing with this, Kant says that actions have the most moral worth if done without inclination and only to align with duty. If someone acts "solely from duty, then for the first time his action has genuine moral worth."[10] But actions that come solely from duty may not even be possible according to Kant, as "there cannot with certainty be at all inferred – that

4 Macintyre, *After Virtue,* 52.
5 Macintyre, *After Virtue,* 53.
6 Macintyre, *After Virtue,* 53.
7 Macintyre, *After Virtue,* 55.
8 Kant, *Grounding*, 12.
9 Kant, *Grounding*, 7.
10 Kant, *Grounding*, 11.

some secret impulse of self-love, merely appearing as the idea of duty."[11] To summarize, for Kant, happiness only has moral worth as far as it affects our ability to accord with duty, and actions have more moral worth if done without any sort of personal inclination and only for the sake of duty.

However, it is important to note that how Kant articulates happiness differs from how Aristotle uses the term. Aristotle's happiness is a translation of the word "eudaimonia." Though eudaimonia is often translated as happiness, eudaimonia is not an emotion in the way we think that happiness is. Instead, he talks about long-term well-being. As Aristotle says, "one day, or a short time, does not make a man blessed and happy."[12] I don't think that Kant uses the term the same way Aristotle does. In one passage, Kant says about duty that "we find that the more a cultivated reason devotes itself to the aim of enjoying life and happiness, the further does man get away from true contentment."[13] Here, human happiness and "contentment" are seen as opposed things, rather than contentment just being a factor of happiness. Also, Kant is not saying that you act according to duty so you can be content, but instead that it will come as a consequence.

For Aristotle, unlike Kant, happiness is not only aligned with what is good, what is good is happiness. Aristotle articulates the idea of moving towards our telos of eudaimonia as the ultimate good, and our eudaimonia depends on our ability to be virtuous within our community. As articulated earlier, Aristotle thinks that "every action and choice, is thought to aim at some good."[14] This does not mean that every action achieves good, but it is always done intending it. And this good that Aristotle thinks all actions aim at is eudaimonia. Aristotle believes our telos is eudaimonia because it is something that we "always choose for itself and never for the sake of something else," and all other goods we aim for, such as honor, pleasure, or reason, are incidental to our aim of eudaimonia.[15] Aristotle says that eudaimonia comes "as a result of virtue and some process of learning or training."[16]And the way that you move towards your eudaimonia is by practicing the virtues. Virtues are "a state of character concerned with choice, lying in a mean."[17] These virtues are habits you practice; if you practice them and put them into action, they will move you toward eudaimonia. These virtues include courage, honesty, friendliness, and others. But for Aristotle, it is not enough to practice the virtues, for if you truly hold them, you will enjoy them. Aristotle says, "the man who does not rejoice in noble actions is not even good; since no one would call a man just who did not enjoy acting justly."[18] This passage in particular serves as an interesting dichotomy to Kant's thinking. For Kant, an action has the most moral worth if it is done without being motivated by inclination, while for Aristotle,

11 Kant, *Grounding*, 19.
12 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1098a.
13 Kant, *Grounding*, 8.
14 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1094a.
15 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1097b.
16 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1099b.
17 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1107a.
18 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1099a.

an action has the most moral worth if it is a part of your inclination.
The difference between these two is that for Aristotle, happiness is good in and of itself; it is why you act morally. This contrasts with Kant's system, in which happiness is valuable only tangentially. The aims of morality and happiness are aligned with Aristotle's system. Aristotle articulates that you cannot live a selfish life and be cruel to others and then think of your life as fulfilling. To live good, fulfilling, happy lives, we must be good to others and have good relationships with others. The aim for eudaimonia may be seen as "selfish," but it's simply stating that what is good for your eudaimonia and what is good for others are not separate from each other but on the same path.

I would now like to look at particular examples to demonstrate why a teleological structure of eudaimonia does not conflict with what is good for others. An example is what Kant calls beneficence and what Aristotle calls liberality. Both articulate that it is good to give to others. They both have passages dealing with why this is good. Though they come to a similar result, I think Aristotle's manifestation is more sustainable and articulates well why giving is good for others and yourself. For Kant, beneficence is a duty. You give to others despite what your inclination may tell you as you could not will that refusing to give to those in need should "become a universal law of nature."[19] What Kant articulates here is that most of the time, we don't have the drive to give what we have to those who need it more, and we should try to overcome this inclination and align with our duty. This is a fine manifestation but is based on understanding human nature as-it-is, not as-it-could-be. Kant only understands that our human nature as-it-is does not want to give to others. And not that perhaps our human nature as-it-could-be, does desire to be beneficent. And again, Kant says actions have the most moral worth if they work against inclination. So, a person giving to others for their own pleasure is of less moral value than someone who gives despite not wanting to. Aristotle articulates this idea similarly with his virtue of liberality, which he states as someone who "will give to the right people, the right amounts, and at the right time."[20]Aristotle says this is necessary for our happiness as if someone "happens to spend in a manner contrary to what is right and noble, he will be pained."[21] As stated before, it is not enough in Aristotle's system to perform the actions correctly. They must also be enjoyed by the person performing them. He says, "It is the mark of virtue to be pleased and pained at the right objects and in the right way."[22] Both Kant and Aristotle articulate that it is good to be generous and give to others, but what Aristotle has that Kant doesn't is this conception of telos. For Kant, our duty must be performed despite our inclinations. Aristotle has the notion of telos and human nature as-it-could-be. He recognizes that when we are not generous with our money, we feel guilty and do not feel we are using our money well. So, what is good for our telos of eudaimonia is to be generous. This connects to the broader point

19 Kant, *Grounding*, 32.
20 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1120a.
21 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1121a.
22 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1121a.

that, for Aristotle, our happiness and what is good for others do not conflict with each other, and what is good for us is also good for others.

I next want to look at how Kant and Aristotle understand friendship differently. Of course, Kant only has one line on friendship that is used as an example to demonstrate a larger idea, but it still helps demonstrate and interesting point. Kant says, "though there might never yet have been a sincere friend, still pure sincerity in friendship is nonetheless required of every man." [23] This example is used to demonstrate Kant's point that moral commands are absolute, whether or not they have ever been actualized. But again, Kant's lack of teleological thinking creates a challenge. If it is impossible to realize sincere friendship, then there is no end its moving towards. I also argue it misunderstands where the value of friendship lies. Aristotle acknowledges the importance of good friendships for a life of eudaimonia. He starts his book on friendship by saying that "without friends no one would choose to live."[24] What Aristotle communicates is that friendship is not about sacrificing yourself for the sake of your friendship. Being a good friend should not run counter to your happiness, but rather go alongside it. Aristotle argues that the happiness that comes from friendship "seems to lie in loving rather than being loved."[25] Aristotle says that we do get pleasure from caring for the people that we are close to, that being kind to others is good for our eudaimonia. Here, we see the importance of understanding telos as eudaimonia, and the role friends play in ethics. Human nature as-it-is, may simply seek friends for personal or short-term gain. But human nature as-it-could-be recognizes that a life where you are caring and loving in your relationships is a more fulfilling and happy life.

In conclusion, happiness, and our ability to be good to others are not contrary forces but are working towards the same end. This relies on the Aristotelian idea of telos, as it can articulate the difference between human nature as-it-is, and human nature as-it-could-be. Human nature as-it-is desires what it believes will bring happiness, while human nature as-it-could-be desires what will actually bring happiness. Because Kant does not have a conception of telos, he views human desire for happiness as necessary only tangentially to morality. Aristotle can articulate that we do have an end, and this end is our eudaimonia. What is good for our eudaimonia is ultimately good for others as well. We live in communities with other people, and if we are not kind to those other people, then it will affect our own eudaimonia. Every so often, I hear discussions from friends and family about whether "true altruism" exists. Can someone perform an action that is motivated purely by selfless means? Whether the answer to this is yes or no, does it matter? Why should an action have less moral value if it is enjoyed or makes the person doing it happy? We find it is in our happiest moments that we are best equipped to help others, and in our saddest moments, we rely the most upon others. To commit to your happiness and well-being is not wrong or self-centered. Because what is good for your well-being is also what makes you best equipped to be kind and caring to the people who need you.

---

23 Kant, *Grounding*, 20.

24 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1142a.

25 Aristotle, *Nicomachean Ethics*, 1159b.

A G.U.N. To Their Heads

The Faux Feminism of SA2

[Tobi Tontic]

The inciting incident of Sonic Adventure 2 (SA2) concerns the murder of a 12-year-old girl, shot dead just off-screen in a CIA cover-up of illegal genetic experiments. Shortly after, the plot proper begins when a 3-foot talking hedgehog is branded a terrorist, leaps from a helicopter, and snowboards down the sloping streets of San Francisco with the American military in hot pursuit. To call this game "inconsistent" seems an understatement. To call it feminist is absurd. Yet, that's what I thought for many years, misled by the notion that female involvement equals female empowerment. Released in 2001, SA2 follows the basic structure of a cheesy action flick, occasionally veering into ill-advised bouts of existentialist philosophy. But it's just this reckless disregard for tone and logic that drew me to it when I was nine. My favorite part was the brash, rebellious cast of characters who acted against one another, following clashing motivations to move the story forward. Much of this conflict arises between male and female characters engaging in rivalries. SA2 is a game where male motivations are valorized and females' trivialized, reinforcing the dominant ideology or "hegemony" of the broader culture, despite an apparent feminist lean.[1] I will examine the character dynamics of Sonic/Amy, whose motivations for adventuring display a cliché pattern of masculine action and feminine reaction. Then Rouge/Knuckles, whose visual design recreates potentially harmful stereotypes of ideal men and women. To perform this analysis, I will engage a radical feminist framework described by Deanna Sellnow as criticizing how the dominant culture struggles to keep women in their prescribed social roles and undermines attempts to escape by displaying characters who are unusual or unhappy and traditionally masculine roles and maintaining a male-focused perspective for an assumed male audience, in what's called the "male

1 Deanna Sellnow, *The Rhetorical Power of Popular Culture: Considering Mediated Texts* (Orlando: University of Central Florida, 2017), 139.

gaze."[2] An arrangement which, as you might imagine, plays out poorly for the girls in the game, and in the audience.

This boy-centrism manifests in Sonic (the aforementioned snowboarder), Knuckles (a long-time frenemy), and other male characters, who facilitate the narrative, Sonic rebelling against the stifling authoritarianism of the Guardian Unit of Nations (G.U.N), and Knuckles, stoic protector of the plot pivotal Master Emerald. Both are aggressive, rude, and independent, consistently portrayed as radical and heroic, someone the assumed audience of teenage boys should look up to and emulate. They are the game's primary models—characters who demonstrate appropriate or desirable behavior—and although everyone in SA2 carries a theme of rebellion against hegemonic control when female characters participate, things do not go well.

Before examining the character pairs, I must address Maria, the only true model offered to the female audience. She is a perfect little angel who lays down her life for a friend and, thus, is dead before the game begins. We know her entirely through the reminiscence of males. She's a prop to give the moodier and broodier characters something to be sad about. Thankfully, the other girls are much livelier, but they each fall short of Maria's example.

Amy Rose debuted in 1992 as the pink girl to Sonic's blue boy. Much like him, she is an energetic and hot-tempered traveler. By visual comparison, we can see that Amy's rendition of hedgehog is noticeably more human-esque. She is fully clothed and fashionable, wearing chunky bracelets and keeping her quills down with a hairband. While one must look to Sonic's impetuous manner to understand his teenhood, Amy is unmistakably 12. Her design is preoccupied with assuring viewers that she is a little girl and denies her any room to express the untamable nature she shares with her counterpart.

While Sonic trots the globe in search of adventure and to defend the innocent, Amy does so in literal pursuit of her crush, who couldn't want anything less to do with girls. She inserts herself into SA2's plot as an unwanted tagalong who twice jeopardizes the heroes' mission by getting herself captured. Boy crazy to the point of blindness, she throws herself into the arms of the enemy in her introductory scene, mistaking another character for Sonic simply because he, too, is a male hedgehog. Once rescued, she spends most of the game whining that the boys never take her seriously, and she's right. The cast consistently dismisses her involvement by speaking over her or ordering her around. Near the finale, she is rescued from gunpoint in the same room where Maria was killed. These characters have nothing in common but their gender, yet the game considers them interchangeable.

The radical feminist perspective tells us to look out for when female characters are portrayed as incapable or unhappy, taking actions reserved for men.[3] Amy ends up more of an anti-model than most of the bad guys. Distrusted by and detrimental to her friends, Amy is mocked for the same rebellious attitude and emotional outbursts

2 Sellnow, *The Rhetorical Power of Popular Culture*, 145.
3 Sellnow, *The Rhetorical Power of Popular Culture*, 146.

that earn Sonic and Knuckles admiration. She is allowed to come along but denied meaningful participation, reifying the hegemonic idea that women should stay in their lane, as their dreams are too silly to qualify as real motives.

If Amy were allowed substantial sympathy, she might take away from the real centerpiece of the female cast: brand-new anti-heroine Rouge the Bat. A jewel-obsessed thief and secret agent, she works with G.U.N to sabotage the heroes and villains alike while scheming to swipe the Master Emerald from under everyone's nose. She amazed me as a child by being the most active female character I'd ever seen in a video game. In contrast to someone like Super Mario's Princess Peach, whose role as a zero-agency kidnapping victim borders on literal objectification—keeping her experiences well out of the viewers' mental reach, Rouge has a role in every part of the story. And since she is a playable character, I was encouraged to experience her trials and victories as my own, which I did.

Conceived as a morally ambiguous foil to the simple-minded and straight-shooting Knuckles, she's every bit as tough, able to tear down giant battle mechs with a single kick and stand up to blows that even Sonic himself would struggle to withstand. He's gullible; she's a liar. He uses claws to dig under the earth; she uses wings to take to the sky. He guards the mystic secrets of an ancient tribe, driven by a sense of honor, and she's a tech-savvy spy who steals for her own gain. Their whole dynamic is a "gender war," perpetuating the idea that men and women are natural opposites and must come to blows over it.[4]

And it is Rouge who ends up cast in an unfavorable light. She is portrayed as much more intelligent and agile than her rival (leaning on the stereotype that men are meatheads), but she is consistently his moral inferior. Despite her competence, confidence, and physical prowess, one cannot ignore that she is motivated by a vain pursuit of jewelry—again utilizing this idea that what women want is simply a trivial reflection of men's more noble pursuits. Knuckles spends much of his dialogue in SA2 chastising her greed. Her potential as a model is undermined by an occluded reading. No matter how impressed I might've been, the text positions her as irregular and her life as undesirable and reinforces hegemonic beliefs by passively encouraging young girls to stay out of the fray.

Rouge's design fits comfortably in the trope of kid-friendly femme fatales like Cat Woman, complete with high heels, make-up, and a prominent bosom to cushion the blow to the male ego her competence creates. And when she ends up falling for the man who's spent the whole game insulting her and punching her in the face, what started as a character with a strong case for liberal feminist appeals for equality and inclusion is safely packed away inside patriarchal assumptions about the fickleness of the female mind.[5]

This analysis cannot capture the total significance of Sonic Adventure 2 or even its feminist implications. I have been unable to analyze the male characters as thor-

4 Catherine Palczewski and Victoria DeFrancisco, *Gender in Communication: A Critical Introduction* (Thousand Oaks: Sage, 2019), 4-5.

5 Sellnow, *The Rhetorical Power of Popular Culture*, 143-144.

oughly as I would wish, and several remain excluded. However, the treatment of Amy, Maria, and Rouge is sufficient to highlight sexist patterns in the narrative. At every turn they are used as points of contrast against men, more or less denied the ability to stand on their own. Amy's radical spirit is quashed by a damsel plot, Rouge's independence is watered down by romance, and poor Maria is just a prop. As a boy, I saw these characters as exceptions to a rule of female passivity, finally able to be strong, important, actors. But while the boys fight against the tyranny and save the day, the girls lag behind. Hegemony won the day, and, in the end, all three were under the G.U.N.

[Premodern Identities]

Renaissance Women

A Historiography

[Riley Groark]

The art of the Renaissance has fascinated people for centuries. The great figures that people typically associate with the era are the male artists, such as Leonardo Da-Vinci and Raphael. There are very few female figures that come to mind when thinking about the Italian Renaissance, other than the women depicted within the works of the male artists. Despite their lack of representation in public history, women played a large role in the history of the Renaissance and have been increasingly studied by historians for many years. In this paper, I will be examining how the study of women in the Renaissance has significantly changed over the past few centuries, including looking at the few authors who have set a lasting precedent in the field through their works. First, I will provide context on the Italian Renaissance, as most of the historiography on this topic focuses in on the Italian Renaissance at one point or another. Next, I will introduce Jacob Burckhardt and his misogynistic contribution to the field as the earliest author I will be looking at. After this, I will be examining Joan Kelly's feminist contribution to the field, *Did Women Have a Renaissance?*, and her opinion regarding Burckhardt's work. Finally, I will be looking at modern perspectives on Joan Kelly's work using Theresa Coletti as a measure to the current state of the study of women in the Renaissance.

Today, the Renaissance holds an almost mythological place within the minds of people. Originally coined by Giorgio Vasari, an Italian art historian, the term "the Renaissance" was made to describe the phenomenon of the rebirth of artistry that he was witnessing happen during his time. It was not until the nineteenth century that the meaning of the term "Renaissance" expanded to define an all-encompassing period of great change in culture and politics.[1] Rather than just relating to the art of great painters and artists, such as Michaelangelo, the Renaissance encompassed greater movements,

1 E. R. Chamberlin, *The World of the Italian Renaissance* (New York: Routledge, 1982), 2-3.

such as nationalization and humanism. E. R. Chamberlin, focusing on the Italian Renaissance, argues that the Renaissance was "an Italian phenomenon," which began in approximately 1300 CE and lasted until approximately the mid-sixteenth century.[2] In spite of this, due to how broad the label of the Renaissance is, many historians have different opinions on the range of time that is included within the Renaissance. Some historians date the Renaissance starting as early as the eleventh century, and lasting to as late as the late sixteenth century and occasionally even beyond that period.[3]

For many years, Jacob Burckhardt's *The Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy* was a vital reading for those studying the Renaissance. Burckhardt was a professor of History at Basel University, located in Basel, Switzerland.[4] His book was published in 1860 and it became known for not using historical documentation as sources, but rather Jacob's own intuition about the era as a source. This process had the historian attempting to put himself into the mindset and spirit of those of the historical era, using imagination to illuminate the work. Using this process, Burckhardt wrote his book from a top-down perspective, looking at the lives of the elite and their cultural history. This perspective contributed to the magical and mythological perspective of the Renaissance, further allowing later authors to aggrandize the various aspects of the era such as the people and the aesthetics.[5] Overall, Burckhardt's work was very formative to the historical study of the Renaissance.

Within his book, Burckhardt briefly discusses the lives of women and the power that they hold within society. He argues that "women stood on a footing of perfect equality with men."[6] This statement clearly states Burckhardt's belief that women were equal in all ways to men in the Renaissance. He supports his belief by explaining that "the education given to women in the upper classes was essentially the same as that given to men."[7] For Burckhardt, the education of women, and even more importantly their literacy, was the main factor in determining their equality. The majority of the support Burckhardt provides to support his belief of equality between men and women relates to the writing talent that women have. For example, in regard to poetry authored by women he states, "even the love-sonnets and religious poems are so precise and definite in their character […] we should not hesitate to attribute them to male authors, if we had not clear external evidence to prove the contrary."[8] Within this quote, Burckhardt argues that women's writing was up to the standard of the men's writing. Burckhardt also examines the writings of Caterina Sforza declaring her heroism for defending Forli and keeping the providence within her rule for a long time.[9] To Burckhardt, women gain power from their writing skills that allow them to

2 Chamberlin, 294-295.
3 Chamberlin, 299.
4 Chamberlin, 3.
5 Chamberlin, 3-4.
6 Jacob Burckardt, "Equality of Men and Women," in *Civilization of the Renaissance in Italy*, translated by S. G. C. Middlemore (Kitchener: Batoche Books Books, 2001), 317.
7 Burckardt, 318.
8 Burckardt, 318.
9 Burckardt, 320.

hold their own with men.

While Burckhardt was arguing that men and women were equal, it is clear that his definition of equality is not the same as today. This is exemplified by his words, "there was no question of 'women's rights' or female emancipation, simply because the thing itself was a matter of course," and, "these women had no thought of the public; their function was to influence distinguished men, and to moderate male impulse and caprice," both in the same paragraph.[10] He goes from arguing that women had rights and were emancipated to stating that women didn't even want to participate in the public sphere, rather they wanted to support their husbands from the background. Burckhardt's bias as a white man living in the mid-nineteenth century is very clearly defined within these quotations. Through Burckhardt's writing it can be presumed that men of his time idealized the separation of women from the public sphere. For him, it was even a marvel that women wrote as well as men. Within his writing, Burckhardt shows that he believes that women are naturally less than men, despite arguing otherwise.

Writing almost a century after Burckhardt, Joan Kelly ushered in a new way of thinking in how to study the women of the Renaissance. Joan Kelly was a history professor at City College of New York. Writing in the 1970s, Kelly's views were influenced by the women's movement and the ideas of feminism and feminist expression. Her 1977 essay, *Did Women Have a Renaissance?,* was made to discuss the Renaissance from the vantage point of women, a topic that had been barely touched upon before, as Burckhardt's "traditional view of the equality of Renaissance women with men" dominated the history of women in the Renaissance.[11] Kelly argues against Burckhardt claiming that women were not equal to men in the Renaissance, rather women lost power that they had previously held during the Medieval era. Gauging the loss of power that women went through, Kelly uses four criteria, "the regulation of female sexuality," "women's economic and political roles," "cultural roles of women in shaping the outlook of their society," and "ideology about women."[12] In evaluating these four topics, Kelly examines the role of courtly love in the medieval era, the shifting role of the Renaissance lady within societal power structures, and the ideal of chastity in the Renaissance.

Courtly love is a medieval literary romance genre in which noblewomen and a knight would pursue a relationship, usually extramarital on the behalf of the noblewomen. As explained by Kelly, "medieval courtly love, closely bound to the dominant values of feudalism and the church, allowed in a special way for the expression of sexual love by women."[13] The power structure of feudalism influenced the genre with its philosophies of gift giving and vassalage. Those higher in power would give gifts to others in exchange for their vassalage, or servitude. Within the medieval courtly love

10 Burckardt, 319.

11 Joan Kelly, "Did Woman Have a Renaissance?," in *Woman, History & Theory: The Essays of Joan Kelly* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1984), 19, 47.

12 Kelly, 20.

13 Kelly, 22.

knight courtiers owe services to women as vassals owe services to their feudal lords. Women would give the gift of her love to the knight while he promised her homage, by serving her and fulfilling her wants and needs. In this way, "homage signified male service, not domination or subordination of the lady."[14] The homage of the knights in this genre acknowledged the sexual and affectionate needs of women[15] in a way that was acknowledged little within the medieval Christian context. Within medieval courtly love women were depicted as real humans with the power to satisfy their own wants and needs, rather than simply being depicted into a stereotypical role as either a saint or a seductress.

The representation of women in the medieval courtly love genre provides a direct contrast to Burckhardt's depiction of women whose "function was to influence distinguished men."[16] Kelly's depiction of medieval noblewomen instead describes women as distinguished noblewomen being served by the knight who was in turn influencing her to acknowledge her own needs. In contrast, Kelly's depiction of the Renaissance lady aligns more closely with Burckhardt's depiction of women, though Kelly does not have the same misogynistic undertone in her writing as Burckhardt. Using the writings of Castiglione and other Italian Renaissance writers, Kelly shows the shift in the depiction of women within literature. She explains the great importance of Castiglione's work on love and manners within the Renaissance, and how his work broke away from the medieval courtly love tradition. She focuses on two of his love theories, the connection between love and marriage and the "Neo-Platonic notion of spiritual love."[17] Castiglione believed that there should be love within marriage, that love must lead to marriage and stay within its bonds.[18] While he argued for fidelity in both men and women, he wrote much less strictly about the chastity of men than the chastity of women.[19] Castiglione did not acknowledge the sexual and affectionate needs of women as had been done in medieval courtly love romances and instead played a role in normalizing the double standard between men and women[20]. Even within the Renaissance courtly love genre, intercourse was avoided for the fear of conception was so high at the time, directly contrasting the medieval "lack of concern about legitimacy."[21] For love outside of marriage, rather than the extramarital affairs of courtly love, Castiglione endorsed spiritual love. Within spiritual love, a lover's goal is to ascend in awareness to understand himself, gain universal intellect, and eventually have his soul find "supreme happiness in divine love."[22] Though, even this journey is largely kept to men as is supposedly the beauty of women that inspires men to as-

14 Kelly, 23.
15 Kelly, 27.
16 Burckardt, "Equality of Men and Women," 319.
17 Kelly, "Did Woman Have a Renaissance?," 40.
18 Kelly, 39.
19 Kelly, 41.
20 Kelly, 40.
21 Kelly, 28, 42.
22 Kelly, 40.

cend.[23] It is here where we see that the Renaissance ideal for women is as influencers of men simply through their existence and external beauty.

Kelly also briefly covers the life of Caterina Sforza and how she fits into the role of a Renaissance lady. While Burckhardt argues that Caterina Sforza is heroic and a good woman for how she was almost as good as a man would be at her job, Kelly takes her story to look at how the importance of legitimacy played a role in the power Sforza held. According to Kelly, Caterina Sforza was able to inherit and rule her principality in Naples due to the importance of legitimacy and feudal tradition, rather than her talent or influence.[24] After a series of many deaths and assassinations within her family, despite being illegitimate, Sforza was able to take power of Forli as a regent for her son. At this point her capability and talent in politics was clear as she "ruled because she mustered superior force and exercised it personally, and to the end she had to exert repeatedly the skill, forcefulness, and ruthless ambition that brought her to power."[25] In spite of her power, after a heroic defense Sforza was divested of power after her uncle, the Duke of Milan, refused to support her.[26] As an illegitimate daughter, Caterina Sforza never even came close to ruling the Duchy of Milan, despite being the daughter of an heir to the Duchy. While the rule was usurped from her half-brother by her uncle, Caterina Sforza was instead married off to the nephew of the pope. It was only by chance and numerous deaths that she was able to gain the political power that she did hold, despite her talent.

While Kelly agrees with Burckhardt on some topics of the lives of women in the Renaissance, they completely disagree with the way women held power. Burckhardt argued that women gained power in the Renaissance due to how similar their education was to men. This allowed for women to have a writing style that was almost as good as men's writing showing that women held power and influence in the Renaissance. While Kelly agrees that men and women had very similar educations, she argues that education was no longer the primary occupation for women. Instead, women had to be charming. A lady had to be pleasing to men. Kelly argues that the role of a lady was aestheticized, pushing her away from doing unbecoming activities such as handling weapons and riding horses.[27] This can be seen in how women's beauty was used as an instrument for men in understanding the Neoplatonic universal intelligence and divine love. Within Kelly's view of the Renaissance, women were no longer treated as a person, rather women were treated as tools for men in a highly patriarchal society.[28]

Like Burckhardt, Kelly's writing has provided a long-lasting impact on the study of women in the Renaissance inspiring decades of scholarship on the topic, including Theresa Coletti's *"Did Women Have a Renaissance?" A Medievalist Reads*

23 Kelly, 40-41.
24 Kelly, 31.
25 Kelly, 32.
26 Kelly, 32.
27 Kelly, 33.
28 Kelly, 39.

Joan Kelly and Aemilia Lanyer. Coletti was a Medievalist English professor at the University of Maryland who recently retired in 2021. Her essay was published in the journal *Early Modern Women* in a 2013 forum addressing the work of Joan Kelly. The essay examines how Kelly's work might be different if she had published in 2013 and how the topic has been nuanced over the years.[29] One of the largest changes that Coletti proposes would be in the periodization of Kelly's essay. Coletti points out that Kelly is using the Burckhardtian formulation in which the Italian Renaissance was brought about by political, social, and economic developments between 1350 and 1530 C.E., allowing for a sharp division between the medieval era and the Renaissance.[30] With additional research and study, this division in Kelly's essay provided an outline for the new temporal divide of the "transition from medieval feudal society to the early modern state."[31] This does not mean though that Kelly's essay provided a new definite periodization, but rather she provided a new way of thinking about periodization as the boundaries within the temporal categories are extremely fraught.[32] Coletti even goes so far as to suggest that Kelly might not even use the terminology the "Renaissance" as the word carries "cultural and ideological freight."[33] In her essay, Colletti tends to opt to use the term early modern to describe the period that Kelly is claiming as the Renaissance, showing her reluctance to use the term "Renaissance."

In looking at how the changes of periodization would change Kelly's essay, Colletti focuses on women's literary culture. Looking at the early modern period, Colletti claims that there was an "increased volume of women's writing […] and greater numbers of known, named women authors,"[34] something that is not touched upon by Kelly. This increase in women's writing aligns with the Burckhardt praises of women writers, as more works from this period would have been available for him to read due to the invention of print in the early modern period and "persistence of manuscript culture."[35] Colletti also comments on the religious literature Kelly did not include within her essay due to the scope of her analysis focusing on secular elites. To Colletti this is a major resource of texts by women that were overlooked.[36] Colletti finds great importance and respect for Kelly's work, but she believes it is important to note the changes within the field of history and how they impact Kelly's essay.

In examining women in the Renaissance, all three authors provided analysis of the lives and power of women that aligned with the time that they wrote. Burckhardt, writing in the 1860s, provided an account that depicted women as happily subservient to their husbands, by choice. The power that women held was as much as they could influence their husbands, but they were still equal due to their equal edu-

29 Theresa Coletti, ""Did Women Have a Renaissance?" A Medievalist Reads Joan Kelly and Aemilia Lanyer" *Early Modern Women: An Interdisciplinary Journal* 8 (2013): 249.

30 Coletti, 250.

31 Coletti, 250.

32 Coletti, 251.

33 Coletti, 251.

34 Coletti, 252.

35 Coletti, 252.

36 Coletti, 253.

cation. To Burckhardt, the best aspect of women in the Renaissance was their writing, as it was almost indistinguishable from the writing of men. This misogynistic representation of women in the Renaissance was depicted within the social lens of the 1860s where women were seen as less than men. This view is clearly shown within Burckhardt's writing. Kelly wrote a century later than Burckhardt, during the 1970s women's movement. Due to this, Kelly introduced a feminist flair to her essay. Rather than following Burckhardt in defining women by their relationship to how close they were to men, Kelly instead came up with a system to define and gauge women's power within society. Also, unlike Burckhardt, Kelly argued that women had lost power in the Renaissance with the shift from socially acceptable marital affairs in the medieval period to the strict legitimacy and fidelity focused social setting in the Renaissance. Writing in 2013, Colletti provided a much more nuanced assessment of Kelly's essay. While she largely agrees with Kelly's argument, she believes that her essay could be more nuanced, particularly when compared to more modern scholarship. Rather than looking at the status of women, Colletti is examining the periodization within Kelly's essay and comparing it to more modern theory. To Colletti the change in periodization could further strengthen Kelly's essay, as it would help define the changes in women's literature. Overall, all three authors provide distinct and constrictive arguments that help the author examine both the time period they are writing about, and the time period they are writing in.

Within all three of the works examined in this essay, there is a common theme of literature. Burckhardt's focus on women's education and his approval of the writing of women provides the basis of his argument of women's equality to men. Kelly focuses on the changes in the courtly love literary genre as a way of measuring women's sexual freedom. Colletti's argument is formed around the importance of women's literary culture in providing periodization between the medieval era and the early modern period. Literature seems to be an integral piece within the current study of women in the Renaissance.

As literature is a common theme within the study of women in the Renaissance, I propose that the future of the field may look further into adding material culture and archaeology within their studies. While literature is quite important, if not necessary, to studying early modern and pre-modern contexts, having material culture could add another layer to examine the changes in power of early modern women. Is the expense or style of jewelry that noblewomen wore in any way related to their status and power? Is where women's rooms are positioned within their residence related to the power within their family, or outside of their family? I believe that looking into the changes in medieval and early modern material culture could provide new arguments for how women's power changed going into the Renaissance and early modern era.

In conclusion, the study of women in the Renaissance has greatly changed over the past few centuries. Starting with Jacob Burckhardt in the 1860s, the "field" was limited to a misogynistic subsection of a chapter in a book. Over a century later, Joan Kelly attempted to write a history of women in the Renaissance where the women and their experience were the focus of the essay. Forty years after Kelly, Theresa

Colletti questions the use of the title Renaissance itself, instead opting for the use of the early modern era. The field has rapidly grown and changed from its origins 150 years ago and I hope it will continue to grow and explore the lives of women who were overlooked for so long.

The King of Tars

Portrayals of Blackness and Islamic Ignorance

[Nicholas Urich]

In this paper, I will be exploring the interpretations of blackness and religious identity in medieval literature through an engagement with the early 14th-century poem *The King of Tars*.[1] I will give some background on the poem, as well as a summary of the plot. Then, I will discuss Cord J. Whitaker's perspective in his article "Black Metaphors in the King of Tars" who argues that in the poem, for the author and audience, blackness represents sinfulness, but somatic whiteness does not guarantee a sinless status.[2] Afterwards, I will critically examine his article, agreeing with much of it while maintaining that he does not take the anti-Islamic tendencies in the poem seriously enough in his overall analysis.

The author of *The King of Tars* was ignorant of the nature of Islam and his anxieties reflect the loss of the last remnants of crusader power in the Levant. *The King of Tars* was written around 1330 by an anonymous English author. It was not widely read, but despite its restrained influence at the time it still represents contemporaneous anxieties and concerns. The fall of the last Crusader stronghold at Acre in 1291 and fears about the Islamic empire and Muslims more broadly are deep concerns for the author and his audience.[3] The poem reflects Christian desires for successful crusades and mass Muslim conversion. It is also written by someone who either did not know much about Islam, did not care to know, did not have access to apt Islamic information, or decided to, with adequate information, deliberately misrepresent Islam and Muslims. The author also has a subtler concern with the state of people's souls.

The King of Tars tells the fictional story of the Islamic Sultan of Damascus

1 *The King of Tars* tr. Alaric Hall, ed. John H. Chandler, Teams Middle English Texts. (Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications, 2015): 1-23.

2 Cord J. Whitaker, "Black Metaphors in the King of Tars," *The Journal of English and Germanic Philology* 112:2 (2013): 169-193.

3 Whitaker, 170.

and his violent attempts to win the beautiful daughter of the Christian King of Tars. The princess turns the Sultan's initial marriage proposal away, which causes the Sultan to fly into an uncontrollable rage, behaving "like a wild boar" and looking "like a lion."[4] In the ensuing battle, the Sultan and his army killed "thirty thousand knights of Christian faith."[5] The princess is woebegone for the part she is playing in the deaths of so many Christian men, so she accepts the Sultan's offer in order to quell the massive loss of life. The princess is transported to the Sultan's estate, and she weeps until dawn till she faints into a dream in her exhaustion.[6] Then, she has a dream that "one hundred black dogs" are barking at her, and the most troublesome hound "wanted to take her away," and she is too scared to fight back.[7] She prays to Jesus who saves her. But then, the fearsome black dog speaks to her "in human form, dressed like a knight in white clothes" and assures her that she has nothing to fear.[8]

They then conceive a disfigured child.[9] The princess spurs him to pray to his gods and she will pray to hers to remedy the child. His gods are not responsive, so he destroys all of his idols. The baby is baptized, which restores it to health.[10] The Sultan agrees to convert due to this miracle. The priest Cleophas names the Sultan after himself and after this renaming his "skin, that was black and hideous, became entirely white through God's grace, and pure, without sin."[11] His miraculous skin color change made the Sultan believe in the Christian God. He makes amends with the King of Tars and together they go on a brutal rampage against five Saracen kings. The Sultan promises to kill anyone who does not convert to Christianity on his conquest into his old kingdom and he carries through on this promise.[12]

The author misrepresents Islam, mainly regarding Muslim attitudes towards the Prophet Mohammad, idol worship, and war. First, the Prophet Mohammad is worshipped by the Sultan of Damascus and is at one point referred to as a "god."[13] Not only that, but the Sultan worships Apollo, Jove, Pluto, and Termagont.[14] The deification of Mohammad and the Sultan's praying to idols is forbidden in Islam.[15] It is an example of *shirk*, associating anything or anyone with Allah or worshipping anything other than Allah. Shirk is the most grievous sin in Islam, as it violates the *tawhid* of Allah, God's absolute unity with no associates.[16] It also makes a mockery of Islamic jurisprudence and Qur'anic constraints on what counts as a just war (proportionality,

4 Hall, 2.
5 Hall, 4.
6 Hall, 8.
7 Hall, 8.
8 Hall, 9.
9 Hall, 10, 11.
10 Hall, 15.
11 Hall, 17.
12 Hall, 23.
13 Hall, 12.
14 Hall, 9.
15 John L. Esposito, *Islam: The Straight Path (*New York: Oxford University Press, 2016): 13.
16 Esposito, 25.

defensiveness, etc.).[17] The Prophet Mohammad is the best guide for virtue in all areas for Muslims, but Islamic tradition is clear that he is an extraordinary person but nothing above that.[18] It is also forbidden to have or make icons of Mohammad, but the Sultan has statues of him.[19] The representations, then, of tawhid, Mohammad, just war theory, and rules concerning iconography are some of the most egregious mis-portrayals of Islam in the poem.

In Cord Whitaker's article, he argues that scholars have been too hasty in identifying *The King of Tars* as a text that links European white skin color with Christian identity.[20] Rather, the author is creatively redirecting certain culturally specific prejudices (Crusader ideology, desire for mass conversions, and negative ideas of blackness) inwardly, shifting the cultural-political anxieties of the time, via the metaphor of blackness, toward a critical reflection of the reader's personal Christian spirituality. He draws on Toni Morrison's idea of the black metaphor, which claims that blackness and black characters in literature by white authors function to simultaneously represent "sameness and otherness, spiritual purity and sinfulness."[21] And, that these metaphors tell us about the author's, in Morrison's words, "fears and desires." Whitaker takes the skin color conversion of the black-then-white Sultan as a racial metaphor of this kind. The negative valence of blackness is not primarily encoded into one's skin but also into one's spiritual character. As Whitaker says, "skin color in the *King of Tars* is a metaphor that instructs faith."[22] The text, according to Whitaker, does not just represent skin color based prejudice, but more importantly, it tries to demonstrate that skin color is an imperfect guide to making character judgements. It teaches its reader about the ambiguity of the body as a marker of purity.

In analyzing the text, Whitaker takes the scenes of the Sultan's conversion, the princesses' dream of the black hounds, and the Sultan's rage after his conversion to be the most important elements. Whitaker grounds much of his reading by placing the poem in the genre of spiritually didactic texts and by arguing that biblical figural interpretations and Ciceronian conceptions of metaphor would have been present in the author's mind and might have been salient for some readers.[23] He also demonstrates the historical precedence of skin color conversion stories in the writings of Bernard of Clairvaux and Augustine, namely their interpretations of the black bride in the Song of Songs.[24]

Regarding the Sultan's skin color conversion, Whitaker argues that many have read the passage carelessly and have assumed that the transformation happens because of his baptism, but it actually happens beforehand. As Whitaker says, he "becomes white at the moment the priest bestows his own name, Cleophas…*in prepara-*

17 Esposito, 235.
18 Esposito, 13.
19 Esposito, 25.
20 Whitaker, 169.
21 Whitaker, 169.
22 Whitaker, 192.
23 Whitaker, 181, 182.
24 Whitaker, 173, 175, 176.

tion for baptism."[25] He reads this as setting up two categories: external conversion (of black to white) and internal conversion (of Islam to Christianity). He brings up the tradition of metaphorical blackness as in Bernard of Clairvaux's (1090-1153) reading of the black bride from the Song of Songs. For Bernard, she represents the untamed sinfulness of his clerical readership's hearts that they must be on guard against.[26] The reality of black bodies is largely peripheral, but in Augustine's writings, it comes to the fore. For him, Ethiopians (a term used to designate all black people at the time), are the most sinful population, and so their conversion is a symbol of Christianity's spiritual potency.[27] For Augustine, the black bride's being "washed white" in the Song of Songs also represents Christ's salvific, cleansing power.[28] And by analyzing Cicero's rhetorical texts, Whitaker argues that people would have understood the polysemous nature of these black metaphors, namely that "blackness represents damnation" and "whiteness represents purity and redemption;" blackness always calls forth the connotations of whiteness, and these evocative oppositional combinations are inherent in the imagery and these multivalent meanings don't require authorial explanation.[29] Whitaker also argues that the Sultan is illustrated in the tradition of biblical *figura,* characters that represent historical realities and simultaneously divine truth.[30] The Sultan is meant to represent a Muslim ruler and a truth about conversion generally.

The princesses' dream of the black hounds, for Whitaker, provides the key to the apparent clean-cut diametric oppositions of good and evil as white and black. The text has thus far advanced plenty of imagery connecting animalistic violent barbarism, Saracenness (Muslimness), and blackness in the character of the Sultan, making him out to be in diametric opposition to Christianity. The black hound in the dream, somehow working with Jesus' might and wearing white, complicates this meaning and "suggests that the body is not a fool-proof marker of religious identity."[31] This would have evoked Jesus Christ for the reader because Jesus takes the form of a human; he is divinity donning the dress of the damned: white wearing black. He also says that Dominic of Caleruega, a mere century before the poem, was positively associated with dogs, and the Dominican's habit was "a white robe with a black cloak."[32] This allows for the Sultan's color transformation to trick the reader into thinking he is changed, but in his later great violence his inner blackness, his sinfulness, "remains intact."[33] Whitaker puts it nicely by saying that "traces of the sultan's Saracenness remain."[34] All of this might teach the close reader to not judge "others based on skin color or religious

25 Whitaker, 172.
26 Whitaker, 174.
27 Whitaker, 175.
28 Whitaker, 176.
29 Whitaker, 178, 179.
30 Whitaker, 181.
31 Whitaker, 185.
32 Whitaker, 187.
33 Whitaker, 187.
34 Whitaker, 189.

faith" and rather he will focus on "the state of his own soul."[35] Given the rendering of Islam in the text, however, assuming that readers would not judge others based on skin color and their religiosity is terribly naïve.

Whitaker reads the Sultan's continued violence as a lesson about lingering spiritual blackness, but could this not equally be a lesson—like the 14th and 15th-century Spanish concept of Jewish *conversos*—in the Sultan's religious-cultural, or potentially biological, taint? And, even if the author achieves his complex task of redirecting the moral metaphor, is it responsible to make a black Muslim a symbol in this way? I find much of Whitaker's analysis to be apposite, well supported by evidence, and that it delineates an important strand in the text. Whitaker, however, might be over-emphasizing the spiritual-symbolic potential of the Sultan and under-emphasizing the Sultan's portrayed "Saracenness" and the historical context.

My reading differs from Whitakers primarily regarding the centrality of the author's anti-Islamic bent and the importance of the animal imagery, the Sultan's violence—especially as contrasted to the King of Tars' inefficacy in battle—and the historical context. The Sultan is not just black but is a black Muslim. He is not coded to be African but is simply black. And of the utmost importance is that the Sultan *qua* Muslim is cast as the moral villain. For Whitaker, the black dream hound, that might represent the Sultan, allows for flexible renderings of the relationship between morality and outer appearance. But this is just one instance of a larger pattern in the poem of connecting Muslims and dogs, making them out to be uncontrollable animals: Saracens are referred to as dogs on four different occasions, and the Sultan is often compared to unruly beasts.[36] To be a Saracen is to be dog-like. The dream may still contain the possible reading that a dog-like Saracen may be redeemable, but because his violence continues after his conversion, his animality (his yet-to-be-redeemed nature) never falls away. The Sultan's animal excellence in battle is contrasted with the King of Tars being knocked off his horse multiple times where he is brought to a state of profuse bleeding.[37] This imbues the King of Tars with a martyr-like peacefulness and, by contrast, reveals the Sultan as even more war-like. For Whitaker, this violence stands in stark contrast to his whiteness, his new grace, and is meant to keep the reader on guard for their lingering spiritual backsliding. But it is not just a signal that the Sultan needs to do spiritual work, and that therefore so does the reader, but that insofar as the Sultan remains a Saracen, he remains violently animal. The story is always about the contradiction of Islam and Christianity, and this dichotomy never slips into the background. Whitaker may be right about many aspects of the poem, but this context can't be backgrounded in a complete, proper reading of the poem.

Through my analysis, we see how skin color and color more generally come to take on complex meanings regarding moral and spiritual life. What happens when color symbolizes morality or degrees of spiritual growth? If the metaphorical meaning of blackness is tied to negative violence and sin, then regardless of the symbolic inten-

35 Whitaker, 192.
36 Hall, 4, 8, 14, 20, 22.
37 Hall, 21, 22.

tion and direction (for and toward its audience's spiritual interiority) there is a distinct possibility that it will influence audiences' imagination towards blackness generally. In a world where there was perhaps only periphery contact with black people and Muslims, does the symbol system still lay the seeds for later hierarchical justification? Or do poems like *The King of Tars*, as Whitaker argues, contain positive destabilizing themes that encourage self-reflection, and hierarchizing tendencies arrive later? In studying historical change, one must dissect the overlapping sediments of people's concerns and prejudices. The author of the *The King of Tars* was genuinely concerned with his audience's spiritual development. He allowed blackness to take on the polyvalent meanings of both purity and sinfulness. But one cannot ignore how religious prejudices can undergird and motivate ambiguous symbolic registers. Above, besides, and beneath the symbols of black ambiguity lie Saracen sediment, and archaeology of any historical moment requires both the subtlety and sympathy of a brush and the rough, exacting force of a pick.

[Policy Projections]

Urban Megaprojects

Saudi Arabia: Domestic and International Perspectives

[Anna Blazkova]

Introduction

In the past years, with increasing intensification, megaprojects have dominated the rhetoric around new urban developments in many cities and countries around the globe, but most prominently perhaps in the region of the Persian Gulf and its oil money-rich economies. This research project tackles this phenomenon specifically as it appears in one of the Gulf countries: Saudi Arabia. It looks at urban megaprojects recently proposed or with construction freshly underway, and examines their political significance, both domestically and in terms of Saudi Arabia's pursuits in the international sphere. Saudi Arabia is already one of the most powerful political and economic players in the region, with a large young population, the 17th biggest economy in the world, and relatively strong ties to countries in the West, including the United States.[1] The Saudi government is furthermore making attempts to increase Saudi influence globally, so it is only natural to ask through what means this is being achieved. While cities that appear seemingly out of nowhere in the middle of the Arabian desert aren't by any means uncommon in the region, Saudi Arabia notwithstanding, their construction and the life in them are often burdened by accounts of extreme inequality and human rights violations.[2] This applies especially to megaprojects, which are often seen as hostile places to live even by their own residents—yet more of them are still being planned and built. Why is this happening, if these developments aren't hospitable to their residents? If the people living in these areas aren't benefiting from them, who is

1 Elliot Smith et al., "The Line: Ushering in the Future or a Smokescreen for Repression?," *Brown Political Review*, December 9, 2022, https://brownpoliticalreview.org/2022/12/the-line-a-smokescreen-for-repression-in-saudi-arabia/.

2 Smith et al., "The Line."

and how?

All these queries lead me to the central research question of my research project: What are the political motivations, both domestic and international, for the proliferation of urban megaproject developments across Saudi Arabia? My central thesis is that the Saudi royal family, particularly the crown prince Mohammed Bin Salman, support the development of futuristic urban megaprojects across the country in order to establish an image of Saudi Arabia as a forward-thinking, progressive, socially and environmentally conscious, as well as economically well-rounded global player. At the same time, on an internal level, these projects serve to support a renewed nationalist sentiment in Saudi Arabia's young population to back up the country's foreign policy strategies and stabilize the internal political climate in the country.

Background

Saudi Arabia's government is an absolute monarchy, with the currently ruling Al Saud family assuming power at the current state's inception in 1932, after the current king's father, Ibn Saud, now known as Saudi Arabia's founding father and national hero, connected two previously existing kingdoms of Hajaz and Nejd under his rule.[3] Presently, the two most prominent personalities in Saudi Arabia's political scene are the current king, Salman Bin Abdulaziz, who assumed power in 2015, and his son, future successor and right hand, the country's crown prince Mohammed Bin Salman, who has taken on the role of prime minister in 2017.[4] Additionally, most of the country's population is Muslim, and the ultra-conservative Sunni religious establishment has also played a prominent role in the country's internal and foreign policy throughout Saudi Arabia's history.[5] The country constitutes the 17th largest economy in the world,[6] with the overwhelming majority of its wealth coming from its oil industry.[7] Recently, however, the Saudi government has been trying to economically diversify and overall modernize the country, doing so mainly through the Public Investment Fund,[8] which has recently acquired a stake in the Saudi Arabia Oil group in an effort to redirect Saudi Arabia's oil revenue towards other projects.[9] These include foreign investments, such as the recent deal to acquire a 10% stake in the Heathrow Airport,[10] and a plethora of domestic investments, including an array of companies involved in

3 Joshua Teitelbaum, William L. Ochsenwald, and Harry St. John Bridger Philby, "Saudi Arabia," *Encyclopedia Britannica*, December 8, 2023, https://www.britannica.com/place/Saudi-Arabia.

4 Eman Alhussein, issue brief, *Saudi First: How Hyper-Nationalism Is Transforming Saudi Arabia* (London, United Kingdom: ECFR, 2019).

5 Teitelbaum, Ochsenwald, and Philby, "Saudi Arabia."

6 Smith et al., "The Line."

7 Teitelbaum, Ochsenwald, and Philby, "Saudi Arabia."

8 Alhussein, "Saudi First."

9 Alhussein, "Saudi First."

10 "Public Investment Fund," PIF, accessed December 9, 2023, https://www.pif.gov.sa/en/Pages/Homepage.aspx.

some of Saudi Arabia's new megaprojects.[11] Saudi Arabia's government has outlined its goals for innovation and diversification in the Vision 2030 documents, including specific targets of economic, social and cultural diversification and modernization to be achieved by the year 2030.[12] The framework is under the explicit patronage of the crown prince, Mohammed Bin Salman, and its website includes a section on urban megaprojects specifically, including ones in the planned NEOM area in the North-West of the country, as well as several around the capital city of Riyadh, in the Red Sea and the Persian Gulf.[13] The term urban megaproject, here, means any "large-scale urban development project,"[14] typically with a cost exceeding $1 billion, that aims in some way to significantly transform a city's part or its overall image, often featuring an iconic design component and pushed by the local urban elites as an indispensable catalyst for urban growth and a means to link the city to the larger global fabric.[15] These include airports, large housing developments, entertainment districts, public transportation systems, and, perhaps most traditionally, skyscrapers.

Methodology

I support this argument by looking at case studies of a variety of urban megaprojects that are currently either underway, or planned for construction in the near future, across Saudi Arabia. These include, most importantly, the highly medialized projects in the region of NEOM in the North-West of the country, including urban spaces such as the iconic city of the Line, tourist destinations like Trojena, or the floating industrial port city of Oxagon. Other examined megaprojects are, like NEOM, connected to Saudi Arabia's Vision 2030 development plans, again including a variety of residential, recreational and commercial spaces included to cover as wide a variety of cases as possible. The complete list of analyzed megaprojects is: NEOM's Line, Trojena and Oxagon; The Mukaab skyscraper and the adjacent New Murabba neighborhood development; A new development around the UNESCO heritage site of Diriyah; And finally, the tourist resort of The Rig in the Persian Gulf. For data collection, I examined the official websites and promotional materials for these megaprojects, as well as Saudi Arabia government's official website for the Vision 2030 and the project's official brochure available on the same website. To supplement these, I also include some news coverage of the megaprojects, especially sources critical of them, to provide a counterbalance to direct promotional materials. I would however like to acknowledge the limitations of my research here, as English-language reporting on Saudi urban megaprojects centers mainly around the most megalomaniac and

11 "MENA Investments," PIF, accessed December 9, 2023, https://www.pif.gov.sa/en/Pages/OurInvestments-Local.aspx?Filter=Local.

12 Saudi Vision 2030, accessed December 9, 2023, https://www.vision2030.gov.sa/.

13 Saudi Vision 2030.

14 Gerardo del Cerro Santamaría, *Urban Megaprojects: A Worldwide View* (Bingley , England: Emerald Insight, 2013), XXIV.

15 Santamaría, *Urban Megaprojects.*

futuristic of them – the Line. I will use qualitative analysis of these texts and visuals to examine my sources, and situate my research into the theoretical framework of city branding to evaluate my findings.

Literature review

The theoretical background for my research encompasses two distinct areas of research: Firstly, scholarly work on the changing political climate of Saudi Arabia, and secondly, work on megaprojects as means of branding and image-making. This research project falls into the gap between these two areas and attempts to bridge them.

In recent years, Saudi Arabia has made an attempt to dramatically alter the social contract between its citizens and the government. With attempts to diversify its economy away from reliance on oil revenues, the government also has had to find new sources of legitimacy and civic obedience, which were previously achieved through redistribution of precisely this income from oil sales,[16] along with the authority generated by the country's religious establishment.[17] The structures generated by the religious establishment are now also being challenged, however, as they become incompatible with the new leadership and innovations of king Salman Bin Abdulaziz and crown prince Mohammed Bin Salman.[18]

To compensate for these losses in sources of stability of the country's self-image, the Saudi leadership has started pushing a rhetoric of "Saudi first" nationalism[19] with a harsher edge, somewhat removed from the ultra-conservative religious connections and focused on the predominantly young, under 35 years-old Saudi population, with promises of progress attractive for this younger demographic.[20] This rhetoric involves plans to provide more entertainment options and ease restrictions on social life, provide more jobs in the private sector in modern, fast-developing industries such as genetic research or AI technologies, or to ensure nature conservation for future generations.[21] All these ambitions have also been reflected in Vision 2030, a government development plan aiming to diversify Saudi economy with specific targets for the year 2030, which features mainly economic and structural goals, but does so in the language targeted at young Saudis.[22] Some have also questioned whether the project is truly aimed at the Saudi constituency, or rather serves for international, especially Western, consumption.[23]

The nationalist edge goes further than just promises of prioritizing economic prosperity to the younger generation. The ruling Al Saud family is also making an at-

16 Jane Kinninmont, rep., *Vision 2030 and Saudi Arabia's Social Contract Austerity and Transformation* (London: Chatham House, 2017).
17 Alhussein, "Saudi First."
18 Alhussein, "Saudi First."
19 Alhussein, "Saudi First."
20 Alhussein, "Saudi First"; Kinninmont, *Vision 2030.*
21 Alhussein, "Saudi First."
22 Alhussein, "Saudi First."
23 Kinninmont, *Vision 2030.*

tempt to create loyalty to the core personalities of the royal line, particularly the crown prince Mohammed Bin Salman, over any other, especially religious, affiliation.[24] This includes an emphasis on the connections between the country's security and general stability and the Al Saud family,[25] as well as strong emphasis on connections between Mohammed Bin Salman and the Saudi founding father and national hero, king Abdulaziz.[26] Most of the campaigning happens on social media where the young population is easily accessible, with Twitter hashtag campaigns, encouragements of displays of nationalism through "emoji allegiance," or medialized visits of Mohammed Bin Salman to remote regions of the country all taking center stage. Here, MBS encourages the young constituency to embody the resilience and strength found in Saudi Arabia's natural landscape.[27]

Importantly, a large part of this campaign – the hashtag #SaudiFirst also represents changes in foreign policy where Saudi Arabia abandons the role of caretaker of other Arab nations in the region, and instead focuses more on pushing its own individual interests.[28] This includes an increased hostility in Saudi Arabia's relationship with countries of the West, although many of the newest reform projects heavily rely on elite Western consultants and investors.[29]

Urban megaprojects often, like Saudi Arabia's recent policy changes and plans for the country's future, reach for futuristic claims and images to secure legitimacy. They can also function as an attractive option to bring in foreign investment and neoliberal business practices, but this reasoning doesn't shed any light on the reasons for the environmentally conscious, ultramodern and socially progressive aesthetics of Saudi megaprojects. The motivations behind the next generation of urban megaprojects is different: They serve as primarily iconic aspirational images, rather than hubs of neoliberal foreign investment (although this secondary function is also always welcome).[30] They transform Saudi Arabia's identity, serve as a form of branding and representational transformation, cultivate illusory urbanism, or as it is sometimes referred to particularly in the Gulf region: the Dubaization of urban development.[31] Bromber suggests that rather than seeing the processes of urban development in the region as modernization efforts, they are a part of search movements.

As relatively young states, countries of the Gulf are newcomers to nation building, and under a pressure to gain unique advantage over other countries in the

---

24 Alhussein, "Saudi First"; Kinninmont, *Vision 2030.*

25 Kinninmont, *Vision 2030.*

26 Alhussein, "Saudi First."

27 Alhussein, "Saudi First."

28 Alhussein, "Saudi First."

29 Alhussein, "Saudi First"; Kinninmont, *Vision 2030.*

30 Stephen Graham, "Verticality and Centrality: The Politics of Contemporary Skyscrapers," in *Re-Centring the City* (London: UCL Press, 2020), 169–91.

31 Santamaría, *Urban Megaprojects:* Ali Alraouf, "Phantasmagoric Urbanism: Exploiting the Culture of Image in Post-Revolution Egypt," *Traditional Dwellings and Settlements Review* 31, no. 1 (2019): 71–86; Armelle Choplin and Alice Franck, "A Glimpse of Dubai in Khartoum and Nouakchott: Prestige Urban Projects on the Margins of the Arab World," *Built Environment* 36, no. 2 (July 4, 2010): 192–205.

same context, they try to find a special selling point and a particular clearly defined identity.[32] In the absence of democratic structures in these countries, these megaprojects can't be legitimized by public participation on political processes, so they're instead legitimized by "visions" of the absolute rulers of the Gulf states,[33] and then in turn weaponized to lend credibility to the current regime in power, transforming rulers into national heroes who bring about a new age of prosperity with their fantastic urban megaprojects[34] and can affect the image of the nation as a whole by extension.[35] In Saudi Arabia, previous megaprojects have been linked with names of specific royals—the Kingdom tower in Jeddah being sponsored by prince Alwaleed Bin Talal, for example. In some cases, such as in Egypt under the rule of president Sisi, these projects have become propaganda of "disposable images,"[36] where the ultimate execution of the project isn't nearly as important as the initial visionary idea, manifested in computer simulations and flashy brochures,[37] presenting magical realism that testifies the power of the producer of these visions—usually a member of the ruling elite.[38] Even in less extreme cases, though, urban megaprojects serve primarily as sources of symbolic capital,[39] transforming cities into brands projecting prestige, performance and power.[40]

Urban megaprojects unfortunately frequently don't live up to the aspirations and visions which created them, and end up even contradicting the original intentions. Santamaria describes a discrepancy between how urban megaprojects are viewed on global stages, and their actual urban effects, which can be detrimental not only to the general population, but contest the interests of the original orchestrators too.[41] Megaprojects also swallow large investments which manifest in only small, concentrated areas without larger consistent urban planning, therefore resulting in fragmented development and large discrepancies between the individual projects and their surrounding areas.[42]

Analysis

The first of Saudi Arabia's megaprojects that I'll be examining is a planned new construction of the neighborhood of New Murabba on the edge of the capital city

32 Katrin Bromber, Steffen Wippel, and Birgit Krawietz, *Under Construction: Logics of Urbanism in the Gulf Region* (London: Routledge, 2018).

33 Bromber et al., *Under Construction.*

34 Alraouf, "Phantasmagoric Urbanism"; Bromber et al., *Under Construction;* Santamaría, *Urban Megaprojects.*

35 Santamaría, *Urban Megaprojects.*

36 Alraouf, "Phantasmagoric Urbanism."

37 Alraouf, "Phantasmagoric Urbanism"; Bromber et al., *Under Construction.*

38 Bromber et al., *Under Construction.*

39 Bromber et al., *Under Construction.*

40 Graham, "Verticality and Centrality."

41 Santamaría, *Urban Megaprojects.*

42 Bromber et al., *Under Construction;* Graham, "Verticality and Centrality."

of Riyadh, along with its central dominant, the Mukaab Skyscraper.[43] The project is in its promotional materials described as "the new horizon for Riyadh"[44] and, indeed, the futuristic visuals most commonly shown in its advertising match this claim with their sheer all-encompassing size. The promotional videos on New Murabba's website also highlight the inspiration that the Mukaab skyscraper takes in traditional Saudi Arabia's Najdi architecture,[45] tying back to the nationalist sentiments king Salman and the crown prince attempt to raise in the younger generations of Saudis. This nationalist sentiment is then highlighted further in slogans associated with the project: "Born from a nation's vision to create a new way of living."[46] Those slogans don't just highlight the nationalist aspect of Saudi Arabia's megaprojects, referring back to a unified vision of all Saudi people, but also signal Saudi Arabia's attempt at pushing itself to the forefront of innovation in thinking about the organization of people's lives more broadly. Inventing new ways of living, or at least referring to their supposed innovation, will be, as we'll see in other Saudi megaprojects, another common theme in Saudi visions for the future. The project's website is also full of compelling buzzwords commonly associated with large innovative projects of the last decades—"immersive," "experiential," "walkable"[47]—but those aren't backed by any substantial data on the neighborhood and skyscraper's planning proposals, estimated costs, profits, or local urban impacts beyond the previously mentioned slogans.[48] The only specific numbers we get from the website are the 80 planned entertainment venues, including a Broadway district,[49] which tie back to Saudi Arabia's attempt at convincing its citizens and the international community of its progressive turn with easing restrictions on social life. Furthermore, the promotional videos underscore Mukaab's contribution to the non-oil GDP of the country,[50] tying back to the efforts to diversify away from oil reliance.

The second examined megaproject is Trojena, located in the NEOM development region in the North-West corner of the country, a hyper-modern luxury mountain resort with ski slopes, wellness hotels, observatories, and an artificial lake.[51] The promotional materials tend to focus less on these material components of the project, however, and aesthetics once again reign supreme. These include visuals reminiscent of sci-fi movies like *The Martian*, with futuristic cars driving through the desert or with skiers skiing up a mountain against an avalanche. These images don't provide information about the resort and its amenities as such, but are here to convey a certain type of vision, conveying ideals of innovation, perseverance and exclusivity.

---

43 "A Gateway to Another World," Newmurabba.com, accessed December 9, 2023, https://newmurabba.com/.

44 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

45 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

46 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

47 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

48 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

49 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

50 "A Gateway," Newmurabba.com.

51 "Trojena: The Mountains of NEOM," NEOM, accessed December 9, 2023, https://www.neom.com/en-us/regions/trojena.

The Vault, a gateway into the resort, is then called a "portal" between the digital and the physical,[52] tying back to Saudi Arabia's promises of pushing modern industries, such as AI technologies. The project's website also highlights Trojena's personal sanctioning by Mohammed Bin Salman,[53] a type of public visibility which helps to associate his public persona with the ideals of progress and prosperity. It is important to note, too, that all of NEOM's projects are tied to the crown prince very closely, as he's assumed the role of the chairman of the NEOM company, in addition to all his other positions in the Saudi government.[54] Another theme in Trojena's promotional materials is the "like no other in the world"[55] rhetoric employed, along with a decidedly young and multi-cultural cast of the promotional video,[56] to attract foreign elites to the project and create an impression of Saudi Arabia as an exclusive world-class tourist destination.

The third of my examined megaprojects is the Diriyah Development Project near Riyadh, which aims to build up hotels, shopping centers, business buildings and entertainment venues in the area surrounding the At-Turaif ancient city, which is currently classified as a UNESCO heritage site, and combine its historical buildings with a new development in a modernized style of the local Najdi architecture.[57] This urban megaproject is again connected to Vision 2030 and featured on its website, as well as directly funded by the Public Investment Fund. Sitting at a predicted investment of $62 billion,[58] it is one of the cheaper projects which Saudi Arabia plans to build in the next approximately ten years. In this case, the materials presenting the development project put a large emphasis on continuing the Saudi national heritage through architecture, as well as preserving the nation's pride in its history.[59] This, again, ties back to the efforts to forge a renewed strong nationalist sentiment that anchors itself in Saudi Arabia's history and its heroes—the At-Turaif city is the original home of the Al Saud dynasty[60]—and at the same time reaches into the future with its rhetoric of modernization and progress.

Next, the fourth subject of analysis, and perhaps the most notoriously known in the media outside of Saudi Arabia, is the city of The Line, again in the NEOM region in the country's north-west.[61] The project is, on the company's website, presented as a "evolution in civilization"[62] with its eye-catching vertical structure, counterintuitive linear design and promises of complete sustainability.[63] The project mirrors all

52 "Discover Trojena," NEOM, accessed December 9, 2023, https://www.neom.com/en-us/regions/trojena/clusters.
53 "Trojena: The Mountains of NEOM," NEOM.
54 "Trojena: The Mountains of NEOM," NEOM.
55 "Trojena: The Mountains of NEOM," NEOM.
56 "Trojena: The Mountains of NEOM," NEOM.
57 "Diriyah," Saudi Vision 2030.
58 "Diriyah," Saudi Vision 2030.
59 "Diriyah," Saudi Vision 2030.
60 "Diriyah," Saudi Vision 2030.
61 "The Line," NEOM.
62 "The Line," NEOM.
63 "The Line," NEOM.

the rhetorical points seen in other previously mentioned megaprojects' promotional materials, pointing to economic diversification, cutting-edge technologies—this time, in a city with services controlled by AI—as well as a particularly strong emphasis on ecological sustainability and 100% renewable energies and water supplies,[64] promising that this city model will serve as a solution to many of humanity's current environmental and urban crises. The Line's promotional materials interestingly feature several videos of other cities reimagined in a vertical configuration,[65] showing how much nature would be "saved" if the urban space was restructured in a fashion reminiscent of the megaproject. The subjects of these videos are Manhattan or Kensington, raising the suggestion that Saudi Arabia aims to position itself as a leading force on issues of sustainability and urban planning, surpassing even global superpowers like the US or UK, and that its designs have solutions for problems even in these older urban areas. Along with hyper-green visuals filled with lush trees and grass inside the city's walls, we hear references to "world-class architects"[66] and fast connectivity to at least 40% of the rest of the world[67]—Saudi Arabia's further positioning as a globally significant economic and cultural player.

However, with The Line's exposure in the foreign media, the megaproject has also become one of the few to face substantial criticism.[68] These critical pieces often highlight the impracticality of the design, which won't be able to adapt well to the changes in the size of its population, and will be, with its singular main high-speed rail, vulnerable to failing infrastructure.[69] The linear design is then, according to the critics, primarily here for the shock value, not for any real practicality. Furthermore, with currently available technologies, promises of complete environmental sustainability seem far-fetched and impossible to fulfill. To illustrate just one of the problems, the city plans to get all its water through desalination from the gulf of Aqaba. However, current desalination technologies end up with a waste product, an extremely salty brine, where the only viable option of disposal at this scale is its release back into the sea.[70] This brine, however, is so salty that at large quantities, it kills ecosystems on the marine floor – an effect directly in contradiction to the Line's promised environmental consciousness.[71] Lastly, many concerns over human rights in association with NEOM projects have appeared, particularly connected to the displacement of the Huwaitat tribes native to the region, who have been forced to leave the area for the development

64 "The Line," NEOM.
65 "The Line," NEOM.
66 "The Line," NEOM.
67 "The Line," NEOM.
68 Justin Scheck, Rory Jones, and Summer Said, "A Prince's $500 Billion Desert Dream: Flying Cars, Robot Dinosaurs and a Giant Artificial Moon," The Wall Street Journal, July 25, 2019, https://www.wsj.com/articles/a-princes-500-billion-desert-dream-flying-cars-robot-dinosaurs-and-a-giant-artificial-moon-11564097568.
69 Smith et al., "The Line."
70 Smith et al., "The Line."
71 Smith et al., "The Line."

of the megaprojects to begin.[72] Work on the NEOM projects, then, is largely done by underpaid immigrant workers from countries like Pakistan, who live and work under inadequate conditions.[73]

Another of Saudi Megaprojects, where the iconic nature of its design seems to dominate over its practicality, is the industrial floating port city of Oxagon, again in the NEOM region.[74] More than a half of the project is built up on water, despite the plentiful empty areas around the urban development on land, and the fact that building on land instead of water would be much cheaper and less labor intensive. Furthermore, the city's design of a port in the middle,[75] between Oxagon's floating and land-based areas, means that cargo ships will experience a much more complicated navigation process, with a danger of crashing into some of the floating residential portions of the city. While the megaproject's design is certainly eye-catching, and symbolic of Saudi Arabia's attempts to change its image from that of a conservative exporter of crude oil, the urban plan ends up being fundamentally impractical.

Last, and perhaps most symbolic of Saudi Arabia's attempted change of image, is the offshore tourist destination The Rig.[76] The megaproject reimagines the aesthetics of the oil industry, looking like a conventional oil rig but serving the function of an unconventional holiday resort.[77] Unlike anything associated with the oil industry, The Rig's website carries a rhetoric of sustainability and innovative family tourism.[78] It is the most straightforward that Saudi planned megaprojects get to a direct metaphor of the country's attempted development, with the connotations of a crude industrial site reused and subverted into a desirable modern and innovative destination.

Ultimately, all of the examined megaprojects have some themes in common. Their promotional materials heavily feature buzzwords of technological innovation, exclusivity, sustainability, and transcendental human experience, all mirroring the progressive image which Saudi Arabia attempts to project to both win the nationalist loyalties of its young population, as well as the global elites – those are, in all the promotional videos, represented by the always exclusively young and culturally diverse cast of characters. The projects have a unified futuristic visual language, creating an impression of a larger cohesive scheme and idea, not just individual developments, which works especially well as all the examined megaprojects are tied to the Vision 2030 documents, and all feature on the Vision's website. The megaprojects further serve to solidify Mohammed Bin Salman's image as a competent leader who will bring forth an age of prosperity, as all of the projects, including the Vision 2030 documents themselves, exist under his patronage, and his likeness features on the website of all

72 Scheck, Jones, and Said, "A Prince's $500 Billion Desert Dream,"; Jennifer Holleis and Kersten Knipp, "Saudi Arabia's Neom: A Prestigious Project with a Dark Side," dw.com, May 18, 2023, https://www.dw.com/en/saudi-arabias-neom-a-prestigious-project-with-a-dark-side/a-65664704.

73 Holleis and Knipp, "Saudi Arabia's Neom."

74 "Oxagon," NEOM.

75 "Oxagon," NEOM.

76 "Home," The RIG, accessed December 9, 2023, https://therig.sa/.

77 "Home," The RIG.

78 "Home," The RIG.

of the examined developments. Ultimately, however, any more specific information on the urban impact of these projects, their detailed plans, budgets, or expert studies backing up the prominent buzzwords are completely absent from all the explored materials. It seems, then, especially when considering some of the international criticism several that the megaprojects have garnered, that they truly are primarily an image to lend credibility to Saudi Arabia's aspirations domestically and internationally, and that their design often functions on the basis of "aesthetics over function."

Conclusion

Ultimately, my research of Saudi Megaprojects confirmed the initial thesis of this project: The Al-Saud family uses urban megaprojects to change the country's image in the international community, as well as to establish a new nationalist sentiment within the country's young population to legitimize its own position of power. The paper, more broadly, also explored the question of how larger domestic and international policies affect specific urban planning decisions in smaller regions of the country, and looked at the strong and symbiotic relationship between a movement to build a new nationalist sentiment and the proliferation of iconic architecture. The research provides an alternative explanation for the existence of urban megaprojects that doesn't primarily point to neoliberal theories, showing that megaprojects can serve as more than just a vessel to funnel international investment into a particular location. Megaprojects can also serve as support for political regimes and visions through their symbolic capital. The main limitation of this paper is its focus on English-language resources exclusively—therefore, one of the suggestions for further research would be a replication with an inclusion of materials in Arabic, to see whether sources targeted at the domestic and regional Arab-speaking audience paint the same picture as their English equivalents. Further, new comparative research could be done by bringing in a country with a non-totalitarian government and a significant number of planned megaprojects, to see whether the mode of governance creates differences in motivations for large urban development projects. Lastly, this research could be broadened to include other similar countries of the gulf, such as Qatar or the UAE, in a comparative study to test whether the same trends are visible elsewhere in the region.

Korean Emissions Trading Schemes

An Economic Analysis

[Astrid Castro]

The global imperative to address climate change has led to the sets of policies, initiatives, or strategies being implemented by governments or organizations to mitigate the environmental degradation caused by Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emissions. Known as carbon abatement strategies, their goal is to downcurve the amount of GHG produced by human activities. These often include a range of measures aimed at increasing energy efficiency, promoting the use of renewable energy sources, and fostering the adoption of technologies that help capture and store carbon dioxide. Common examples of carbon abatement programs include carbon pricing mechanisms like carbon taxes and emissions trading schemes. South Korea, a heavily industrialized country, pledges to reduce its GHG emissions and achieve carbon neutrality by 2050. To achieve this, The Korean Emissions Trading Scheme (K-ETS) was initiated in January 2015. This market-driven approach, following the cap-and-trade mechanism, is a prominent example within Asia. However, there are several challenges faced since its implementation, which has led to changes in its design and governance. This research paper seeks to comprehensively analyze the history, outcomes, and potential efficient reforms of the K-ETS since its inception.

South Korea, with a population of 51.7 million and one of the top 10 GHG emitters, pledged allocation of the equivalent of 2% of their Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per year to fight excessive carbon emissions.[1] "'Instead of saying you first',

1 "South Korea Population," n.d., https://tradingeconomics.com/south-korea/population; Carni Klirs, "Greenhouse Gas Emissions over 165 Years," World Resources Institute, March 22, 2019, https://www.wri.org/data/greenhouse-gas-emissions-over-165-years.

said Lee Myung-bak, former president, South Korea would henceforth act 'me first.'"[2] Post-war, the country's rapid industrialization was driven by an economy steering heavy industry and fossil fuels. Industry accounts for 37% of their GDP and 80% of exports; for instance, the GDP in the most important industrial city, Ulsan, is 75% higher than the national average. "But as South Korea joins the rest of the world in the effort to curb climate change, its centers of heavy industry are turning from drivers of growth into liabilities."[3] Over the years, the country's economic and industrial development has grown linear with the country's GHG emissions (see image 1).[4] It is argued that South Korea would have to reduce carbon emissions by an average of 5.4% a year to achieve its carbon neutrality target. In comparison, the EU and United States must reduce their emissions by an average of 2% and 2.8% respectively; indicating that South Korea still has a significant journey ahead to attain its sustainability goals.[5] Under the 2009 Copenhagen Accord, South Korea committed to reducing its GHG emissions to 30% below its business-as-usual (BAU) levels by 2020. To enable this transition, the Framework Act on Low Carbon Green Growth was established in 2010, and subsequent discussions of the potential role of an Emissions Trading Scheme (ETS) started. Information on its development and national allowances were announced in 2014 and will be initiated in January 2015.[6] The K-ETS operates on the principle of cap-and-trade covering about 74% of South Korea's national GHG emitters (as of 2020), and targets GHG such as Carbon Dioxide, Methane, Nitrous Oxide, Perfluorocarbons, Hydrofluorocarbons and Sulfur hexafluoride (CO2, CH4, N2O, PFCs, HFCs, SF6, respectively). The program includes 684 of the country's largest emitters in the power, industrial, buildings, waste, transport, and domestic aviation sectors (as of 2021) and aims to achieve carbon neutrality by 2050.[7]

The cap-and-trade principle sets a limit on total allowable emissions produced by sectors and creates permits/allowances that represent the right to emit a specific quantity of pollutants. These are issued by governments to regulate firms, they are auctioned, distributed freely, or traded between entities. Permit prices reflect the opportunity cost at the margin of a firm's emissions and are imposed by the market. However, these prices can be very volatile and can decrease rapidly over time, which can cause a significant trade-off in the program.[8] In the K-ETS, the allocation of per-

2 "South Korea, Having Sworn to Lead the Green Transition, Is Holding It Up," *The Economist*, June 22, 2023, https://www.economist.com/asia/2023/06/22/south-korea-having-sworn-to-lead-the-green-transition-is-holding-it-up.

3 Gunsan and Ulsan, "South Korea's Climate Targets Will Mean Remaking Its Economy," *The Economist*, November 13, 2021, https://www.economist.com/asia/2021/11/13/south-koreas-climate-targets-will-mean-remaking-its-economy.

4 Hannah Ritchie, Max Roser, and Pablo Rosado, "South Korea: CO2 Country Profile," *Our World in Data*, May 11, 2020, https://ourworldindata.org/co2/country/south-korea.

5 "Holding It Up," *The Economist.*

6 "The Korea Emissions Trading Scheme," n.d., https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/469821/korea-emissions-trading-scheme.pdf.

7 "Korea Emissions Trading Scheme", International Carbon Action Partnership, n.d.

8 Gilbert E Metcalf, "Market-Based Policy Options to Control U.S. Greenhouse Gas Emissions," *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 23, no. 2 (April 1, 2009): 5–27.

mits was based on grandparenting and benchmarking at first, and auctioning became available in the second phase. The use of domestic and international offset credits banking and borrowing were introduced but needed to meet specific criteria.

The K-ETS is divided into three phases; the first and second phases consist of three years each, 2015 to 2017 and 2018 to 2020, while the final phase will span from 2021 to 2025. Ongoing phases have seen adjustments to the cap levels and sectors included due to the continuous review for improvement based on stakeholder consultation and market performance. Some of the recent changes include; increasing incentives for emission reductions, encouraging trading and mitigating price volatility, facilitating the conversion of offset credits, strengthening the monitoring, reporting, and verification systems (MRV), and increasing support for small businesses and new entrants.[9]

Additionally, the government also intends to align the cap with the country's updated National Determined Contribution (NDC), which accounts for a total domestic reduction of 32.5% BAU under the Paris Agreement. Also, individualized targets for each sector participating in the program are to be met by 2030, and the K-ETS is anticipated to play a pivotal role in facilitating the nation's attainment of these objectives. However, critics of the K-ETS argue that the emissions cap, initially established using data primarily from highly energy-intensive industries, failed to adequately address broader concerns voiced by environmental organizations and civil society.

For instance, the free allocation of permits during Phase I raised concerns about fairness and sparked controversy, as it seemed that businesses with high emissions were being rewarded for past inefficiencies. While early adopters of emissions-saving technologies were penalized. In 2015, results indicated that the power sector received the highest share of allowances (46%) leading to annual emissions surpassing the established cap by 0.5%. Overall, participants received a total allowance worth 549 million Tco2e, and those who did not have enough allowances were required to buy or trade additional allowances to cover their over emissions of GHG.[10]

Though some entities had a surplus of permits during Phase I, many preferred to bank these instead of practicing trade. Frequent government intervention in the market, resulting in volatile permit prices, and a limited number of participants in the program seem to be the primary factors contributing to this lack of market liquidity. As a result, the government-imposed limitations on banking to encourage the sale of excess permits and enhance liquidity.[11] This strategic move was envisioned to foster a more responsive market and stable permit prices. However, it affects the perceived fairness and predictability of the cap-and-trade system because some entities would need to adjust their carbon management and trading strategies in response to the new regulatory constraints. This leads to a reevaluation of their sustainability practices and impacts their long-term compliance.

Despite the government's intention to assist entities dealing with allowances

9 "Green Policy Platform," Green Policy Platform, n.d., http://www.greenpolicyplatform.org/.
10 "The Korea Emissions Trading Scheme."
11 Environmental Defense Fund, "Republic of Korea: An Emissions Trading Case Study."

shortages and to facilitate inter-firm trade, their release of reserved allowances failed to stimulate trading activities. Uncertain about the policy direction, firms continued to bank allowances, resulting in an oversupply and subsequent reduction in permit prices.[12] This situation, in turn, lessens incentives for companies to invest in new technologies for carbon emission reduction. To prevent the recurrence of these challenges, several recommendations have been proposed. First, a gradual lifting of strict banking regulations is suggested. Second, the provision of extensive information regarding cap targets, allowances, and program development to enhance transparency and certainty. Third, the implementation of automatic market regulation mechanisms to ensure program stability. These measures aim to create an environment where industries are more willing to sell excess allowances, fostering stability without causing drastic shifts that could lead to higher costs.

In Phase II, several transformative measures were implemented to overcome barriers in the carbon emissions market. Notable changes included: the introduction of early action credits, an expedited approval process for overseas emission reductions, and the incorporation of market makers—third parties facilitating allowance trades. The inclusion of third-party participants holds the potential to enhance market liquidity, and efficiency, and stimulate innovation and competition. However, effective implementation necessitates rigorous regulation, supervision, capacity building, and education to curb market manipulation and speculation.

Phase II saw the imposition of limits on banking and borrowing, signaling a shift in the program's approach. Auctioning of allowances became mandatory for specific sectors, with 3% of allowances reserved for auctioning to aid in price discovery. Additionally, while offset credits were capped at 10%, the approved methodologies for generating these credits were expanded.[13] These strategic adjustments aimed to refine the market dynamics, strike a balance between supply and demand, and promote a more stable and responsive trading environment.

Furthermore, according to the Greenhouse Gas Inventory and Research Center of Korea's (GIR) 2020 report, GHG emissions were reduced by 5.7% (554.4 million tons) compared to the previous year; 635 entities met their targets. However, this has been attributed to COVID-19 since the sectors that notably reduced GHG emissions were the aviation and transportation sectors. The transportation sector, for instance, made a significant decrease in emissions of 21.7%, but domestic waste increased by 1.7%. Nevertheless, the average trading price of emission permits per ton increased from KRW 23,914 (USD 18.45) in 2015 to KRW 30,411 (USD 23.46) in 2020.

In addition, the GIR conducted a survey on the program performance, where 84.2% of participants presented a positive perspective on the K-ETS. However, 68% of the entities responded that to meet future caps on emissions, they would primarily use permits and purchase more if needed, instead of adopting green technologies. This opens the door for an examination of whether the cap has been set too high and if per-

12 "The Korea Emissions Trading Scheme."
13 "Green Policy Platform," Green Policy Platform.

mit prices should be elevated to address potential oversupply. Nevertheless, 53.8% of entities have already established an action plan for Phase III to reduce GHG emissions, but in terms of trading, 56.9% answered they would not participate in allowances trade and prefer the banking method.[14]

Furthermore, after the economic impact of COVID-19, economic recovery led to the expansion of facilities and an increase in production which directly increased GHG emissions. According to the GIR 2022 report, by 2021, total certified emissions rose to 591.0Mt. However, it is argued that this is due to the entry of new entities in the sectors involved in the K-ETS program. The start of Phase III amounted to allowances of 584.8 Mt (97.5% was freely allocated, while 2.5% was auctioned) but trading price per ton fell by 24% in 2022. Nonetheless, permits traded via auction accounted for the highest proportion of all emissions permits, a big difference from what we saw in Phase II. Banking behavior has decreased over time, as well as the number of entities who do not want to engage in permit trading. Moreover, 38.5% of entities covered responded to have actively invested in the K-ETS by reducing emissions by applying low-carbon technologies.[15] However, this has resulted in costs increasing and a lack of corporate competitiveness and corporate profit.

Entities involved in the K-ETS have asked for help mitigating the costs of new technologies to reduce emissions and to actively use the revenue from penalties for exceeding allocated limits (KRW 100,000 (USD 77.40) per ton). Currently, the program has generated revenue of KRW 1,092.6 billion (USD 845.2 million) from penalties. This revenue has been used as a climate response fund that includes support to mitigation equipment, low-carbon innovation, and technology development for small- and mid-sized companies.[16]

Altogether, the K-ETS aims to achieve multiple objectives, such as placing South Korea at the forefront of the global effort to mitigate climate change, reducing its dependence on imported fossil fuels, and enhancing its competitiveness in the clean energy sector. Though there are challenges in the reform when transitioning to a low-carbon economy, there are opportunities for its development.

First, integrating the K-ETS with other carbon markets has the potential to offer opportunities for cost-effective mitigation. Systems like the European Union Emissions Trading (EU ETS), or the cooperative approaches outlined in Article 6 of the Paris Agreement could not only enhance the environmental integrity and transparency of the K-ETS but also serve to address potential market liquidity challenges.[17] However, this also poses challenges, such as ensuring the compatibility and harmonization of different carbon market rules and standards, as well as addressing the potential risks of double counting and leakage.

For instance, The National Development and Reform Commission of the

14 Greenhouse Gas Inventory & Research Center of Korea, "Greenhouse Gas Inventory & Research Center of Korea," gir.go.kr, n.d., http://www.gir.go.kr/eng/index.do.

15 Greenhouse Gas Inventory & Research Center of Korea, "Greenhouse Gas."

16 "Korea Emissions," International Carbon Action Partnership.

17 "The Korea Emissions Trading Scheme."

People's Republic of China (NRDC) has proposed to the Korean government to create the "Northeast Asia Emission Trading Cooperation Business" to seek opportunities for an Asian carbon market. This is a proposal to establish a platform for cooperation and exchange among the carbon markets in Northeast Asia, such as China, Korea, and Japan. This could create opportunities for enhancing regional cooperation and integration on climate change, potential expansion of the market size and diversity, and reducing the mitigation costs.[18] However, this also faces challenges, such as the differences in gaps in the carbon market development and maturity, as well as the political and economic tensions and uncertainties in the region.

Second, frequent government intervention in the K-ETS development may have undermined the market credibility of the K-ETS permit price in the market. Their adjustment of the allocation plan, issuance of additional allowances, and imposition of price ceilings and floors only created more uncertainty and volatility in the market.[19] The government should balance the need for market intervention with respect for market signals and dynamics, as well as enhance the predictability and transparency of the market rules and regulations so entities increase their trust in the program and cooperate in trading behavior.

Lastly, the government may expand its application of benchmarking within sectors. Benchmarking is a method of allocating emission allowances based on the emission performance of similar entities, rather than on historical emissions or output. The K-ETS currently applies benchmarking to the power sector and some energy-intensive industries, such as cement and oil refining.[6] Expanding the application of benchmarking to other sectors could create opportunities for improving the allocation efficiency and equity. However, this also requires a robust and reliable data collection and verification system for clear and consistent methodology when setting and updating the benchmarks.

In conclusion, the Korean Emissions Trading Scheme (K-ETS) plays a vital role in South Korea's commitment to address climate change and reduce GHG emissions. The nation, marked by rapid industrialization and heavy reliance on fossil fuels, faces the challenge of transforming its growth drivers into sustainable contributors. Despite achievements in emissions reduction during different phases, challenges persist, including concerns about initial emissions caps' fairness and issues related to market liquidity. Looking forward, opportunities for the K-ETS involve potential collaborations with other carbon markets in the region, as it has been proposed Northeast Asia Emission Trading Cooperation Business. The imperative to strike a delicate balance between government intervention and market dynamics as fairness and transparency play a crucial role in the program's effectiveness. As South Korea continues its journey toward sustainability, the K-ETS stands as a dynamic tool with the potential for transformative impact, providing valuable insights for other nations grappling with similar

18 "Carbon market cooperation in Northeast Asia - Asia society," n.d., https://asiasociety.org/sites/default/files/2018-07/FULL REPORT - Carbon Market Cooperation in Northeast Asia.pdf.

19 "The Korea Emissions Trading Scheme."

climate challenges. Despite challenges, the KETS has shown promise in achieving emission reduction goals. A balanced approach to addressing weaknesses and building on strengths is crucial for the program's long-term success.

Plyler V. Doe

Where Are the Undocumented Students in Higher Education?

[Kathia S. Perez-Enriquez]

On June 15th, 2022, the 1982 *Plyler v. Doe* Supreme Court case celebrated its 40th anniversary. The anniversary marks 40 years since the Supreme Court ruled that undocumented children could not be denied access to a free K-12 public education. Although it is celebrated as a landmark case in immigrant rights, the legislative aftermath of *Plyler v. Doe* has highlighted its shortcomings. In this paper, I synthesize the existing literature to demonstrate that, in practice, the landmark immigrant rights case has failed to further opportunities in the realm of higher education for undocumented students. The federal and state legislation implemented throughout 1994-2014 support this argument. To analyze this claim, I will first provide some background on the *Plyler v. Doe* case. I will elaborate on efforts to expand *Plyler v. Doe* into the postsecondary realm. Then, I will discuss California's 1994 ballot initiative, Proposition 187, which sought to deny virtually all state benefits to any undocumented individual in the state. I contend that these efforts set in motion further attempts at restrictive legislation designed to exclude undocumented students from accessing higher education, namely the Personal Responsibility and Reconciliation Act (PROWRA) of 1996 and the Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act (IIRIRA) of 1996. Finally, I will examine the period of 2001-2014 in which state legislatures have either expanded or further restricted higher education opportunities for undocumented students.

In order to better understand the significance of *Plyler v. Doe* it is important to understand the circumstances that led to this landmark case. The legal battle that developed throughout the 1970s in Texas highlights the overt discrimination undocumented students and their families faced. In 1975 the State of Texas updated the Texas Education Code, implementing a new regulation that allowed Independent School Districts (ISD) in Texas to charge a tuition rate of $1,000 to undocumented students or

flat out deny them enrollment.[1] The statute made it clear that those districts who would not comply with the new law would simply not qualify for state funding.[2] Following the enactment of section 21.031 in 1977, a group of undocumented Mexican children attempted to enroll at Tyler Independent School District, then led by Superintendent James Plyler, but were ultimately denied admission since they could not prove lawful presence.[3] After a series of litigation battles fought by Peter Roos and Vilma Martinez of the Mexican American Legal Defense and Educational Fund (MALDEF), the *Plyler v. Doe* case finally reached the Supreme Court of the United States in 1981 for initial hearings.[4] Finally, in 1982 the Supreme Court, in a 5-4 decision, ruled in favor of undocumented students. Justice Brennan, who gave the majority opinion, declared the Texas Education Code statute unconstitutional because it discriminated against students based on their immigration status. This was a clear violation of the Fourteenth Amendment's Equal Protection Clause which the Supreme Court determined included undocumented students.[5] While the Court held that education is not a constitutional right, they acknowledged the vital role of education in American society. Justice Brennan declared, "The deprivation of education is not like the deprivation of some other governmental benefit. Public education has a pivotal role in maintaining the fabric of our society and in sustaining our political and cultural heritage…"[6] Of similar importance was Justice Brennan comment on the position of undocumented children which held that the Texas statute "imposes a lifetime of hardship on a discrete class of children not accountable for their disabling status."[7] In other words, undocumented children should not bear the burden of their parents' mistakes.

Building on the landmark victory of the *Plyler v. Doe* case, efforts were continued to expand undocumented students' access to educational opportunities, especially those in higher education. Peter Roos, one of the key actors in the *Plyler* case, aimed his sights at the possibility of taking *Plyler* to college. Seeing as many of the students and beneficiaries of the *Plyler v. Doe* case would eventually graduate high school and be forced to grapple with their inability to attend college, it made sense to question how the case could expand educational benefits for undocumented students in the post-secondary realm. An example of the limited futures faced by undocumented students is Laura Alvarez's, a beneficiary of the *Plyler v. Doe* case. While Alvarez was given the opportunity to freely access a K-12 education despite her immigration status, "what was supposed to happen afterward for undocumented children like her was a

1 Michael A. Olivas, *No Undocumented Child Left Behind: Plyler v. Doe and the Education of Undocumented Schoolchildren.* (New York: New York University Press, 2012)*:* 9.

2 David H.K. Nguyen and Zelideh R. Martinez Hoy, "'Jim Crowing' Plyler v. Doe: The Resegregation of Undocumented Students in American Higher Education Through Discriminatory State Tuition and Fee Legislation" *Cleveland State Law Review* 63:2 (2015): 358.

3 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 358.

4 Olivas, 19.

5 Olivas, 19.

6 *Plyler v. Doe*, 457 U.S. 202 (1982).

7 *Plyler v. Doe*, 457 U.S. 202 (1982).

little vague."[8] In fact, Alvarez admits that she never gave herself the opportunity to dwell on the possibility of attending college.[9] While she attended the occasional class at Tyler Junior College, with the hope that one day she would be able to pursue her dream of becoming a teacher, Alvarez shifted her focus on finding a job that could sustain her and later, her family.[10] The cases fought by Roos and others in California and throughout the nation regarding the matter produced differing verdicts. The majority of these cases ultimately denied relief to undocumented students in higher education.[11] However, a notable case fought by Peter Roos in 1985 deserves mention. The case, *Leticia A. v. Regents of the University of California* involved a group of undocumented youth who had been granted admission to the University of California. The students slated to start college in the fall of 1984 were notified they'd have to pay non-resident tuition, despite residing in California for over 3 years.[12] Ultimately the Superior Court of California ruled that undocumented students were allowed "to establish in-state residency for tuition purposes and to apply for Cal Grants."[13] This decision was short-lived– overturned in 1991.[14] The *Plyler v. Doe* case, with which Roos and others hoped to use as a basis to extend relief to undocumented students pursuing or hoping to pursue higher education clearly did not provide a strong enough foundation. Even when undocumented students were granted some kind of relief, there was never any certainty that it would last. This would ring true for future cases.

Efforts to expand educational access for undocumented students collided with federal and state legislative challenges and complex societal attitudes towards immigration. In 1994, California's ballot initiative, Proposition 187 sought to deny "virtually all state-funded benefits, including public education, to undocumented aliens."[15] Motivated by personal interests, Pete Wilson, Governor of California at the time, found that by backing Proposition 187 and encouraging nativist anti-immigrant sentiment he could "build a bi-partisan coalition ensuring his reelection and the initiative's passage."[16] Support for the initiative did not fit neatly into typical partisan views on U.S. immigration policy. In fact, Proposition 187 received almost 60% of the vote, supported by individuals on both sides of the political spectrum.[17] While many sections of this initiative were struck down by the federal district court, including the provision meant to deny undocumented children access to K-12 education, the ban on post-secondary residency benefits remained. As David H.K. Nguyen and Zelideh R.

---

8 Olivas, 7.
9 Olivas, 7.
10 Olivas, 7.
11 Olivas, 32.
12 Olivas, 15.
13 Nancy Guarneros Cyndi Bendezu, Lindsay Perez Huber, Veronica N. Velez, and Daniel G. Solorzano, "Still Dreaming: Legislation and Legal Decisions Affecting Undocumented AB 540 Students." *Latino Policy and Issues Brief.* 23:1 (. 2009.): 1.
14 Guarneros et al.
15 Olivas, 32.
16 Olivas, 40.
17 Olivas, 32.

Martinez Hoy, education scholars argue, this kind of spectacle "renewed the intense debate and brought it back to the forefront."[18]

Surely enough, debates surrounding the matter further developed around the Personal Responsibility and Work Reconciliation Act (PROWRA) of 1996 and the Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act (IIRIRA) of 1996. These acts, largely the result of a Republican-controlled Congress, but supported by Democrat President Bill Clinton, "changed the federal social welfare and health benefits for undocumented immigrants."[19] While these changes are no doubt significant, for the purposes of this essay, I will only focus on the effects of PROWRA and IIRIRA on undocumented students in post-secondary education. PWROWRA was significant because it denied federal funding to "unqualified" non-citizens such as undocumented immigrants. This statute extended to local and state benefits as well, making it clear that "unless the state passes an affirmative law making them explicitly eligible,"[20] postsecondary benefits would remain unavailable to undocumented students. Another significant PROWRA provision restricts undocumented immigrants' eligibility for occupational licensure.[21] The Higher Ed Immigration Portal notes "Over 1,100 different occupations require a license and approximately 25 percent of all workers nationwide are required to obtain a license to work in their occupation."[22] Comprehensive access to occupational licensure is only available to undocumented immigrants in 5 states, including Illinois.[23] The presence of 427, 345 undocumented students in higher education makes this number incredibly troubling.[24] The enactment of PROWRA has presented significant barriers of affordability and access to employment opportunities for undocumented students in higher education.

Furthermore, the obstacles presented by PROWRA have been exacerbated by additional limitations introduced by IIRIRA which have further restricted educational and professional opportunities available to undocumented students. The IIRIRA provision that directly impacted undocumented students read that they could "not be eligible on the basis of residence within a State…for any postsecondary education benefit unless a citizen or national of the United States [is] also eligible for such benefit… without regard to whether the citizen or national is a resident."[25] This federal provision detailed that states, despite enacting legislation in accordance with PROWRA, could not grant undocumented students in-state tuition unless non-resident citizen students could also be afforded the same benefits. Fourteen years after *Plyler*, the matter had

18 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 360.

19 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 361.

20 Higher Ed Immigration Portal. (n.d.) Federal Policies. *Higher Ed Immigration Portal.* (accessed 14 March 2024)

21 Higher Ed Immigration Portal

22 Higher Ed Immigration Portal

23 Higher Ed Immigration Portal (n.d.) Professional and Occupational Licensure. *Higher Ed Immigration Portal.* (accessed 14 March 2024)

24 Higher Ed Immigration Portal (n.d.) Tuition and Financial Aid Equity for Undocumented Students. *Higher Ed Immigration Portal.* (accessed 14 March 2024)

25 Illegal Immigration Reform and Immigrant Responsibility Act, 8 U.S.C. § 505 (1996).

finally been settled: undocumented students were clearly not welcome in higher education. Without financial relief or secure employment opportunities after graduation, PROWRA and IIRIRA effectively worked to discriminate against undocumented students– keeping many of them from accessing higher education and facing limited futures after high school and in some cases, college.

While federal legislation had determined its stance on undocumented students in higher education, diverse responses have occurred at the state level. These responses illustrate the ongoing struggle of undocumented students pursuing higher education. From 2001-2014, 28 state legislatures have found effective legal avenues to expand access to higher education for undocumented students or further restrict.[26] Out of the 28 states, only 19 state legislatures enacted legislation during this time meant to afford undocumented students in-state tuition.[27] The criteria for these benefits have been based on a number of eligibility requirements including attendance at an in-state high school rather than the residency requirements prohibited by IIRIRA. In this manner, both undocumented students and documented non-resident students have an equal opportunity at accessing in-state tuition so long as they are able to prove that they attended and received a diploma from an in-state high school. Unfortunately, this "inclusive" legislation is limited and worse, it is always in legal limbo. For example, in 2014 Virginia lawmakers passed legislation that extended in-state tuition to undocumented students, but limited beneficiaries to those who were part of the federal Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) program.[28] Undocumented students without DACA would still be subject to non-resident tuition rates. Furthermore, the DACA program which has been in legal limbo since its inception, has never been a permanent solution. Since 2017, DACA has found itself continuously in and out of the courts. The latest ruling given by the U.S. District Judge Andrew Hanen on September 13, 2023, established that the program is still illegal. Thus, it is not always guaranteed that DACA recipients will exist, making Virginia's 2014 attempt at addressing post-secondary benefits for undocumented students limited and insubstantial. Moreover, undocumented students are never guaranteed that legislation meant to afford them in-state tuition won't suddenly be repealed. In 2009, Governor Jim Doyle of Wisconsin passed a law that granted eligible undocumented students access to in-state tuition.[29] This victory was largely the result of years-long organizing and advocacy work done by members and supporters of Voces de la Frontera and Students United for Immigrants Rights (SUFRIR).[30] However, in 2011, Governor Scott Walker repealed the law and extended restrictions to include DACA recipients.[31] In doing so, Governor Walker added Wisconsin to the list of states including Arizona, Georgia, South Carolina, Indi-

26 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 365-368.

27 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 365.

28 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 365.

29 Christine Neumann and Voces de la Frontera Staff. (n.d.) Voces de la Frontera History. *Voces de la Frontera*. https://vdlf.org/about/

30 Neumann et al.

31 Higher Ed Immigration Portal. (n.d.) Wisconsin. *Higher Ed Immigration Portal.* (accessed 14 March 2024)

ana, Alabama, and North Carolina with state actions aimed at banning undocumented students from accessing in-state tuition or enrollment altogether.[32] The case of Wisconsin shows the ever-changing reality undocumented students throughout the nation face. Even when a state legislature enacts "inclusionary" laws, their permanence is never guaranteed.

The evidence presented suggests that the legislative consequences of *Plyler v. Doe* have resulted in limited, piecemeal, and temporary educational and employment opportunities for undocumented students. Despite bold efforts, the relief has not extended beyond K-12 education and has left many undocumented students without access to postsecondary education opportunities. Legislation and societal attitudes opposing immigration have also contributed to an ongoing debate on immigrants' rights including discussion on whether undocumented students have a right to postsecondary education benefits. Although some state legislatures, with pressure from immigrants' rights activists and advocacy groups, have successfully found legal ways to circumvent PROWRA and IIRIRA, data from 2001-2014 shows that even the most "inclusive" state legislative efforts remain insubstantial to address the current needs of undocumented students in higher education. Without a permanent comprehensive solution, the futures of undocumented students both with and without DACA remain uncertain. Until then, they will be left at the mercy of state legislatures who at any moment could revoke their ability to access higher education and viable employment opportunities.

32 Nguyen and Martinez Hoy, 366.

[Feature Essays]

Judith Slaying Holofernes

Woman, Murderer, Icon

[Em Allen]

The biblical figure of Judith has long been understood as an ideal of feminine piety and chastity, and as a vessel of divine intervention.[1] Throughout the Renaissance, however, depictions of Judith evolved from those of a devout, asexual woman to a sensual, classical heroine. This shift reflects the Renaissance tensions between the humanistic quest for knowledge and the Counter-Reformation's need to assert moral authority. The rise of humanism encouraged interest in the human form and mind, allowing for more emphasis on Judith's sexuality and capability. At the same time, her status as a paragon of biblical virtues and an instrument of God, combined with her eventual narrative return to domesticity, allowed her actions to be seen as unthreatening, even worthy of celebration. While her story continued to be understood as a metaphor for the victory of God and his people, she also became emblematic of major religious and civic virtues such as humility, justice, and triumph. These trends enabled the unusual popularity and potency of Renaissance iconography of Judith as a heroine representing both feminine moral virtue and masculine physical courage.[2]

The tale of Judith is thousands of years old, originating from the scriptural text *The Book of Judith*. Generally understood as an allegorical tale, it tells the story of the Assyrian invasion of Israel, under the leadership of Holofernes. Judith, trying to protect her town of Bethulia, sought entry into Holofernes' camp, which she was granted due to her beauty. Eventually, Judith cut off a drunk, powerless Holofernes' head with his sword, her faithful maidservant keeping watch outside his tent. They returned to Bethulia with Holofernes' head and their people defeated the Assyrian

1 Diana Apostolos-Cappadona, "Costuming Judith in Italian Art of the Sixteenth Century," in *The Sword of Judith: Judith Studies Across the Disciplines* (Open Book Publishers, 2010), 327-328;

2 Robert M. Knotts, "Judith in Florentine Renaissance Art, 1425-1512" (The Ohio State University, 1995), 3.

forces.[3]

As with many originally Jewish stories, hers was absorbed by and used to reinforce Christianity and its values. The earliest known image of Judith is an eighth century fresco in a Roman church, which depicts her serenely holding Holofernes' head.[4] Medieval Judith imagery remained largely confined to religious spaces and manuscripts; often alongside other biblical scenes and figures, representing salvation, chastity, and virtue. [5] Judith was consistently shown in simple clothing, regardless of the importance of elaborate dress and jewelry in her biblical text.[6] It was not until the early Quattrocento that Judith depictions are known to have been produced for private, domestic display, and in many new mediums. Judith's popularity peaked in the Renaissance; numerous notable artists produced depictions of her that infused her religious imagery with political overtones. The earliest prominent example of her influence is Donatello's bronze *Judith*, commissioned by the Medici clan in 1457 for semi-private display. Donatello's *Judith* transformed the formal conventions of Judith imagery. While medieval Judith was a pious widow in humble clothing, Donatello's is dressed luxuriously. The references to classical antiquity and warrior status are pervasive, from clothing–visually quoting both Medicean and classical armor–to her victor's pose, gazing down at her enemy. Her armor transforms her into a classical female warrior, and her fine dress, true to the original tale, changes her into a wealthy Renaissance woman.[7] She is also physically dominant, her foot on Holofernes' wrist, one hand gripping his hair and turning his head, the other raised high with a lethal sword. In Donatello's reinvention of her image, Judith appears both pious and warriorlike.

Donatello's *Judith* was highly political in both form and context. When the Medici were in power, their *Judith* could be understood as representing their piety, humility, and unity; an inscription on its base reads, translated, "Kingdoms fall through luxury, cities rise through virtues; behold the neck of pride severed by the hand of humility." This latter threat is represented quite literally by Judith's sword raised up to cut through Holofernes' neck.[8] She was originally located near Donatello's earlier bronze *David* (c.1440s) in the Medici gardens, a figure with whom Judith was often associated in Florence. Both figures functioned as political symbols of Florentine strength and republicanism, the meek overtaking the strong.

Judith and David's situations were similar—both defeated tyrants in defense of their people, sanctioned by God—but their narratives ended very differently, reflecting gender norms. David went on to become a king, though he would later fall from grace, but Judith's story went nowhere. She retreated to her home and resumed her domestic widow's life. Accordingly, David imagery was largely public, and with

3 Knotts, 2.

4 Diana Apostolos-Cappadona, "Costuming Judith in Italian Art of the Sixteenth Century," 328.

5 Robert M. Knotts, "Judith in Florentine Renaissance Art, 1425-1512," 1-4; Richard J. Kubiak, "The iconography of Judith in Italian Renaissance art," (Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin, 1965), 6-8.

6 Diana Apostolos-Cappadona, "Costuming Judith in Italian Art of the Sixteenth Century," 329.

7 Apostolos-Cappadona, 330-332.

8 Roger J. Crum, "Severing the Neck of Pride: Donatello's '"Judith and Holofernes'" and the Recollection of Albizzi Shame in Medicean Florence," *Artibus et Historiae* 22, no. 44 (2001): 303.

few exceptions, Judith imagery was intended for private display.[9] For this reason, the transfer of Donatello's *Judith* to Florence's central plaza, after the exile of the Medici, was startling—and impermanent. The public display of *Judith* transformed her into an explicitly anti-authoritarian, anti-Medicean symbol.[10] However, she was replaced just a decade later by Michelangelo's *David*. The Florentine council member who argued for her removal contended that the statue was inappropriate as a former Medici symbol and it was "not fitting that the woman should slay the man."[11]

Like Donatello's sculpture, early Renaissance paintings of Judith tended to depict the moments just before or after the murder, foregrounding Judith's ambivalence about performing this necessary but distasteful deed. Michelangelo Buonarotti's *Judith* fresco in the Sistine chapel from around 1510 shows her as a muscular woman, yet she modestly turns her head away from the head of Holofernes, which is covered with a cloth. Holofernes' contorted body lies out of her sight, in shadow. She is physically strong, but weak-stomached. Her physical robustness here contrasts sharply with Caravaggio's *Judith Beheading Holofernes* from 1600, in which the heroine is dainty, unconvincingly grabbing at the enormous Holofernes' hair, the sword like a slender dagger in comparison to his body. Even more so than in Michelangelo's depiction, Judith is visibly disturbed. This is shown in the way she holds him at arm's length, leaning away with an expression of unease. The blood spurting from his neck is directed away from her, leaving her clothing unstained, and her face is bathed in light, a sign of divine blessing. Caravaggio's Judith is undeniably feminine, and though disturbed by her action, morally pure.

Other Renaissance artists treated Judith's transgressively masculine aspects more explicitly and emphasized her active participation. Giorgio Vasari's oil painting *Judith and Holofernes* from 1554 echoes Michelangelo's, but depicts her as strong both physically and mentally. She holds the sword, pulling Holofernes' unresisting head down with ease, and gazes dispassionately down at him, undisturbed. Even more unapologetic is Artemisia Gentileschi's oil painting *Judith Beheading Holofernes* from 1620. Shown in the very act of decapitation, Judith is well-built, wrestling his writhing body into submission as her strong arm forces the sword through his neck, her gaze fixed resolutely on his face. There is blood on her hand, his blood spurting toward her. The ends of her sleeves, rolled up in a practical manner, are red, indicating the corruption of her innocence. Gentileschi's Judith is the very picture of strength in mind and body, bloody-handed. In Gentileschi's 1623 painting of the same story, *Judith and her Maidservant*, Judith's hands are clean, her hand and righteous sword are lit with divine light, while her maidservant's hands are bloodied. Still, Judith is tainted by the sin of the deed, her face cast in shadow.

Beyond Judith's physical strength and ruthlessness, other Renaissance paint-

9 Crum, 292-294.

10 Roger J. Crum, "Judith between the Private and Public Realms in Renaissance Florence," in *The Sword of Judith: Judith Studies Across the Disciplines* (Open Book Publishers, 2010), 305-306.

11 Saul Levine, "The Location of Michelangelo's David: The Meeting of January 25, 1504," *The Art Bulletin* 56, no. 1 (1974), 36.

ers underscore the encounter's sexual aspects. When his body is pictured, Holofernes is often shown naked and abed, and while many images show Judith fully clothed, just as many show her suggestively dressed or provocatively posed. Giorgione's 1504 Judith gazes down demurely like Venus or Virgin Mary. Yet the fully exposed length of her leg, foot resting lightly on Holofernes' head, and the blush pink of her dress, cast her as more of a Venus. Fede Galizia's 1596 Judith is even more sumptuously clothed in a revealing dress, while her maidservant lurks appraisingly behind Judith, reminiscent of a bordello's madam.[12] Giovanni Baglione's Judith from 1608 is fully nude from the waist up, stepping away from the monstrous, contorted nude body of Holofernes—who can say what had occurred just minutes prior? To preserve Judith's reputation, her maidservant is often intrusively present, unlike the biblical account: Gentileschi's Judith holds the struggling, naked Holofernes down and her maidservant helps her, saving her from the compromising position of being alone with a naked man.

In every depiction, Judith maintains her femininity as regards her moral purity, while her relationship to Holofernes' stolen, phallic sword allows her to claim masculinity to varying degrees. Throughout Renaissance imagery of Judith, the sword disappears out of frame as she wields it above her head, it dangles limply beside her, it is not anywhere to be seen; each iteration brings with it different emphasis on her accountability, her strength, her masculinity. Galizia's Judith holds a dagger suggestively at groin level. In Gentileschi's earlier *Judith with Her Maidservant* from 1613, she rests the sword comfortably on her shoulder. The act of decapitation is comparable to castration; biblical scholar Ela Nutu notes that Holofernes' bare arms resemble thighs as Gentileschi's Judith forces them apart, suggesting sexual assault.[13] The power dynamics of gender are reversed here, as in the original text, which is what so strongly disturbed the Florentine council member who argued for the removal of Donatello's *Judith*. The woman is beautiful and seductive, yet calculated and powerful, while the man who holds cultural and political power quite literally loses his head.[14] These depictions emphasize the will of God through the light on her face and the red drape often seen in the background—the gender role reversal is less disturbing if Judith can be seen as an instrument of God rather than a woman acting of her own will. Judith as a "phallic woman" is a challenge for male artists; to show her acting under God's (a man's) will deflects that challenge.[15]

Judith is thus shown to be both a murderer and a righteous woman, performing a violent physical act generally reserved for men while embodying the moral virtue expected of women, albeit occasionally accompanied by suggestive sexual imagery. Rather than being condemned, Judith is highly praised for her courageous, potentially self-sacrificing action, because she acted according to the will of God, and killed the "right" enemy.[16] When depicted as an asexual, pious, divine vessel, she is a

12 Ela Nutu, "Framing Judith: Whose Text, Whose Gaze, Whose Language?" 135-136.
13 Nutu, 126.
14 Nutu, 117-118.
15 Nutu, 132, 141-142.
16 Nutu, 117-118.

prototype of the Virgin Mary, and though she becomes more challenging as a strong, sensual woman, the emphasis on her femininity and virtuousness allows her to retain acceptable devotional status. The example of Judith provides a useful insight into the line Renaissance artists had to walk in depicting female icons who inhabit the liminal space between secular and sacred, masculine and feminine, virtuous and sinful. Judith is the rare female figure who fits those criteria; murderer, woman, icon nonetheless. The tenuous nature of her perception in art can speak to the standards placed upon women in the real world, for they are not nearly so one-sided as even Judith's most nuanced depictions. If this fictional heroine's masculinity, power, and sin were (barely, at times) acceptable only due to her extraordinary virtue and God's own ordinance, then the reality of women who could not hope for divine intervention to excuse their own sins was confining, and, in some ways, remains so even today.

Colonization

Expectations and Results

[Kieran Artley]

Edmund Morgan's book *American Slavery, American Freedom* states that the "major part of the colonist's work time" was intended to be used in the generation of "promised riches" for exportation back to England, which is not too great a departure from Hakluyt's original plan.[1] In this paper I will argue that Virginia's development from Hakluyt's vision came about from a shift in economic priorities and focus as part of a move from an unstable frontier colony to a more established and stable colony. To do so I will first look at Hakluyt's vision for the colonies, then how the colonies failed to meet these expectations, and finally how the colonies changed and adapted to the conditions of the New World. Hakluyt and Morgan's writings demonstrate change by economic and social factors built on the evolution of labor in Virginia, from planned exploitation of natives to indentured servants to slaves.

Before beginning I will evaluate my sources. The two sources used for this paper are Richard Hakluyt's *Discourse on Western Planting* and Edmund Morgan's *American Slavery, American Freedom.*[2] Hakluyt's writing is a primary source written in an attempt to convince the monarch and investors to launch an expedition to the Americas. As a result, he twists or outright fabricates information to make his proposal look better. It is an assessment of how Hakluyt wants the expedition to go, not a record of actual occurrences, which further skews his statements. However, it is still a perfectly viable source despite these limits, since my argument revolves around the differences between Hakluyt's predictions and Morgan's analysis of what happened.

---

1 Edmund Sears Morgan, *American Slavery, American Freedom* (New York: W.W. Norton, 2003), 87.

2 Richard Hakluyt, "A particular discourse concerning the great necessity and manifold commodities that are like to grow to this Realm of England by the Western discoveries lately attempted, written in the year 1584," National Humanities Center, 2006, excerpted from David B. Quinn & Allison M. Quinn, eds. *Discourse of Western Planting* (London: Hakluyt Society, 1993)..

As a secondary source, Morgan's book is written largely to argue that slavery "created" the American ideal of freedom and shows the progression of that. It is a record of actual occurrences from the perspective of a historian. Due to this, Morgan's writing is a reliable source of information.

To begin, Hakluyt believed that colonization was necessary in order to provide England with a means of countering Spanish holdings in America. He writes that "all other English trades are grown beggarly or dangerous" due to their proximity to Spanish territory, where a wreck or other accident would lead to the Spanish seizing the ship and its goods along with the men crewing it.[3] Since this is clearly untenable in his eyes, he proposes that they should turn the tables on the Spanish, setting up "two or three strong forts" along the coast of the Americas to intercept Spanish fleets coming from the New World.[4] His final main point regarding the Spanish presence is that they are spread thin and have not conquered or befriended all the natives in the areas they hold.[5] As a result, if England were to launch her own colonization attempt they would be able to potentially remove the Spanish from some of their holdings and even the field more between England and Spain.

Hakluyt also frames his expedition goals as a religious mission to convert the natives and thereby save them. He views the natives of the Americas as ripe to be taught the Protestant faith, again in conflict with the Catholic Spanish crown and the Pope, stating that they will "Enlarge the glory of the Gospel and from England plant sincere religion."[6] This thought of teaching the natives English religion was motivated by the hostility between the Catholic Spanish and Protestant English, since by spreading their brand of Christianity they would hold more religious sway in the continued cultural wars. However, Hakluyt did not originally provide for sending priests and bibles with the expedition, instead adding such concerns later on, which implies that religion was more of a front than an actual reason for the expedition to the Americas.[7]

Hakluyt's final main reason is that the establishment of a British presence would give new opportunities for trade and wealth to grow, enriching England in the process. A major part of his desire for a colony is that the trade routes "cuts not near the trade of any prince," and provides a "safe passage" to bring goods back to England from afar.[8] The benefit of this is that trade cannot be intercepted by the enemies of the English crown if it is coming from the ocean rather than near the coast, along with Hakluyt believing that the Americas had vast untapped wealth in the form of gold or other natural resources. A point of note is that the *Discourse* also contains a plea to the "noble man…gentleman…merchant…citizen…countrymen" who would "offer of himself to contribute," implying that Hakluyt believed that the new lands would be so

3 Hakluyt, *Discourse,* 1.
4 Hakluyt, *Discourse*, 2.
5 Hakluyt, *Discourse,* 3.
6 Hakluyt, *Discourse,* 7.
7 Hakluyt, *Discourse,* 10.
8 Hakluyt, *Discourse,* 7.

lucrative and enticing that everyone would want to go.[9] He also mentions in the same lines that it would be a good way to rid England of unemployed poor people.

In regards to these poor people, Morgan demonstrates that the poor and desperate were largely just shipped off to the colony or placed into indentured servitude to serve as a labor force for the newly established colonies. This was a direct result of Hakluyt's desire to make the colonies an extension of England's economy and even more diverse; by sending over only skilled workers, such as goldsmiths and perfumers, Morgan points out that once they found they had no work they would not take to the fields, but rather simply loaf around until they did have work to do that was not beneath their class.[10] This led to the Virginia company requesting inmates, criminals, and anyone living destitute on the streets to be shipped to the colony as a labor force.[11] However, the lack of work for specialists meant that the colony could not fulfill Hakluyt's original goal of skilled workers trading goods back to England.

One of the major departures from Hakluyt's original goal was the lack of religious presence. Since survival was such a concern in Virginia, religion was not the foremost issue the colony faced.[12] Warfare with the natives, harsh conditions and a lack of preparation killed large amounts of the prospective colonists, forcing the colony to import additional labor and continuing to ensure that the goal of converting the natives to Christianity remained far away. Without good relations with most natives initially, and outright hostility at times, along with the colony itself not being able to guarantee that they had a pastor, religion fell by the wayside as a goal of the expedition. The initial goal of using the natives as a workforce was also not realized as people began to view the natives as obstacles to be removed rather than another civilization to work with, further straying from the initial goals laid out by Hakluyt.

As the religious aspect waned, the settlers began to view the natives with suspicion and took more and more land from them. Prolonged warfare with the natives and a deep suspicion of them completely eroded the original idea of "Good Indians" providing a buffer for the colony against hostile natives.[13] This is significant because events such as Bacon's Rebellion came about as a reaction to native presence and desire to eradicate them. This continued a trend of treaties with the natives either being disregarded or broken out of distrust or outright hatred, leading to a resurgence of hostilities.[14] Bacon's stance on the natives was not uncommon, with much of the populace joining him in his rebellion expressly to go fight the natives, demonstrating that the general view on the natives had evolved from one of enlightenment, civilization and teaching to one of oppression and destruction.

Instead of enlightenment, the settlers began to work on agriculture, both for survival and for profit. Tobacco was a highly profitable crop and helped solve the colo-

9 Hakluyt, *Discourse,* 6.
10 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 85-86.
11 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 86.
12 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 101.
13 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 255.
14 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 251.

ny's first difficulties with finding labor. Demand for servants was incredibly high, even during the periods when food was hard to come by, as a direct result of tobacco and the prices it would fetch on the market.[15] This tobacco boom enticed people to sail across the ocean to the colony and provided a labor force of men looking to get rich once they were freed from servitude. However, tobacco took up such a focus that people would not plant the food they needed to survive, instead only planting tobacco.[16] This is particularly at odds with Hakluyt's idea of what the colony should have been; rather than producing its own food and providing abundant resources for skilled artisans to work, the artisans could find no labor and the colony dedicated its entire time to the production and sale of tobacco. Even when something was supposed to be set up, such as ironworks, everyone sent to work it would shift to growing tobacco instead.[17] This widespread farming demanded people to work the fields and represented a great shift in focus for the colony.

This shift finally culminated in the widespread adoption of slavery in Virginia. Slavery had become more and more attractive as lifespans increased in the colony, especially with the conditions of servitude in the colony's early years being closer to slavery than England would normally permit.[18] In turn, this lead to there being "more of the rich and fewer of the not-so rich," especially as it became more profitable to buy slaves instead of hiring indentured servants.[19] Slavery was slowly phased into existence as lifespans increased and it became more profitable to enslave a worker rather than hire him for a term of years.[20] Additionally, the flow of people from England to the colony was slowing down over time, as Bacon's Rebellion and less overpopulation in England made moving across the ocean less enticing.[21] This lack of new labor provided further impetus to transition to slavery. The expansion of slavery allowed the masters to keep a population of working age in the fields as the older workers exited their prime working age along with female slaves giving birth to children who were then enslaved, allowing masters to purchase less slaves.[22] This was greatly helped by the fact that slave traders carried a much higher ratio of women than the amount that willingly came to the colony in its early years.[23]

The colonies changed greatly over time, especially regarding labor and living conditions. Hakluyt's appraisal of the New World was highly optimistic and idealized, and therefore did not survive settler's first contacts with Virginia. The colonies therefore had to adapt to the New World, shifting the colony away from a focus on extracting gold and generating specialist work to a focus on tobacco and agriculture.

---

15 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 108.
16 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 109.
17 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 109.
18 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 296.
19 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 341.
20 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 297.
21 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 299.
22 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 310.
23 Morgan, *American Slavery,* 310.

They accomplished this by harsh servitude and slavery, creating a stratified society where the working class was held in contempt below everyone else and divided based on race. Overall, the great difference between Hakluyt's vision for the colony and the end result is that Hakluyt's original idea was to use the natives as the colony's workforce, while the final result was a system of slavery directed against Africans rather than native Americans.

The Body Reborn

[Aaron Brand]

To say that our bodies bear the weight of our experience is, perhaps, an understatement. Our lives are inscribed on our skin indelibly, though we may often wish it were otherwise. For early Christian theologians, this relation to our bodily form was a question of deep significance. Whether our physicality was cast off once we ascended in a resurrected state was no foregone conclusion, and it was this idea of the discarding of the body that so incensed Jerome and inspired Augustine. Both theologians differ in minute details, but neither is comfortable letting the body be entirely left behind upon our ascension. In this essay, I will explain Jerome and Augustine's view of the centrality of bodily resurrection and how this informs their understanding of the body as the repository of difference. After a brief overview of the sources in question, I will review Origen's position on the physical continuity of the resurrection, and then exposit Jerome and Augustine's view on the importance of the resurrection of the flesh. I will then discuss both theologians' treatment of the perfect body, which will be followed by an examination of Jerome and Augustine's views on the minimum necessary physical continuity for the preservation of identity. I close with an overview of the body's essential role in differentiation for both authors, and an inspection of the relative importance of identity and God.

Before treating the question of Jerome and Augustine's views on the resurrection, I will provide a brief overview of the texts in question. Both theologians were active in the late fourth and early fifth centuries CE, writing after the conversion of Constantine during which Christianity came into a favored status in Rome. Both Jerome and Augustine are foundational thinkers in Christian theology, with Jerome having written the "Vulgate" Bible which was the primary translation of the document until the Protestant Reformation, and Augustine being the most influential theologian of Latin Christianity, who in addition to his "Enchiridion" wrote "The City of God"

and his deeply personal "Confessions." Jerome approaches the question of resurrection from a deeply ascetic tradition, which is evident in various particulars of the text. His position on the resurrection of the body is outlined in his letter to Pammachius, wherein he rails against another theologian, Origen, through the proxy of John of Jerusalem. Jerome represents a rival school of thought to Origen (and John of Jerusalem) regarding the form in which resurrected bodies will rise after death. Due to this antagonism, Jerome's summary of Origen must be read warily, as he is by no means a sympathetic reader of the latter. However, Jerome does apparently quote Origen verbatim at numerous points in the text and is further committed to providing an adequate refutation of Origen in order to convince followers of Jerome's (perceived) correct view of the miracle of resurrection. The second text treated in this examination is a selection from Augustine's "Enchiridion," which he published as a handbook for the appropriate way of living life as a Christian. Augustine is writing to sort out various doctrinal questions of Christian theology, and as such is concerned primarily with addressing a contemporary Christian audience that is largely aware of important theological questions. Along these lines, Augustine and Jerome were contemporaries who, though by no means identical, agreed in large part in their interpretation of the resurrection. The texts utilized thus provide an important response to Origen's particular interpretation of bodily resurrection, with Jerome writing directly against him and Augustine treating Origen's doctrine peripherally.

Origen interprets the resurrection as being fundamentally a transfiguration into a spiritual body, one which shares identity with the physical body but is nonetheless wholly changed. The reasons for this (as related by Jerome) are twofold: one resulting from the perceived physical nature of bodies, the other from a practical consideration of capabilities. Regarding the former, Origen claims that the physical end of the body necessitates a change in form, wherein the composite matter is irrevocably mixed and cannot be "altogether the same that they were."[1] As to Origen's latter consideration, he claims that the body after resurrection must be "a different body, spiritual and ethereal," and not merely a continuation of the flesh.[2] For Origen, conceiving of the resurrected body as being fundamentally the same as before resurrection is nonsensical. Indeed, he posits that if "our bodies are to be the same [as before resurrection]," it would follow that the same physical needs and wants would plague those in Heaven as they did those on Earth.[3] This, to Origen, is an absurdity that no theologian would posit, since none would suggest that the angelic host is beset by the demands of the flesh. Rather, the body must be transfigured, must become something ultimately incorporeal to ascend to its rightful place.

Contra Origen, the resurrected body for both Jerome and Augustine is meaningfully our own original body, with its physical properties intact. The preservation

1 Jerome, "Letter to Pammachius against John of Jerusalem," cc. 23-37, in Jerome, ed. and trans. Philip Schaff and Henry Wace, Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, series 2, volume 6 (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1892), 436.

2 Jerome, 437.

3 Jerome, 437.

of physical continuity is paramount for Jerome, who views the denial of the flesh as a denial of the continuity of resurrection. It is with this consideration in mind that Jerome states that the "true confession of the resurrection declares that the flesh will be glorious, but without destroying its reality."[4] Later, Jerome reads Job as lamenting the possibility that "all his sufferings would be in vain," that is, that the travails of the body would be rendered some discarded virtue upon ascending.[5] Though without the ascetic tinge, Augustine echoes this sentiment in stating that our bodies will be restored "out of the whole of the matter of which [they were] originally composed," and will not be something of a fundamentally changed nature.[6] For both theologians, the prospect of the resurrection without the resurrection of the flesh is meaningless, Jerome going so far as to state that "the reality of a resurrection without flesh and bones, without blood and members, is unintelligible."[7] Augustine likewise states that "no Christian should have the slightest doubt," as to bodily resurrection.[8]

For Jerome and Augustine, the natural disposition of the physical body will be transcended in the miracle of resurrection. Though the body will be physically continuous with that of the individual before resurrection, it will nonetheless be its perfected form. This is made evident when Augustine treats the question of various "monsters" that he claims will be raised "in an amended nature and free from faults."[9] Similarly, Jerome notes that even without resurrection, one who is graced by God has "the stripes of his offences" healed with "immortality."[10] Further, Jerome and Augustine distinguish the natural and supernatural dispositions of the body, both of which are united in the resurrected flesh. Thus, Jerome states that the flesh instantiates both the sin and the salvation of Jesus, being "mortal according to nature, eternal according to grace."[11] Augustine echoes this sentiment when, speaking on the question of the age at which one will be resurrected, he says "nature […] will be cheated of nothing apt and fitting" but in the same breath states that nothing will remain disfigured "which time has wrought."[12] In this way, the two authors suspend the resurrected body between nature and miracle, careful not to let the gross obscure the divine.

Though the body retains its physicality in resurrection, in the view of both Jerome and Augustine, inessential elements are not incarnated. That the flesh need not be brought back in total fidelity to its original state is somewhat unexpected given the emphasis on continuity in both author's accounts. However, this apparent inconsistency gives way when both theologians are understood as placing the importance of

4 Jerome, 438.
5 Jerome, 439.
6 Augustine, *Enchiridion*, c. 23, in *Augustine: Confessions and Enchiridion*, ed. and trans. Albert Cook Outler, The Library of Christian Classics (London: Westminster John Knox, 1955; reprinted 2006), 392.
7 Jerome, 440.
8 Augustine, 390.
9 Augustine, 391.
10 Jerome, 441.
11 Jerome, 441.
12 Augustine, 390.

bodily continuity as the site of witness to God. Thus, Jerome yields that, in addition to the fact that there will be no need of barbers in Heaven, infants and the old will be resurrected to a state of "mature manhood," in clear defiance of the inscription of time and woes on the body.[13] Since babes and those hobbled in old age cannot attest to the glory, their physical continuity is dismissed. Augustine likewise dismisses the "wholly unbecoming image" that results from speculation that the nail clippings removed in life will be returned to the resurrected body.[14] Further, Augustine claims that saints will rise "free from blemish and deformity," which stands against the possibility of the martyrs bearing the marks of their pious suffering.[15] In mirror to the priority of glory over physical identity, Augustine seems unperturbed by questions of the bodies of the damned and whether they will "rise again with all their faults and deformities": rather, all that matters is that "their damnation is certain and eternal."[16] Though both authors subordinate the identity of the body to the glory of God, the relative inconsequentiality of the body in Augustine stands in tension with Jerome's conception of the body, and identity, as the physical locus of salvation.

The physical body provides the source of differentiation between entities in the state of resurrection. Though both authors speak to this point, it is Jerome who most clearly locates the identity in the physical state of the body. Far from being a mere vessel for the soul, Jerome witnesses the miracle through the pain of the flesh. It is in this vein that we must understand him when he speaks of Job as singularly speaking to the question of resurrection.[17] For Jerome, Job's flesh "shall see God" and is the conduit whereby that blessed man is borne to salvation.[18] The manner in which the flesh/body conveys the individual to witness God is precisely the opposite of the way in which "our senses are not to be relied on, especially sight."[19] To deny the flesh is to "do away with what constituted Job," but beyond this, for Jerome it is to deny the only reliable means with which Job, in his suffering, can be said to have perceived God.[20] However, Augustine is here much more ambivalent as to the firmness of physical identity than Jerome. Though Augustine takes care to point out that God, as artist, will show fidelity to the matter of His original creation, the important aspect is that the "Artist takes care that nothing unbecoming will result."[21] With an emphasis more upon the reflection of God's perfection in the resurrected body than upon the importance of identity of itself, Augustine equivocates on whether the resurrected will be differentiated. Thus, he states that "if this is in the Creator's plan," mankind will be brought back such that each shall retain his "special features" with which they are differentiated.[22] Further,

13 Jerome, 440.
14 Augustine, 391.
15 Augustine, 392.
16 Augustine, 393.
17 Jerome, 439.
18 Jerome, 439.
19 Jerome, 443.
20 Jerome, 439.
21 Augustine, 392.
22 Augustine, 392.

when comparing the resurrected bodies in their possible "intelligible inequality," he says that they will be brought back in such a way as to complement each other like a harmonious choir.[23] Augustine's regard for the body as site of identity is here belied by his disregard for that which does not reflect the magnificence of God.

In some metaphysical conceptions, the physical and the spiritual's happy coincidence become uncoupled upon our deaths. For both Jerome and Augustine, the centrality of physical continuity denies the possibility of ascension without the flesh. However, for neither scholar is every mark and blemish integral to the central identity of the individual, as we will rise (in some form or another) a greater version of that physical object that we had been consigned to in life. For Jerome, the deep lessons transcribed in the flesh are more integral in forming an identity, though that identity itself is sublimated in the experience of God which was its ultimate purpose. It is likely that his asceticism informs his interpretation of resurrection, wherein the labors and lessons undergone in the service of God would be translated into a holy body upon rebirth. Augustine is seemingly less concerned with his identity than with God's perfection, wherein He may, according to His will, instantiate the most perfect version of us (his imperfect mirrors) in Heaven. Augustine thus allows that God may, or may not, preserve this or that difference upon our resurrection.[24] Despite these distinctions, both Jerome and Augustine locate our bodily identity in the service of God, either through our specific worldly actions, as with Jerome, or in our reliable translation of His perfection. As Jerome says, our bodies are the site wherein the life of Christ "is manifested," and ought to be conducted accordingly.[25]

23 Augustine, 392.
24 Augustine, 392.
25 Jerome, 441.

The Real Scares In Scooby-Doo 2

A Feminist Analysis

[Claire Pardus]

What's scarier than the looming patriarchy hindering minorities such as women, people of color, and queer individuals from making strides in the world and being adequately represented in modern media? If you said *Scooby-Doo 2: Monsters Unleashed* (2004)[1], you're on the right track. At least, on the right track for this discussion. Some might think of this film as a cult classic that rolls into everyone's Netflix recommendations in late October, but I would argue that it serves as a twenty-year-old time capsule of how visual media portrayed existing ideas of gender, women, feminism, and masculinity. *Scooby-Doo 2* is a film that relates to pop culture and feminism through the messages it relates to its audience through storyline and characters. By examining these aspects in terms of Laura Mulvey's male gaze, Deanna D. Sellnow's visual pleasure theory, Lindy West's argument on anger in women, and bell hooks' concept of white power feminism, we can unravel how the implications of these elements perpetuate the modern day patriarchy.

Like much of the media that we consume today, this movie was geared to consciously please their audience. There's the one aspect of beloved characters getting up to their silly antics, but on the other hand we have the film perpetrating the male gaze through our heroines. To understand this concept, one needs to take a step back into 1975 when academic Laura Mulvey puts a name to this concept in her work "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema". According to Mulvey, the male gaze places a woman as a visual object for the audience, particularly in film and movie production, as they are the subject of men objectifying them and are thus objectified by the audience.[2] This is undoubtedly the case in *Scooby-Doo 2* where Daphne and, at points,

1 *Scooby-Doo 2: Monsters Unleashed*, directed by Raja Gosnell (2004; Los Angeles, CA: Warner Bros. Pictures, 2006), DVD.

2 Laura Mulvey, *Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema* (Glasgow, Scotland: Screen, 1975), 62-3.

Velma, cater to this objectification of women through their visual appearances. The former struts into frame either with her iconic gaga boots or bell bottom leggings, both of these being in variations of purple and pink. Meanwhile, Velma is the main focus of the film's subplot as she uncharacteristically adorns a skin-tight orange jumpsuit to appeal to her romantic interest. These characters have interactions with other masculine-presenting characters that illuminate their hyperfemininity while being objects of appeal for a masculine audience. With this in mind, it's clear that there is hardly any content in this film that presents women in a positive or powerful position without being degraded to their bodies and womanhood for the pleasure of others.

Deanna D. Sellnow furthers this idea in her own discussions of visual pleasure theory, arguing that "it focuses on messages of narcissism…, [and] fetishism" to illuminate how visual media such as movies perpetuate the appeasement of the male, heterosexual gaze[3]. Rewatching the movie with a keen eye and open ear, one might be surprised to find subtle undertones throughout the story and dialogue pushing women to be happy by 1.) looking "beautiful," and 2.) seeking companionship through a man. Daphne needs her Fred, Velma needs her Patrick, so on and so forth. Moreover, these characters are fetishized by the audience as they stand on polar opposites of the "womanly" spectrum that appeal to a larger heterosexual male audience: the Barbie doll klutz and the shy, reserved nerd. Consider that final fight scene with the monsters where Daphne and Velma each have a spontaneously brave moment, but beyond that their characters have no variation or depth. With all of this taken into consideration, it's clear that *Scooby-Doo 2* perpetuates unhealthy and unnecessary standards for women that they must be visually pleasing to look at by men in order to be accepted by men and, by extension, society as a whole.

In line with Mulvey's male gaze is Sellnow's further discussion on the variety of feminist perspectives throughout the decades, specifically the radical feminist perspective. The lack of queer characters is glaring when applying a radical feminist perspective, and is all the more glaring when one considers how the franchise emanates the all-loving hippie aesthetic or even the queer undertones from character portrayal and dialogue. In a brief yet heart-touching conversation between Velma, Shaggy, and Scooby-Doo where Shaggy tells her that he and Scooby have tried to be heroes but failed, she replies in surprise claiming that she had always thought of them as heroes. "I've always wanted to be like you guys. You guys are so free. You're never afraid to be who you really are."[4] As the goal of the radical feminist perspective is to "reveal how objectifying hegemonic beliefs and behaviors based on sex, gender, or sexual orientation are reinforced or challenged in some way," one can view this scene as a cultural reinforcement that everybody is heterosexual and that Velma would *never* be hinting at anything besides her quirky, nerdy personality when claiming she wishes to be "free."[5] The male gaze assumes that men and women can only be attracted to

3 Deanna D. Sellnow, *The Rhetorical Power of Popular Culture: Considering Mediated Texts, Third Edition* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc, 2018), 13.

4 *Scooby-Doo 2: Monsters Unleashed*.

5 Sellnow, 145.

each other, but by thinking about the film through the radical feminist perspective this assumption is made glaringly obvious and, unfortunately, one of the film's greatest downfalls despite its messages of "being true to yourself."

If I were to ask you to picture an angry feminist, you'd probably have someone with at least one of the following traits: brightly dyed hair, unconventional appearance, and their mouth wide open shouting or chanting. These are the characteristics that make up a feminist depicted in 2000s media, and *Scooby Doo 2* is no exception. At the start of the movie, most viewers can't help but to associate the pink-haired superfan of Velma's with the iconic video clip of Canadian feminist Chanty Binx, or "Big Red," who gained internet notoriety through aggressive feminist activism[6]. On a similar page, Daphne gets told by a news reporter named Heather that she's only good to the team for being a nice thing to look at. She tries to find reassurance from her partner Fred by asking if he thinks she's "just a pretty face,"[7] but fails to gain any resolution from this heated conflict. Of course this is brought into discussion right when a pivotal moment in the movie's plot occurs, so her anger is dismissed as nothing more than a joke that is never resolved by the end of the film. Women who work hard to break down the patriarchy by expression or questioning are reprimanded for their "out of hand" yet justified anger, so it shouldn't come to any surprise that women in this movie were unable to express themselves in a similar fashion. They're just *angry,* everyone, nothing to see or take note of here! Women and their emotions, am I right?

Perhaps there's some validity in their emotions, and perhaps that's something that is needed to really start a pushback against a male-dominated society. Lindy West suggests in a chapter her memoir *The Witches Are Coming* titled "Anger is a Weapon" that anger is a negative trait associated with feminism, yet urges her audience to weaponize anger as a means of being a feminist. She makes a remark that sounds awfully similar to the predicament Daphne finds herself in with Fred: "When a woman gets angry, the typical response is: She didn't understand what happened. She misunderstood." Yet by West's definition, "feminism is the collective manifestation of female anger."[8] To have Daphne be unable to express her frustration with Fred and explain her feelings towards the comments she received from the snarky news reporter is patriarchy putting her own feelings on the back burner and moving along with the story. To glorify this film for its cinematic beauty of CGI-animated great danes and nostalgia of its animated forefather is to uphold this sentiment that women cannot express "negative" emotions like frustration and fury. Beyond the media, there is a collective anger of all women from decades of mistreatment, and despite the lack of conclusion this movie provides to this subject, it brings forward an opportunity to present women as fully-fleshed, well-rounded individuals who can and *will* express a range of emotions.

Newer iterations of the *Scooby-Doo* franchise in visual media have included different races and sexualities in full display (like Mindy Kaling's television flop, but

6 Don Caldwell, "Big Red," *Know Your Meme*, December 5, 2014, https://knowyourmeme.com/memes/people/big-red.

7 *Scooby-Doo 2: Monsters Unleashed*.

8 Lindy West, *The Witches Are Coming* (Lebanon, IN: Hachette Books, 2019), 208.

that's not our focus here), which shines a light on this movie's lack of diversity. Unfortunately, feminism is not safe from whitewashing as bell hooks' explores "white power feminism" in her book *feminism is for everybody*. She argues that this specific type of feminism is generally more accepted by society and media as it focuses on reforming the patriarchy to allow white women into positions rather than enacting change to allow all minorities, women or otherwise, to obtain the same opportunities (hooks)[9]. It's worth noting that the majority of people in the movie, save for Rubben Studdard at the Faux Ghost bar and Ned the news cameraman, are white. Studdard and the musicians are background characters who contribute little to nothing to the storyline of the movie, and Ned is surprisingly thrusted into the spotlight at the end when the gang reveal that he and Heather were the true villains that are arrested. Ned had less screen time than the 80s jive band at the bar, and he's *somehow* one of the two masterminds behind the movie's entire plot? When the only prominent inclusion of people of ethnicities that are anything besides white or caucasian are in a negative light, it creates a desire for people to not be like Ned and to not associate with people like Ned. The message of equality and empowerment for all can only go so far when it's exclusive to the dominant group, leaving much to be desired from a movie that seemed to have such a vast influence on pop culture and media.

Let's take a second to take a collective breath and address something that's been echoed by critics and viewers alike about this theatrical iteration: this movie was progressive for its time. One can pull out the argument that the original *Scooby-Doo: Where Are You?* television series from the 1960s was created in response to political turmoil at the time, providing a silly child-friendly alternative to viewing Vietnam war news coverage, the Cuban Missile Crisis two days in, or the loss of life that came as a result of the civil rights movement. As the early 2000s was home to third wave feminism through pushing for social equality and expanding civil rights for all, one can draw the line between the past and the present in terms of the media's overall goal: provide relief to current issues[10]. One can also draw from the head writer of this 2004 movie, James Gunn, and the numerous comments he's made on social media sites in recent years clarifying the original storyline that never made it into the final cut. Gunn clarified in a series of tweets on Twitter that he had attempted to make Velma "explicitly gay" before the studio muddled down her character to being completely nothing in the 2002 movie and given a boyfriend in the next installment[11]. At the very least, this movie in retrospect was confirmed to have tried something different and unheard of for its time, so it's worth acknowledging this effort.

---

9 bell hooks, *Feminism Is for Everybody* (Oxfordshire, England: Routledge, 2015).

10 Kendall Trammel, "Scooby-Doo wasn't just another cartoon. It was a reaction to the political turmoil at the time," *CNN,* September 13, 2019, https://www.cnn.com/2019/09/13/entertainment/scooby-doo-50th-anniversary-history-trnd/index.html.

11 "Filmmaker James Gunn wanted 'Scooby-Doo' character Velma to be 'explicitly gay'," *CNN*, July 15, 2022, https://www.cnn.com/2020/07/15/entertainment/james-gunn-scooby-doo-velma-gay-trnd/index.html.

Astute observations are being made here, but my only comment is that this argument does not hold up… at all. Let's take this argument into the world of literature by contrasting the works of Mary Shelley and Charlotte Bronte. Shelley's most famous piece, *Frankenstein*, portrays women characters like Elizabeth, Frankenstein's fiance, as submissive creatures who are seen as possessions. As Frankenstein puts it, "[I] looked upon Elizabeth as mine – mine to protect, love, and cherish."[12] In contrast, Bronte's novel *Jane Eyre* follows the named main character as she works to gain control of her life, her destiny, and overcome societal obstacles that stand in her way. Over the course of the novel Jane Eyre learns to balance her taught submissive nature with freedom and expression, and this is all brought together neatly through the balancing of her tray of candles and water to her beloved Rochester in the closing chapters of the novel.[13] Both of these authors are Romantic writers who wrote in the widely popular bildungsroman format and published their respective works in 1818 and 1847, but the misogyny that Shelley writes does not define the capability of growth in women characters that Bronte writes. One piece of media does not define another from the same time period, just as *Scooby-Doo 2* does not define other films made in the 2000s. Not only this, but the "product of its time" argument implies a continuous progression and betterment of society. By suggesting that media in the past was made by those who were less educated, less culturally or socially aware and overall less *than* compared to current day society, we are suggesting that history, that *feminism*, moves in a linear fashion where the future always equates to positive progress. If we, the people of modern day, are truly smarter than those who lived before, then nothing from the past really matters and we are currently the best versions of ourselves. All of this seems a bit backwards, right?

The hit 2000s film *Scooby-Doo 2: Monsters Unleashed* engages in themes of pop culture and feminism through the lenses of the "male gaze," visual pleasure theory, anger in women, and white power feminism. By using these ideas to reflect on the movie, it is clear that several aspects of the film perpetuate negative and harmful ideas that align with the pre-existing patriarchy. The film ultimately fails to portray women and other minorities in a thoroughly positive light, from being eye candy to a lack of personal authority to white-washed casting. The problematic overt and subtle messaging tinge this cult classic and should not be replicated in future iterations in the theatrical space as it is not simply "a product of its time," but it's not just on the media to make these changes. Well-educated audiences need to separate the patriarchal ideas and arguments from the content and novelty of the beloved franchises like the Mystery Inc. gang to enjoy the timeless nature of unique, one-of-a-kind cinematic cult classics. Whether future iterations will fill the holes left behind in its 2004 predecessor is another mystery the gang will have to solve.

12 Mary Shelley, *Frankenstein* (Mineola, NY: Dover Publications, 1994), 18.
13 Charlotte Bronte, *Jane Eyre* (New York City, NY: Penguin Group, 2008), 440.

[Biographies]

Authors' Biographies

Tabitha Andrews '24

"Resilience and Resistance"

Tabitha is a Senior from St. Louis, Missouri. She is currently studying History and Sociology-Anthropology. Tabitha's senior project was done in the hopes to bring light to a story not often told in our education system: The experiences of Jews in Italy. She submitted to Inter-Text to better share that story. Tabitha has a deep love for History and is currently employed as a Field Archaeologist in Collinsville, Illinois. In her free time, she enjoys painting, playing pool, hanging out with friends, reading, writing, and hiking. Tabitha also volunteers regularly at Cahokia Mounds as a tour guide.

Anna Blazkova '25

"Urban Megaprojects"

Anna is a Junior from Jablonec nad Nisou, Czech Republic. They are currently studying Communication and Area Studies. Anna wanted to showcase their work on a topic that consumed five months of their life. They are a programming director for WMXM. In their free time, Anna enjoys film photography, hiking, discovering new music, long walks in the middle of the night, and knitting.

Astrid Castro '26

"Korean Emissions Trading Schemes"

Astrid is a Sophomore from El Salvador. She is currently studying Economics. Astrid submitted her article to Inter-Text because she believes in fostering dialogue and exploration at the intersection of environmental economics and social sciences. Astrid is eager to contribute to scholarly discourse while sharing insights gained from her dedicated research efforts. She enjoys cultural nights, learning languages, and spending time with friends. Her involvement in *Collage Magazine* and UNICEF at Lake Forest College reflects these passions, providing opportunities to celebrate diversity, engage in language learning, and contribute to meaningful global initiatives.

Riley Groark '24

"Renaissance Women"

Riley is a Senior from Hickory Hills, Illinois. She is currently studying History. Riley thought that it was a really wonderful opportunity to have her work published, especially for a paper that she was proud of and enjoyed writing. She is a part of the executive board of the Gaming Club on campus and is involved with the archaeology projects and classes on campus.

Kathia Perez-Enriquez '24

"Plyler V. Doe"

Kathia is a Senior from Waukegan, Illinois. She is currently studying Sociology-Anthropology and History. She was encouraged by Dr. Cristina Groeger to submit some of her works from previous courses. As an undocumented student herself, she also wanted to submit her work to shed light on the experiences many undocumented students in higher education face today. Kathia is currently completing an internship with the History Center of Lake Forest - Lake Bluff where she has been completing archival research for their upcoming Modern in the Midcentury exhibit. She is interested in archival studies and cultural heritage collections. Kathia plans on pursuing a masters in Library and Information Sciences at the University of Illinois Urbana-Champaign this upcoming fall.

Davis Rowe '25

"It's Not Selfish To Be Happy"

Davis is a Junior. He is majoring in History and Philosophy. Davis submitted a piece because he had the power to submit to *Inter-Text*. He has thrown himself headfirst into his two majors, spending much of his time trying to get as much out of his classes as they can. But outside of that, Davis helps run the philosophy club, and he is on the exec board of the WMXM radio station. He plays in two separate bands on campus.

Muhammad Sheikh '25

"Israeli Displacement Policies"

Muhammad is a Junior from Skokie, Illinois. He is currently studying Neuroscience. Muhammad believes it's crucial to understand the suffering occurring globally and the context in which it unfolds, yet these aspects are unfortunately ignored by mainstream media. His ultimate goal was to raise awareness of the issues Western media tends to ignore so that he can encourage informed action and support for those in need. As a Muslim, the
Middle East has a massive place in his heart. It is the birthplace of Islam that he has come to love after visiting many times. It is heartbreaking that so many

of their Muslim brothers and sisters are dying there. Having said that, the multilayered politics in that region certainly bears relevance to the humanitarian catastrophes happening, and so exploring those is something Muhammad has a passion for. He also volunteers with non-profit organizations.

Andrés Fuentes Teba '24

"Blue Justice"

Andrés is a Senior from Madrid, Spain. He is currently studying Environmental Studies and International Relations. Andrés wanted to prove to himself that he doesn't write that badly in his second language. He enjoys anything outdoors, music (he plays violin in the Orchestra), soccer, and he loves to get involved in any event that takes place on campus.

Tobi Tontic '25

"A G.U.N. To Their Heads"

Tobi is a Junior from Grayslake, Illinois. He is currently studying Communications. Tobi hopes to expand readers' perspectives on which aspects of their lives are worthy of academic attention. He is a gamer, digital art collector, and occasional Tumblrino. Tobi hosts an interview show on WMXM that's all about your interests, your projects, and your ideas (so shoot him an email if you've got something you're dying to talk about).

Georgia Tsakos '24

"Historiography Analysis"

Georgia is a Senior from Gurnee, Illinois. She is currently studying Politics and History. Georgia wanted to submit a piece of work she felt proud of during her undergraduate experience. She has seen many students' work within the Journal and was fond of the wide variety of topics that it has. Being a history major, students in the department produce a lot of writing samples that are nonetheless rewarding. There is no better way to expand upon that to get a sample published in the Inter-text Journal. Georgia is president of the Clio Historical Society and Founder of the Hellenic Student Association. Outside of campus, she works for a non-profit organization that awards $250,000 annually in scholarship to students of Hellenic descent and she also serves as a Scholarship Chair. Georgia also enjoys learning history about the Ottoman and Byzantine Empire, as well as studying Modern Greek History.

Nicholas Charles Urich '24

"The King of Tars"

Nicholas is a Senior from Shawnee, Kansas. He is currently studying Religion and Philosophy. Nicholas submitted a piece to *Inter-Text* because he figured he had some publishable papers and little reason not to. He also gets to snootily say to people, "Ah, yes? Me? Oh I'm a published historian. Now, shoo, peasant! Leave me to my studies." Nicholas reads lots of philosophy; talks about it; thinks about it. Currently, he's thinking alot about the nature of faith and the relation of subjectivity to Authority and Community, and also what it means for something to be ineffable. He also has a persistent interest in virtue ethics, skepticism, and the relation of religion, philosophy, and history. He runs the Philosophy Club. He writes poetry, plays piano, but mainly loves his girlfriend, Audrey, and his pals.

Editors' Biographies

Kieran Artley '25

Kieran is a Junior from Brookfield, Wisconsin. He is currently studying History and Economics. Kieran joined *Inter-Text* because of their interest in editing and the badgering from Professor Rudi Batzell and Aaron Brand. He spends his free time fencing, playing various video games, visiting the gaming club, and engaging with a card game related to spells and collecting.

Em Allen '25

Em is a Junior from Orem, Utah. They are currently studying Art History and Museum Studies. Em was published in *Inter-Text* last year and was invited back as an editor this year, and finds it an exciting way to gain valuable experience and develop useful skills. Outside of *Inter-Text*, Em is interested in museum curation, currently working at the Swedish American Museum in Andersonville. Em is also interested in queer studies and issues of representation.

Aaron Brand '24

Aaron is a Senior from Cool, California. He is currently studying History and Philosophy. Aaron has been published in *Inter-Text* multiple times and has worked on the editing team in prior years. He joined the journal to improve his experience in editing. Aaron is interested in Lefty causes and the advancement of historical understanding.

Drew Carlson '26

Drew is a Sophomore from Gilbert, Arizona. They are currently studying Secondary Education and History while getting a minor in Politics. They joined *Inter-Text* because an email told them to. Outside of the journal, they spend their days listening to music and DnD podcasts, and reading about political conspiracies.

Sebastian Ellis '26

Sebastian is a Sophomore from Hawthorn Woods, Illinois. He is currently studying History and Art History and pursuing a minor in Museum Studies. This is Sebastian's first year with the journal, and he joined because he enjoys writing and wants to improve his personal writing skills. Outside *Inter-Text*, Sebastian is an avid amateur historian and antique dealer, scouring the Chicagoland area for lost treasures.

Sawyer Kuzma '26

Sawyer is a Sophomore from LaSalle, Illinois. They are majoring in Environmental Studies and Sociology & Anthropology. They joined *Inter-Text* to gain experience working on an academic journal and to learn more about the diversity of humanities research at the College. Outside of the journal, Sawyer is a tutor at the Writing Center and a member of the Lake Forest College Concert Band.

Isaiah Moonlight '25

Moonlight is a Junior from Albuquerque, New Mexico. He is currently studying Biology and Philosophy. He joined *Inter-Text* to engage with the social sciences and humanities from an editorial perspective, learn new skills, join a wonderful community, and help to showcase the exceptional works of Lake Forest students. He is interested in the human endeavor of knowledge. He is a member of Nu Rho Psi, Philosophy club, Student Ambassadors, among others.

Michelle Paddon-Jones '25

Michelle is a Junior from St. Charles, Illinois. She is currently studying International Relations and Sociology & Anthropology and a minor in History. This is her first year as an editor with the journal after gaining an interest in the process. Beyond *Inter-Text*, Michelle is a member of the Women's Swim and Dive Team at the College.

Claire Pardus '23

Claire is a recent Alumni from Gurnee, Illinois. During her time at the college, she studied English with a writing emphasis and a minor in Communication. Claire continued working with the journal past graduation to stay involved with Lake Forest College's social sciences and explore opportunities to get personal academic work published. Currently, Claire works full-time as a Marketing Coordinator, creating social media content for email marketing, cultivating influencer relationships, and event management. In her spare time, Claire enjoys writing fiction and OP-Ed pieces and spending time with her two cats.

Julieta Rodarte '26

Juli is a Junior from Vernon Hills, Illinois. They are currently studying History and Elementary Education. They joined *Inter-Text* because Professor Batzell made it sound interesting, and they wanted to join a collaborative group on campus that involved more academic-related work. They like writing fictional stories, listening to music chronically, reading and watching videos about niche historical topics, and drawing.

M. Stock ‘25

M. is a Junior from Wellesley, Massachusetts. They are currently studying History. M. joined their friends working with the journal and wanted to be more involved. Outside of the journal, M. is a member of the Clio Society, art club, gaming club, and Hillel. In their spare time, they enjoy drawing and painting, playing video games, and reading.

Acknowledgements

Inter-Text would not be possible without generous support from the following:

Major Funding

The Christopher C. Mojekwu Fund for Intercultural Understanding
Lake Forest College Student Government

Contributions from Humanities and Social Science Departments

Environmental Studies
History
Economics
Sociology and Anthropology
Philosophy
English

The Editors offer a special thank you to Leslie Taylor, from Visual Communications, who has provided amazing, generous support in arranging and coordinating the printing of the journal.